

Document downloaded from:

<http://hdl.handle.net/10251/199468>

This paper must be cited as:

Aleixandre Tudo, J.; Castelló-Cogollos, L.; Aleixandre Benavent, JL.; Aleixandre-Benavent, R. (2021). Trends in funding research and international collaboration on greenhouse gas emissions: A bibliometric approach. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*. 28(25):32330-32346. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-12776-2>



The final publication is available at

<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-12776-2>

Copyright Springer-Verlag

Additional Information

1 **Trends in funding research and international collaboration on greenhouse**
2 **gas emissions: a bibliometric approach**

3
4
5 José Luis Aleixandre-Tudó^{1#}, Lourdes Castelló-Cogollos^{2,4#}, José Luis
6 Aleixandre^{3,*}, Rafael Aleixandre-Benavent ^{4,5}
7

8 ¹ Department of Viticulture and Enology. Stellenbosch University, South Africa

9 ² Departamento de Sociología y Antropología Social. Universitat de València

10 ³ Instituto de Ingeniería de Alimentos para el Desarrollo (IIAD). Universitat
11 Politècnica de València, Spain.

12 ⁴ UISYS, Joint Research Unit, Universitat de València-CSIC, Spain.

13 ⁵ Ingenio (CSIC-Universitat Politècnica de València). Spain.

14
15
16 # These authors contributed equally
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

26 Corresponding author: José Luis Aleixandre (e-mail: jaleixan@tal.upv.es)
27

28 **Abstract**

29

30 The Web of Science Core Collection platform was used to withdraw the papers
31 included in this study. The studied period comprised from inception till 2018.
32 Trends in research, journals of publication, subject areas of research, keywords
33 most frequently used, countries of publication, international collaboration and
34 trends of funding research was also analysed. A total of 3,902 articles were
35 published, most of them (52.5%) during the five-year period 2014-2018. The
36 area with the highest number of papers was Environmental Sciences (41%),
37 followed by Energy Fuels (16.6%) and Engineering Environmental (15.7%).
38 "Nitrous oxide emissions" was the most frequent word, followed by "Carbon
39 dioxide emissions" and "Methane emissions". Other words that stood out were
40 "Life cycle assessment", "Climate change" and "Environmental impacts". United
41 States was the country with the highest productivity (27.9%), followed by China
42 (12.8%), and United Kingdom (9.6%). There was a concentration of research in
43 recent years, as more than 80% of the papers were published in the last 10
44 years. The journals that published the largest number of publications were
45 devoted mainly to environmental studies (sciences and engineering),
46 sustainable and green science and technology, energy and fuels, economics,
47 and agriculture. Half of the works were published in Europe, and the other half
48 between North America and Asia. Two thirds of the works (67%) were financed
49 compared to a third that were not financed. The percentage of funded works
50 has been increasing over the last decade, which is seen as an indication of the
51 importance of GHGE.

52

53 **Key words:** Greenhouse gas emissions; international collaboration; funded
54 research; impact of research.

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62 Introduction

63

64 Since the beginning of the Industrial Revolution (in 1750) human activity has
65 caused a 45% increase in atmospheric CO₂ concentration from 280 ppm to 400
66 ppm in 2016. Anthropogenic CO₂ emissions (produced by human activities)
67 come from combustion of fossils, mainly coal, oil and natural gas, in addition to
68 deforestation, and animal production.

69

70 Greenhouse gases (GHGs) are atmosphere components with ability to absorb
71 solar as well as re-emitted radiation (Lacis et al. 2010). GHG emissions are
72 leading to global warming, increase of the sea levels (Meehl et al. 2005; Raper
73 and Braithwaite 2006), extreme weather conditions and modification of
74 agricultural patterns (Patz et al. 2014). The definition of greenhouse gases
75 (GHGs) includes CO₂, methane, nitrous oxide and fluoride gasses that are
76 generated and emitted during the different stages of the goods production
77 chains. These emissions are added together with GHGs emissions that take
78 place during the uptake of the activities (Hertwich and Peters 2009). Burning of
79 fossil fuels, solid waste degradation, biological respiration and agricultural soil,
80 in this order, are the main sources of GHG emissions (McKain et al. 2012; Yang
81 et al. 2015).

82

83 It has been estimated that if greenhouse gas emissions continue at the current
84 rate, the terrestrial surface temperature could exceed the 2°C limit of global
85 warming with potentially damaging effects on ecosystems and biodiversity,
86 potentially endangering the subsistence of the people on the planet (IPCC,
87 2014). For these reasons, the study of GHGs has become a hot topic of global
88 research.

89

90 As human activities continue to cause an increase in GHG emissions, the
91 temperature of the earth surface is expected to rise, causing the global climates
92 to change. More and more countries/territories have joined the study of GHGs,
93 but a clear gap between developing and developed countries on GHG research
94 was observed (Yang et al. 2013). However, in the past few years many
95 developing countries started to be more and more involved in GHG research.

96 Furthermore, increased scientific activity was observed from these countries on
97 the following topics: reduction of GHG emission, carbon sequestration,
98 biotechnology and energy applications (van Vuuren et al. 2009; Figueroa et al.
99 2008; Englade and Jin 2006).

100

101 The control of the GHGE is part of the Sustainable Development Goal 13
102 established by the United Nations in 2015, entitled "Take urgent action to
103 combat climate change and its impacts" (The Paris Agreement, 2015). As early
104 as 1992, the Earth Summit of Rio de Janeiro established a framework of action
105 aimed at stabilizing atmospheric concentrations of greenhouse gases (GHGs)
106 to avoid "dangerous anthropogenic interference with the climate system".
107 Member states expressed their concern about the continued increase in GHGs
108 and the vulnerability of all countries to the adverse effects of climate change, as
109 well as the need for enhanced international collaboration to increase
110 effectiveness in combating climate change (IPCC, 2014). Climate change is
111 affecting the entire planet, and the levels of CO₂ and other greenhouse gases
112 in the atmosphere have increased dramatically. The Paris Agreement (2015)
113 aimed to strengthen the global response to the threat of climate change by
114 keeping the global temperature increase during this century below 2°C. In
115 addition, climate change affects the poorest in developing countries. However,
116 developed countries are responsible for 85% of global warming. In contrast, 140
117 developing countries only generate 10% of the planet's warming. There is great
118 inequity from the point of view of those who are contributing the most to the
119 problem and those who suffer the most from the consequences (IPCC 2014).

120

121 An increase in the efforts made at institutional level in terms of carbon
122 management and therefore GHG emission reduction (including carbon
123 accounting) has been noticed in the scientific literature over the past years.
124 Institutions such as private companies (Penela et al. 2009; Lee 2011) and
125 universities (Parsons 2009) or entire regional and national economic and public
126 sectors such as health care (Chung and Meltzer 2009), fisheries (Iribarren et al.
127 2010) or tourism (Dwyer et al. 2010) have been intensely investigated. A
128 number of methodological options have been proposed, providing a wide
129 variety of specific approaches towards carbon management.

130

131 The analysis of research trends through bibliometric studies provides valuable
132 information of the scientific research and its development over time for a
133 particular field of study. The aim of this study was to analyse the scientific
134 productivity and impact of the research on GHG emissions, as well as the
135 influence of funding on global research through bibliometric analysis of articles
136 included in the Web of Science Core Collection (WoS) database. The joint
137 analysis of productivity, collaboration, scientific impact of research and funding
138 provides a global and integrated view of the research applying to this particular
139 field.

140

141 2. Methods

142

143 The analyzed articles were withdrawn from the Web of Science Core Collection
144 (Clarivate Analytics) platform. For more accurate results, the terms
145 "Greenhouse gas emissions" OR "Green house gas emissions" OR "GHG"
146 were used in the search, established in the "title" field. The studied period
147 comprised from inception till 2018. Reading the titles and abstracts of the
148 retrieved papers testified that all of them were relevant. Only research papers
149 and reviews were analysed.

150

151 The records obtained were processed using an Access (Microsoft) relational
152 database (Redmont, Washington, USA). The journals in which the articles were
153 published, the thematic categories of the journals, the keywords most frequently
154 associated with these topics, countries of publication of the journals and most
155 cited articles were identified. Trends of funding research were also analyzed,
156 information that WoS offers in indexed registers from 2008 (Paul-Hus et al.
157 2016).

158

159 In addition, the number of co-occurrences between countries was quantified
160 through the social networks analysis (SNA), from which indicators of centrality
161 and prestige in the network have been extracted. These indicators identify the
162 countries in the network with the highest "degree" (i.e., the countries that have
163 more collaborations with other countries and are therefore considered more

164 active), with the highest “closeness” (i.e., which countries have a shorter path
165 when establishing contacts with other countries and account for the speed of
166 contact) and finally the “betweenness” (which refers to which countries act as a
167 bridge with other countries and therefore indicate their possibility to have a
168 control over the contacts). The graphical representation of the networks of
169 collaboration between countries was performed with Pajek software (Batagelj
170 and Mrvar 2002). The VOSViewer software (Leiden, The Netherlands) was
171 used to build the global collaboration maps. In these maps, the thickness of the
172 lines connecting the countries and the number of articles published in
173 collaboration is proportional. Impact factor data of the journals corresponds to
174 the 2017 edition of the Journal Citation Reports (JCR). However, data on
175 citations corresponds to the 12 of February 2019.

176

177 **3. Results**

178

179 *3. 1. General data*

180

181 During the period under review, 3,902 articles were published. Fig. 1 shows the
182 evolution of the articles by five-year periods. As can be seen, most of the
183 papers (2,048; 52.5%) were published during 2014-2018, and 1,207 (30.9%)
184 during the five-year period 2009-2013, so that almost all the papers (3,255;
185 83.4%) were published in the decade 2009-2018.

186

187 *3. 2. Journals of publication*

188

189 The 18th most prolific journals, along with the number of citations, 5 years'
190 impact factor, subject areas, countries and funding are presented in Table 1.
191 The journal that published the largest number of papers was the *Journal of*
192 *Cleaner Production* (603), followed by *Energy Policy* (536) and, *Agriculture*
193 *Ecosystems & Environment* (228) and *Environmental Science Technology*
194 (222), with considerably fewer papers. The ranking by number of citations was
195 headed by *Energy Policy* (15,604), followed by *Agriculture Ecosystems &*
196 *Environment* (8,616), *Environmental Science Technology* (8,476) and *Journal of*
197 *Cleaner Production* (8,445). However, the average citations per paper ranking

198 was led by *Climatic Change* (42.15). The three journals with the highest 5-years
199 impact factor were *Renewable & Sustainable Energy Reviews* (10.093), *Applied*
200 *Energy* (7.888) and *Journal of Cleaner Production* (6.352). The list of journals
201 included in Table 1 were included in the first quartiles of their respective subject
202 areas, except for the journal *Sustainability*, which was included in three subject
203 areas in the third quartile. With respect to the most prolific countries in these
204 journals, the United States was the most productive country in 10 of the journals
205 included in the table, followed by China with 8 and Germany with one. Other
206 countries that stand out were France, The Netherlands, Finland, Japan,
207 Canada, Australia, United Kingdom, Switzerland, South Korea, Austria, Sri
208 Lanka, India and Spain. The journals in which the greatest number of funded
209 works were published were *Science of the Total Environment* (64; 82.1%),
210 followed by *Environmental Science Technology* (92; 41.4%) and *Environmental*
211 *Research Letters* (44; 40%), and the journals in which the fewest funded papers
212 were published were *Energy Conversion and Management* (6; 93.5%), followed
213 by *Ecological Economics* (92.2%) and *Energy Policy* (49; 90.9%).

214

215 3.3. Subject content and topics

216

217 Table 2 shows the thematic areas the journals belong to. The area with the
218 highest number of papers was Environmental Sciences (1,629; 41%), followed
219 by Energy Fuels (647; 16.6%) and Engineering Environmental (614; 15.7%).
220 The number and percentage of works funded was almost three quarters in the
221 areas of Agronomy (103; 72%) and Ecology (167; 71.7%) and somewhat less in
222 Soil Science (144; 69.9%). Conversely, the areas whose work was least funded
223 were Economics (129; 75%), Environmental Studies (236; 56.9%) and
224 Thermodynamics (72; 56.7%).

225

226 Most frequent key words included in the analysed papers and grouped
227 according to continents can be seen in Table 3. "Nitrous oxide emissions" was
228 the most frequent word in the works published in all continents. The second
229 place was for "Carbon dioxide emissions" in Europe, North America and South
230 America, while in Africa, Asia and Oceania it was "Methane emissions". Other
231 words that stood out with a frequency greater than 500 appearances were "Life

232 cycle assessment", "Climate change" and "Environmental impacts". Fig. 2
233 shows a world map with the clouds containing the most frequent words in each
234 continent.

235

236 3. 4. *Research by countries*

237

238 Twelve countries published more than 100 papers (Table 4). United States was
239 the most productive country (n=1,076; 27.9%), followed by China (n=492;
240 12.8%), United Kingdom (n=368; 9.6%), Canada (n=343; 8. 9%) and Australia
241 (n=286; 7.4%). By citations, United States was the leading country (n=29,167;
242 35.9%), followed by United Kingdom (n=11,713; 14.4%) and Canada (8615;
243 10.6%), occupying China the fourth position (n=8,224; 10.1%). Taking into
244 account the ratio citations per paper, the ranking was headed by Austria
245 (C/A=48.3), followed by Switzerland (C/A=39.2), Ireland (C/A=36.1) and Norway
246 (C/A=35.6). Fig. 3 shows the world map of countries' productivity. Again it
247 highlights Canada, United States and Brazil in America; United Kingdom,
248 Germany, The Netherlands, Spain, Sweden and France in Europe; China and
249 Japan in Asia and Australia in Oceania. Fig. 4 shows a graphical evolution of
250 papers and citations by continents according to 5-years' periods.

251

252 3.5. *International collaboration*

253

254 United States was the country that has published more works in collaboration
255 with other countries (Fig. 5). The country with the largest number of
256 collaborative papers was China (78 papers), followed by United Kingdom (58),
257 Canada (55), Australia (29), The Netherlands (29), Japan (29) and Germany
258 (26). China also collaborated intensively with Canada (34), United Kingdom (34)
259 and Australia (26). Moreover a more marked triangle of collaboration between
260 the United States, China and the United Kingdom can be seen in the
261 collaboration network (Fig. 6). At European level, United Kingdom is the country
262 with more intense, followed by Germany. Considering the centrality indicators,
263 the most active countries with the highest degree of centrality and closeness in
264 the network are United States (degree =52, closeness = 0.861) and United
265 Kingdom (degree = 40, closeness = 0.738). However, the countries that bridge

266 the gap with other countries (betweenness) are Australia (betweenness =
267 6,656) and Switzerland (betweenness = 3,584) (Table 5).

268

269 3.6. Funded research

270

271 The percentage of works funded during de 2009-2018 decade can be seen in
272 Table 6. Two thirds of the works (67%) were financed compared to a third that
273 was not financed (33%). This percentage increased from 46.3% in 2009 to
274 71.6% in 2018. 2017 was the year with the highest percentage of funded work
275 (76%). Trends in funded and unfunded research can be seen graphically in Fig.
276 6, as well as the evolution of citations received.

277

278 More than half of the works were published in Europe (n=2,019; 52.4%), just
279 over a third in North America (n=1,468; 38.1%) and almost a third in Asia
280 (n=1,165; 30.3%) (Table 7). The other continents published percentages
281 ranging from 9% in Oceania, 4.5% in South America and 2.8% in Africa. The
282 number of citations received was almost similar between Europe and North
283 America, with a small advantage for Europe (45.3% versus 44.7%). However,
284 the ratios citations/article were higher in North American works (24.7) than in
285 the other continents, where it was around 18 citations per article, except in Asia,
286 that was 14.6. The production of BRIC countries (Brazil, Russia, India, China
287 and South Africa) was of 767 papers (19.7% of the total), while global citations
288 of these countries represented 11%.

289

290 The percentage of works funded was highest in Asia (61.7%) and South
291 America (61%), followed by North America and Oceania with a similar
292 percentage close to 56%. Europe was the continent with the lowest percentage
293 of funded works (43.5%).

294

295 The citations per paper ratio was somewhat higher in funded papers than in
296 non-funded papers (19.9 versus 18.1). The ratio of citations per paper was
297 higher than 20 points in North America, Europe, Oceania and Africa. In non-
298 funded work, the ratio was higher in North America (29.3) and South America
299 (23).

300

301 3.7. Most cited papers

302

303 Table 8 shows the 25 most cited papers. The paper with the highest number of
304 citations was published in *Science* in 2008 and received 2.414 citations, with an
305 average of 241 citations per year. The paper was entitled “Use of US croplands
306 for biofuels increases greenhouse gases through emissions from land-use
307 change” and was published by US researchers from several institutions. No
308 information about possible funding was found for this paper. The second most
309 cited paper entitled “Greenhouse-gas emission targets for limiting global
310 warming to 2 degrees C” was published in 2009 in *Nature*. This paper received
311 1.063 citations, 118 per year, and was published by a team of researchers from
312 Germany, Switzerland and United Kingdom. In the paper, the authors
313 acknowledge the German Ministry of Environment for financial support, the
314 German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD) and The Natural Environment
315 Research Council as the UK's leading public funder of environmental science.
316 Two papers with about 750 citations followed, one signed by US researchers
317 and published in *Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems* and the next signed by
318 Austrian researchers and published in *Climatic Change*. As can be seen in the
319 table, some papers obtain an average of annual citations that would place them
320 in different positions than they occupy according to the total number of citations
321 received. Only one third of the published works have received funding.

322

323 4. Concluding remarks

324

325 This work contributes to the development of scientific knowledge about GHGE
326 because it identifies important characteristics of research in this field integrating
327 bibliometric and social network analysis. It has allowed for the identification of
328 the relevant characteristics of the world-wide research on GHGE, among them,
329 the evolution of the research on the subject, the journals of publication and its
330 impact, the geographical distribution, the main topics of research and the
331 assigned funding. The data was sourced from the Web of Science Core
332 Collection database, usually chosen as preferential in this type of studies as it
333 includes the journals with the greatest international impact (Mongeon 2016;

334 Martin-Martin et al. 2018; Chavarro et al. 2018). The dissemination of this kind
335 of information concerning GHGE may contribute to stimulate an advanced level
336 of collaboration within the researchers and to generate a favourable
337 atmosphere for discussion. On the other hand, these discussions would be of
338 noteworthy relevance and would act as a first step to supervise forthcoming
339 advances in this important field (Husain and Mushtaq 2015).

340

341 One of the most striking results of the study is the growing number of articles
342 published and their concentration in recent years, as more than 80% were
343 published in the last decade. This growth appears to be in line with the great
344 interest and concerns observed worldwide about GHGE and a big body of
345 research to achieve its reduction was observed. The growth of publications in
346 recent years has also occurred in other areas and in other topics considered
347 trending topics because of their social or economic relevance at a global level.
348 This was the case for: climate change (Haunnschild et al. 2016; Aleixandre et
349 al. 2017), biotechnology (Dalpe 2002), global warming (Aleixandre-Tudo et al.
350 2019), renewable energies (Hache and Palle 2019; Aleixandre-Tudo et al.
351 2019), forest ecology (Song and Zhao 2013) or water use efficiency (Aznar-
352 Sanchez et al. 2018), among others.

353

354 As noted, the most prolific journals were devoted mainly to several scientific
355 areas, including environmental studies (sciences and engineering), green and
356 sustainable science and technology, energy and fuels, economics, agriculture
357 and ecology. These are journals that tend to have a high impact factor which
358 places them in the top quartiles of the JCR thematic category rankings. The
359 diversity of the thematic categories found in the journals where the articles were
360 published contributes to an understanding of the complexity of the GHGE
361 problem.

362

363 Regarding the thematic categories in which the journals were classified, it is not
364 surprising that the areas related to the environment and fuels have been the
365 ones that monopolized a greater number of works, given the close relationship
366 that GHGE has with these areas. On the other hand, the thematic analysis that
367 was deduced from the keyword 'evaluation' revealed which were the gas

368 emissions to which a greater research effort was dedicated, as well as the
369 aspects related to these emissions. The main emissions were nitrous oxide,
370 carbon dioxide and methane, which correspond to the current emission figures
371 for these gases worldwide (United States Environmental Protection Agency
372 2019). Research on these emissions was linked to phenomena and aspects
373 such as life cycle assessment, climate change, environmental impact, global
374 warming, carbon footprint, land use change, management and mitigation.

375

376 As we have seen, half of the works were published in Europe, just over a third
377 in North America and almost a third in Asia, but the number of citations is
378 similar in Europe and North America, which means that publications from North
379 America have greater impact in terms of citations than the European ones. This
380 phenomenon, which has been called "citation advantage", could be due to the
381 bias of US publications in the WoS database (Gingras and Khelifaoui 2018), but
382 as suggested it could also be due to the consequences for the European Union
383 of the integration of new Eastern European countries whose publications have a
384 lower impact than those of Western Europe (Leydesdorff et al. 2014). With
385 regards to international collaboration, it is not surprising that United States, the
386 country that collaborates the most with other countries in the world, collaborates
387 above all with China, since these two countries produce the greatest emissions
388 of greenhouse gases, especially carbon dioxide (Boden et al. 2017).

389

390 The extent of funding for GHGE works can be considered high, as two thirds
391 have received it. In addition, the percentage of funded works has been
392 increasing over the last decade, which can be seen as an indication of the
393 importance of GHGE. Funding benefits most thematic areas almost equally. As
394 seen, the citations per paper ratio was somewhat higher in funded papers than
395 in non-funded papers. Although in our work this relationship has not stood out
396 strikingly, a direct relationship between funding and impact of the papers have
397 been reported in other studies (Jacob and Lefgren 2011; Goek et al. 2016; Yan
398 et al. 2018).

399

400 The topics specifically dealt with in the most frequently cited works make it
401 possible to find out which issues attract the most interest in research. As can be

402 seen, the most relevant topics were: the increase in greenhouse gases
403 produced by the change in the use of cultivated land (land use change) to
404 produce biofuels (Searchinger et al. 2008); greenhouse-gas emission targets
405 for limiting global warming (Meinshausen et al. 2009); Intergovernmental Panel
406 on Climate Change from the United Nations guidelines for national GHGE
407 inventory methodology (Mosier et al. 2009); Representative Concentration
408 Pathways (a set of pathways on GHG concentration and emissions designed to
409 support research on impact and potential policy responses to climate change
410 scenarios) (Riahi et al. 2011); GHGE from crop production systems (Snyder et
411 al. 2009); public health benefits of strategies to reduce GHGE such as urban
412 land transport, hybrid vehicles and food chain (Woodcock et al. 2009; Samaras
413 and Meisterling 2008); inventories and databases (Dodman 2009; Zhang et al.
414 2000); climate impacts of emissions (Shine et al. 2005) or global warming
415 (Fearnside 2000; Shine et al. 2005). The fact that six of the 25 papers were
416 published in high-impact multidisciplinary journals such as *Science*, *Nature* and
417 *Lancet* shows evidence of the current importance of greenhouse gas emissions.
418 Probably the authors of these papers chose these journals to try to
419 communicate their message to a wider audience than the more narrowly
420 focused specialized journals. In this way their findings potentially influence
421 scientists in multiple areas of research as the high citation rates of these
422 journals provide a potentially wider dissemination and greater visibility.

423

424 International cooperation involving technology transfer between rich and poor
425 countries and the provision of funds that contribute to sustainable development
426 is essential to enhance the reduction of GHGE. In parallel, there is a need to
427 increase investment in research on environmentally safe technologies and the
428 use of renewable energy, as well as basic, applied and experimental
429 agricultural research to help farmers and trade adapt to change. Appropriate
430 training of scientific and technical workforces in these technologies and the
431 renewal and modernization of equipment and facilities are also of vital
432 importance. In addition, there is a need to invest in public education to promote
433 efficient energy use in households, particularly renewable energy, and to use
434 public transportation. Independent global bodies such as the United Nations

435 can advise and help develop plans and policies to reduce GHGE to appropriate
436 levels.

437

438 **5. Limitations and future work**

439

440 This paper contains some limitations that must be considered during the
441 interpretation of the results. First of all, the papers were extracted from the Web
442 of Science platform and although it is possible that other databases such as
443 Scopus include some relevant work, it should be borne in mind that WoS is one
444 of the most important sources for the analysis of scientific literature and that it
445 indexes the world's highest quality journals. Second, WoS only includes funding
446 information that has been published in English. It is therefore possible that
447 articles published in languages other than English may not have collected this
448 information. However, most of the works indexed in WoS are in English.

449

450 Future work in this line should analyse the evolution of the indicators obtained
451 in this work in future periods and contrast them. On the other hand, it could
452 identify the groups that are at the forefront of research in this field and their
453 collaborative relationships on specific GHGE issues.

454

455 **References**

456

457 Aleixandre-Benavent R, Aleixandre-Tudó JL, Castelló-Cogollos L, Aleixandre JL
458 (2017) Trends in scientific research on climate change in agriculture and
459 forestry subject areas (2005-2014). *J Cleaner Prod* 147:406-418

460

461 Aleixandre-Tudó JL, Bolaños-Pizarro M, Aleixandre JL, Aleixandre-Benavent R
462 (2019) Current trends in scientific research on global warming: A bibliometric
463 analysis. *Int J Global Warming* 17:142-169

464

465 Aleixandre-Tudó JL, Castelló-Cogollos L, Aleixandre JL, Aleixandre-Benavent R
466 (2019) Renewable energies: Worldwide trends in research, funding and
467 international collaboration. *Renew Energ* 139:268-278

468

469 Aznar-Sanchez JA, Belmonte-Urena LJ, Velasco-Munoz JF, Manzano-
470 Agugliaro F (2018) Economic analysis of sustainable water use: A review of
471 worldwide research. *J Cleaner Prod* 198:1120-1132
472

473 Batagelj V, Mrvar A (2002) Analysis and visualization of large networks. *Lec*
474 *Notes Comput Sci* 2265:477e478.
475

476 Boden TA, Marland G, Andres RJ (2017) National CO2 Emissions from Fossil-
477 Fuel Burning, Cement Manufacture, and Gas Flaring: 1751-2014. Carbon
478 Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, U.S.
479 Department of Energy, doi 10.3334/CDIAC/00001_V2017
480

481 Chavarro D, Rafols I, Tang P (2018) To what extent is inclusion in the Web of
482 Science an indicator of journal 'quality'? *Res Evaluat* 27:106-118
483

484 Chung JW, Meltzer DO (2009) Estimate of the carbon footprint of the US Health
485 Care sector. *J Am Med Assoc* 302:1970-1972
486

487 Dalpe R (2002) Bibliometric analysis of biotechnology. *Scientometrics* 55:
488 189e213.
489

490 Dwyer L, Forsyth P, Spurr R, Hoque S (2010) Estimating the carbon footprint of
491 Australian tourism. *J Sustain Tour* 18:355-376
492

493 Dodman D (2009) Blaming cities for climate change? An analysis of urban
494 greenhouse gas emissions inventories. *Environ Urban* 21:185-201
495

496 Englade AJ, Jin G (2006) Application of biotechnology in waste management
497 for sustainable development: an overview. *Manage Environ Qual Int J* 17:467-
498 477
499

500 Fearnside PM (2000) Global Warming and Tropical Land-Use Change:
501 Greenhouse Gas Emissions from Biomass Burning, Decomposition and Soils in

502 Forest Conversion, Shifting Cultivation and Secondary Vegetation. Climatic
503 Change 46:115-118

504

505 Figueroa JD, Fout T, Plasynski S, Mellvried H, Srivastava RD (2008) Advances
506 in CO₂ capture technology – the US Department of Energy's Carbon
507 Sequestration Program. Int J Greenhouse Gas Control 2:9-20

508

509 Gingras Y, Khelifaoui M (2018) Assessing the effect of the United States'
510 "citation advantage" on other countries' scientific impact as measured in the
511 Web of Science (WoS) database. Scientometrics 114:517-532

512

513 Goek, A, Rigby J, Shapira P (2016) The impact of research funding on scientific
514 outputs: Evidence from six smaller European countries. J Asso Inf Sci Technol
515 67:715-730

516

517 Hache E, Palle A (2019) Renewable energy source integration into power
518 networks, research trends and policy implications: A bibliometric and research
519 actors survey analysis. Energy Policy 124:23-25

520

521 Haunnschild R, Bornmann L, Marx V (2016). Climate change research in view
522 of bibliometrics. PLoS One 11:1e19

523

524 Hertwich EG, Peters GP (2009) Carbon footprint of Nations: A global, trade-
525 linked analysis. Environ Sci Technol 43:6414-6420

526

527 Husain S, Mushtaq M (2015) Research assessment of climate change data: a
528 scientometric construct. Qualitative and Quantitative Methods in Libraries
529 Special Issue 183e194

530

531 IPCC (2014). Climate Change 2014: Impacts, adaptation, and vulnerability. Part
532 A: Global and Sectorial aspects. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge,
533 United Kingdom and New York, USA, pp 1-32

534

535 Iribarren D, Vázquez-Rowe I, Hospido A, Moreira MaT, Feijoo T (2010)
536 Estimation of the carbon footprint of the Galician fishing activity (NW Spain). *Sci*
537 *Total Environ* 408:5284-5294
538

539 Jacob BA, Lefgren L (2011) The impact of research grant funding on scientific
540 productivity. *J Public Econ* 95 (9-10):1168-1177
541

542 Lacis AA, Schmidt GA, Rind D, Ruedy RA (2010) Atmospheric CO₂: principal
543 control knob governing earth's temperature. *Science* 330:356-359
544

545 Lashof DA, Ahuja DR (1990) Relative contributions of greenhouse gas
546 emissions to global warming. *Nature* 344(6266):529-531
547

548 Lee KH (2011) Integrating carbon footprint into supply chain management: the
549 case of Hunday Motor Company in the automobile industry. *J Clean Prod* 19:
550 1216-1223
551

552 Leydesdorff L, Wagner C, Bornmann L (2014) The European Union, China, and
553 the United States in the top-1% and top-10% layers of most-frequently cited
554 publications: Competition and collaborations. *J Informetr* 8:606-617
555

556 Martin-Martin A, Orduna-Malea E, Lopez-Cozar E (2018) Coverage of highly-
557 cited documents in Google Scholar, Web of Science, and Scopus: a
558 multidisciplinary comparison. *Scientometrics* 116:2175-2188
559

560 Meehl GA, Washington WM, Collins WD, Arblaster JM, Hu A, Buja LE, Strand
561 WG, Teng H (2005) How much more global warming and sea level rise?.
562 *Science* 307:1769-1772
563

564 McKain K, Wofsy SC, Nehrkorn T, Eluszkiewicz J, Ehleringer JR, Stephen BB
565 (2012) Assessment of ground-based atmospheric observations for verification
566 of greenhouse gas emissions from an urban region. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*
567 109:8423-8428
568

569 Meinshausen M, Meinshausen N, Hare W, Raper SCB, Frieler K, Knutti R,
570 Frame DJ, Allen MR (2009) Greenhouse-gas emission targets for limiting global
571 warming to 2 degrees C. *Nature* 458(7242):1158-1162
572

573 Mongeon P, Paul-Hus A (2016) The journal coverage of Web of Science and
574 Scopus: a comparative analysis. *Scientometrics* 106:213-228
575

576 Mosier A, Kroeze C, Nevison C, Oenema O, Seitzinger S, van Cleemput O
577 (1998) Closing the global N₂O budget: nitrous oxide emissions through the
578 agricultural nitrogen cycle - OECD/IPCC/IEA phase II development of IPCC
579 guidelines for national greenhouse gas inventory methodology. *Nut Cycling*
580 *Agroeco* 52:225-248
581

582 Norman J, MacLean HL, Kennedy CA (2006) Comparing high and low
583 residential density: Life-cycle analysis of energy use and greenhouse gas
584 emissions. *J Urban Plan D* 132:10-21
585

586 Penela AC, García-Negro MC, Quesada JLD (2009) A methodological proposal
587 for corporate carbon footprint and its application to a wine-producing company
588 in Galicia. *Sustainability* 1:302-318.
589

590 Paris Agreement (2015) Adopted at the XXI International Conference on
591 Climate Change (COP21) in December 2015
592

593 Parsons D (2009) The environmental impact of engineering education in
594 Australia. *Int J Life Cycle Ass* 14:175-183
595

596 Paul-Hus A, Desrochers N, Costas R (2016) Characterization, description, and
597 considerations for the use of funding acknowledgement data in Web of Science.
598 *Scientometrics* 108:167-182
599

600 Patz JA, Grabow ML, Limaye VS (2014) When it rains, it pours: future climate
601 extremes and health. *Ann Global Health* 80:332-344
602

603 Raper S, Braithwaite RJ (2006) Low sea level rise projections from mountain
604 glaciers and icecaps under global warming. *Nature* 439:311-313
605

606 Riahi K, Rao S, Krey V, Cho CH, Chirkov V, Fischer G, Kindermann G,
607 Nakicenovic N, Rafaj P (2011) RCP 8.5-A scenario of comparatively high
608 greenhouse gas emissions. *Climatic Change* 109:33-57
609

610 Searchinger T, Heimlich R, Houghton RA, Dong F, Elobeid A, Fabiosa J,
611 Tokgoz S, Hayes D, Yu TH (2008) Use of US croplands for biofuels increases
612 greenhouse gases through emissions from land-use change. *Science*
613 319(5867):1238-1240
614

615 Snyder CS, Bruulsema TW, Jensen TL, Fixen PE (2009) Review of greenhouse
616 gas emissions from crop production systems and fertilizer management effects.
617 *Agr Ecosyst Environ* 133:247-266
618

619 Samaras C, Meisterling K (2008) Life cycle assessment of greenhouse gas
620 emissions from plug-in hybrid vehicles: Implications for policy. *Envir Sci Tech*
621 42:3170-3176
622

623 Shine KP, Fuglestvedt JS, Hailemariam K, Stuber N (2005) Alternatives to the
624 global warming potential for comparing climate impacts of emissions of
625 greenhouse gases. *Climatic Change* 68:281-302
626

627 Song Y, Zhao TZ (2013) A bibliometric analysis of global forest ecology
628 research during 2002-2011. *Springerplus* 2:204
629

630 United States Environmental Protection Agency (2019) Global Greenhouse Gas
631 Emissions Data. Accessed 11/07/2019. Available at:
632 [https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/global-greenhouse-gas-emissions-](https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/global-greenhouse-gas-emissions-data#Country)
633 [data#Country](https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/global-greenhouse-gas-emissions-data#Country).
634

635 van Vuuren DP, Hoogwijk M, Barker T, Riahi K, Boeters S, Chateau
636 J, Scricciu S, van Vliet J, Masui T, Blok K, Blomen E, Kram T (2009)

637 Comparison of top-down and bottom-up estimates of sectoral and regional
638 greenhouse gas emissions reduction potentials. *Energy Policy* 37(12):5125-
639 5139
640
641 Woodcock J, Edwards P, Tonne C, Armstrong BG, Ashiru O, Banister D, et al.
642 (2009) Health and Climate Change 2 Public health benefits of strategies to
643 reduce greenhouse-gas emissions: urban land transport. *Lancet* 374(9705):
644 1930-1943
645
646 Yan E, Wu C, Song M (2018) The funding factor: a cross-disciplinary
647 examination of the association between research funding and citation impact
648 *Scientometrics* 115:369-384
649
650 Yang L, Chen Z, Xiong Z, Liu Y, Ying X (2015) Comparison study of landfill gas
651 emissions from subtropical landfill with various phases: a case study in Wuhan,
652 China. *J Air Waste Manage Assoc* 65:980-986
653
654 Yang L, Chen Z, Liu T, Gong Z, Yu Y, Wang J (2013) Global trends of solid
655 waste research from 1997 to 2011 by using bibliometric analysis.
656 *Scientometrics* 96:133-146
657
658 Zhang J, Smith KR, Ma Y, Ye S, Jiang F, Qi W, Liu P, Khalil MAK, Rasmussen
659 RA, Thorneloe SA (2000) Greenhouse gases and other airborne pollutants from
660 household stoves in China: a database for emission factors. *Atmospheric*
661 *Environ* 34:4537-4549