

Document downloaded from:

<http://hdl.handle.net/10251/44797>

This paper must be cited as:

Bosch Roig, MDP.; Barca, D.; Crisci, G.; Lalli Galliano, C. (2013). Lichens as bioindicators of atmospheric heavy metal deposition in Valencia, Spain. *Journal of Atmospheric Chemistry*. 70(4):373-388. doi:10.1007/s10874-013-9273-6.



The final publication is available at

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10874-013-9273-6>

Copyright Springer Verlag (Germany)

1 **P. Bosch-Roig^a, D.Barca^b, G.M. Crisci^b, C. Lalli^c**

2
3 **Lichens as bioindicators of atmospheric heavy metal deposition in Valencia, Spain.**

4
5 ^aInstituto Universitario de Restauración del Patrimonio, Universitat Politècnica de València, Spain;

6 ^bDipartimento di Biologia, Ecologia e Scienze della Terra Università della Calabria, Cosenza, Italy;

7 ^cLaboratorio Scientifico Opificio delle Pietre Dure Di Firenze, Italy.

8
9 **Corresponding Author: P. Bosch Roig; pboschroig@gmail.com, TLF: +34677987401, FAX:**
10 **0034963877319**

11
12 **Abstract:**

13 The lichens due to their symbiotic nature have unique characteristics that confer them a key role as
14 bioindicators of the environmental contamination. Many investigations have been done using epiphytic
15 lichens as bioindicators, but only a few of these studies have used epilithic-crustose lichens. Three
16 different epilithic-crustose lichens species: *Candelariella* sp., *Lecanora* sp. and *Caloplaca* sp. were
17 studied as bioindicators of V, Cr, Mn, Co, Ni, Cu, Zn, As, Rb, Sr, Mo, Cd, Sb, Ba, Pb, Bi and U trace
18 elements. Inductively Coupled Plasma Mass Spectrometry routine procedure is used to determining these
19 element concentrations. Two sites were selected for lichens sampling according to environmental
20 contamination. The lichens were collected on the facade of the Santos Juanes church in an urban area of
21 Valencia; and on the rural area of Albarracin. The main aim of this work is showing the efficacy of the
22 epilithic-crustose lichens as bioindicators of the air pollution. This study shows that the city of Valencia,
23 compared with the rural area has high levels of Cu and Pb as detected using lichens as bioindicators.
24 Therefore on the basis of these results, it can be hypothesized that *Candelariella* sp., *Lecanora* sp. and
25 *Caloplaca* sp. are good accumulators of air borne heavy metals.

26
27
28
29 **Key words:** Lichens; bioindicators; heavy metals; air pollution.

30
31 **1 Introduction:**

32 The large quantities of anthropogenic pollutants released into the atmosphere have a dramatic impact on
33 air quality. Atmospheric pollution studies have therefore become an important area of research. The
34 decline in air quality, due to the increase of atmospheric pollutants such as heavy metals, produces a
35 variety of effects on living organisms and cultural heritage.

36 It is well known that heavy metals are present in the black crusts of historic buildings and sculptures in
37 urban areas with high levels of air pollution. Black crusts are formed by the deposition of atmospheric
38 particles and many studies have shown that a correlation exists between environmental pollution levels
39 and crust formation and development (Ausset et al. 1996; Rodríguez-Navarro and Sebastian 1996; Grossi
40 et al. 2003; Barca et al. 2010). These crusts cause significant aesthetic damage to cultural heritage,
41 leading to the blackening of facades, ornamental details, and polychromes; substrates may also deteriorate
42 due to the differences between the physicochemical properties of the black crusts and the original stone
43 material. For example, differences in thermal behavior can lead to the fracturing of the crust and the
44 consequent disintegration and loss of the original stone material (Winkler 1997; Warscheid and Braams
45 2000; ICOMOS-ISCS 2008; Dakal and Cameotra 2012).

46
47 An abundance of metals in the air can also have a negative impact on living organisms (even humans) due
48 to their toxicity in high concentrations (Cicek et al. 2001). However some organisms, called bioindicators
49 and biomonitors, are able to show these environmental pollutants providing useful information for the
50 prevention and control of environmental pollution. Bioindicators are organisms that can be used for the
51 identification and qualitative determination of the presence of air pollutants. Bioindicators respond to
52 environmental pollution with changes in their vital functions or by pollutant accumulation in their tissue,
53 thus providing information about the environment in which they are living (Tingey 1989; Ausset et al.
54 1996; Rodríguez-Navarro and Sebastian 1996; Grossi et al. 2003). However, biomonitors are organisms
55 that can be use to provide quantitative information on the quality of the environment, and further for
56 indicating long term trends including recovery (Hawksworth et al. 1989; Showman 1990). Lichens are
57 also very good bioaccumulators of trace elements, since the concentrations found in their thalli can be
58 directly correlated with those in the environment (Conti and Cecchetti 2001)

60 Lichens were first recognized as bioindicators in the 19th century. A great deal of research has been
61 undertaken on the use of lichens (specially epiphytic lichens) as active (using transplantation) and passive
62 (using lichen living “in situ”) bioindicators for the study of environmental pollution such as acid rain,
63 heavy metals, oil spills, radionuclides air pollution and contamination from sulphur dioxide spills
64 (Nylander et al. 1866; Ferry et al. 1973; Nimis et al. 1990; Bates et al. 1992; Richardson 1992; Stork and
65 Sanways 1995; Nimis et al. 2002; Kircher and Daillant 2002). The extensive use of lichens as
66 bioindicators of environmental pollution is due to their intrinsic characteristics which make them ideal for
67 this purpose. Lichens have a high sensitivity to air pollutants, a widespread distribution, low mobility, are
68 perennial and have a long life cycle (making long-term studies possible). Furthermore, they absorb air
69 pollutants such as heavy metals because they take their nutrients primarily from the atmosphere (Purvis
70 1996; Gabriele and Callegaretti 2005). Some of the absorbed contaminants remain in the thallus cells via
71 ion exchange mechanisms, and thus the pollutants accumulate inside the lichen (Brown et al. 1983).
72 Detection of elevated levels of air pollutants inside lichens can therefore be correlated with the habitual
73 presence of pollutants in the environment where they are located (Hawksworth 1990). A remarkable study
74 was undertaken on Plimier Island Highway, United States in 1993. This study showed how levels of lead
75 in lichens situated close to the highway increased significantly after the highway’s construction and
76 significantly decreased after the use of the unleaded fuel became widespread (Lawrey 1993). When the
77 air pollution is extremely high the lichens disappear for example Bergagli-Petricci (Bargagli-Pertrucci
78 1915) reported the absence of lichens in a 5km radius around a geothermic area in Italy due to high levels
79 of air pollution. However, an interesting study shows that when the air quality of a region recovers,
80 lichens quickly recolonize it. This study was developed in London in 1983 when a city centre thermal
81 power station stopped working. The city centre was then recolonized by lichen species previously only
82 found in the periphery (Hawksworth and MCManus 1989).

83
84 Numerous studies have been conducted using lichens as indicators of environmental pollution in different
85 geographic areas. These studies have clearly demonstrated the great ability of lichens to accumulate
86 heavy metals and their consequent potential as environmental pollution indicators. In 1989, a study
87 revealed the presence of lead and cadmium contamination in the industrial area of La Spezia, Italy, using
88 epiphytic foliose lichens (Benco et al. 1989). In 2001, Mangiafico and Pitruzzello used epiphytic foliose
89 lichens to undertake an air quality assessment in the Melilli region of Italy, finding high levels of
90 contamination of lead, copper and nickel (Mangiafico and Pitruzzello 2002). In 2005, Bretschneider and
91 Marcano used epiphytic foliose lichens as indicators of heavy metal pollution in the Valle de Merida,
92 Venezuela (Bretschneider and Marcano 1995). In 2010 another study conducted in Argentina using
93 epiphytic lichen *Parmelia caperata* showed higher levels of iron, Manganese and Zinc in the city centre
94 than in the control areas (Ghirardi et al. 2010). However, few studies have used epilithic-crustose lichens
95 as bioindicators. Seaward studying *Lecanora muralis* epilithic-crustose lichen performance in urban
96 environments couldn’t found Lead pollution zonation patterns (Seaward, 1976). In Israel, Garty et al.
97 (1986 and 1977) achieved adequate air pollution study using the epilithic lichen *Caloplaca aurantica*
98 showing higher heavy metal pollution in urban areas compared to rural control areas. Bajpai et al. (2010)
99 undertook a biomonitoring study in India, employing *Lapraria lobifican* crustose lichens which
100 demonstrated greater Fe accumulation than other species of folious and fruticulouse lichens (Bajpai et al.
101 2010). Epilithic crustose lichens have been also used in Brasil to biomonitor Arsenic in the environment
102 (Deschamps and Matschullat 2011).

103
104 The authors’ preferential use of epiphytic lichens compared to epilithic lichens attends to different aspects
105 like: the easier sampling (epiphytic lichens are easier to separate from substrate than crustose epilithic
106 lichens); the easier handling of epiphytic lichens mainly when used on active transplant studies; and to the
107 fact that epilithic lichens are generally slow-growing species. Some authors’ maintain that slow-growing
108 species would be unreliable as their analysis would result of intermixing annually accumulated pollution
109 contents (Hale and Lawrey 1985). But other authors defend that epilithic lichens slow down growth rate is
110 an advantage because increases their life spam under the impact of air pollution (Temina 1998). It would
111 seem, therefore, that further research is needed regarding the use of epilithic-crustose lichens as
112 bioindicators.

113
114 The main aim of this paper is to assess the efficacy of using epilithic-crustose lichens as bioindicators of
115 the air pollution of the city of Valencia, Spain. In addition, we compared the air quality of the city of
116 Valencia with a less polluted rural area. The samples of the urban area were taken from the Santos Juanes
117 church in Valencia (**Fig. 1**) situated in the city centre where traffic is dense almost 24 hours a day. Lichens
118 of the same species growing in a rural area of Albarracín were studied. The rural area is located far away
119 from cities and traffic contamination sources. Trace element concentrations, with particular attention to

120 heavy metal content were determined. Three lichen species growing on the façade of the Santos Juanes
121 church in Valencia (**Fig. 1**), and on a rural area of Albarracín were studied.

122
123 Moreover, this study can be important to investigate the relationship between heavy metal air pollution
124 and diseases increase in the city of Valencia as other works have state. Cislighi and Nimis (1997)
125 established a correlation between contamination of heavy metals and frequency of lung cancer in Italian
126 areas, using lichens to determine it. In 2001, Riccardi et al. conducted a study with epiphytic lichens in an
127 area of Naples, Italy, succeeding in being able to relate high cases of digestive tumors with high levels of
128 heavy metal contamination (Riccardi et al. 2001). Another Italian study demonstrated that high
129 concentrations of Pb detected in lichen thalli adjacent to a waste incinerator and a lead factory
130 was related to relative high levels of Pb in local population blood tests (Palmieri et al. 1997).

131 **2 Materials and Methods**

132 2.1. The Santos Juanes church

133
134 The Santos Juanes is a Baroque church that was converted in 1240 from a Muslim mosque. It was
135 declared ‘Historic-Artistic National Monument’ in 1942 (see **Fig. 1**). It is located in the old city center of
136 Valencia and it is one of the oldest and most significant buildings of the city. The church houses the
137 largest Valencian wall paintings, covering the vault and lunettes for a total of approximately 1200m².
138 They were completed between 1693 and 1702 by artists Antonio Palomino and Guilló using the fresco
139 technique where the pigments are applied with water and fixed to the mortars by carbonation processes.
140 Different species of lichens have grown on the upper part of the church facades and on the ceiling. Dense
141 traffic occurs around the church every day, been the daily traffic density average between 1,908 and
142 11,397 vehicle per day in 2012 (Valencia’s city council traffic information 2012).

143 2.2. Sampling

144
145 The sampling point selection was carried out according to the most abundant lichen species, present on
146 the church facade and according to the different types of substrates where the lichens were growing:
147 Godella limestone (**Fig. 2**) and brick.

148 To perform a comparative level of the air pollution of the city, we also collected lichen samples in the
149 *Sierra de Albarracín*, Teruel growing on limestone. This control rural area is located 40km away from an
150 urban area and therefore the contamination is minimal but the rain and sun exposure is similar. The lichen
151 samples taken in the rural area were used as reference for good air quality.

152 The substrates in which lichens grow were also sampled and analyzed with the aim of separating in the
153 lichens the elements taken from the air by those taken from the substrate.

154 A total of eleven samples including both epilithic-crustose lichens and substrates were taken by scalpel
155 from each site, with an elevation of the ground level of around 10m in the control area and about 20m in
156 the urban area (**Table 1**). Due to the fact that the lichens are in a historical building we took the minimum
157 number of samples needed to do our studies. Each lichen sample was then divided into similar pieces that
158 were used as a replicates. Each lichen sample piece was then separated into two parts. The first part was
159 used for lichen identification and the second part was used to determine total lichen trace element
160 concentrations.

161 2.3. Lichens identification

162
163 Each lichen sample was sectioned in two parts. One part was included in polyester resin and a thin section
164 was prepared for lichen morphological identification by stereomicroscopic analysis, visible light, and
165 ultraviolet light microscopic analysis (Zeiss Axioplan). The other one was analyzed by scanning electron
166 microscopy coupled with energy-dispersive X-ray spectrometry (SEM-EDX Stereo-scan 440 LEICA
167 Cambridge INCA Oxford EDS spot system) and by chemical test. For the SEM-EDX analysis, each
168 lichen sample was placed on aluminum base adhered with conductive glue and after gold metalized.
169 Chemical tests are based on the reaction between lichen substances and added reagents (KOH and sodium
170 hypochlorite). The reactions produce color changes that give us information about the type of lichen
171 substances that help us with the lichen characterization (Rodríguez-Navarro and Sebastian 1996). These
172 optical and chemical analyses together with taxonomic tables let us recognize the most abundant lichen
173 species found on the church.

174 2.4. Substrate characterization

175
176 The substrate samples were divided in two portions. One part was included in epox resin to prepare the
177 thin sections (thickness of 30 micron) for microscopic study. The microscopic techniques were polarizing
178 optical microscopy and scanning electron microscopy coupled with energy-dispersive X-ray spectrometry
179

180 (SEM-EDS) (SEM-EDX Stereo-scan 440 LEICA Cambridge INCA Oxford EDS spot system).
181 Microscopic observations were carried out in order to define the petrographic features and to determine
182 the major element concentrations of the substrates. The other portion was powdered to determine the trace
183 element concentrations of substrates.

184 The characterization of substrate was carried out with the aim to determine the contribution of the
185 substrate in the chemical composition of the lichens.

186 187 2.5. Trace element determination for substrates and lichens

188 Total trace element contents of lichens (on-tallus and in-tallus pollutant content) and substrates were
189 determined using a quadrupole Inductively Coupled Plasma Mass Spectrometry (ICP-MS) Perkin Elmer,
190 model Elan DRCe, by means of solution nebulisation. The ICP-MS is a fast, multielemental technique
191 which offers the possibility to analyse, with high precision and accuracy, a great number of trace elements.
192 The other advantages of this technique are the use of limited quantities of sample (about 100mg of
193 powder) and the very low detection limit (ppb). Because the epilithic-crustose lichens are strongly
194 attached to the substrate, to successfully separate the lichen from the substrate without contamination,
195 we cut with a scalpel only the superficial portion of each sample. Once the lichen thallus is separated
196 from the substrate the trace elements can be determined avoiding substrate contamination.

197 The solution of the samples was obtained dissolving powders by acid digestion using the Mars 5
198 microwave apparatus (CEM technologies). In particular each lichen sample was milled in an agate mortar
199 and successively 100 mg of powder were dissolved using 10 ml of HNO₃ of Merck “suprapure” grade
200 within TFM digestion vessels. Similarly for each substrate sample 100 mg of rock powder were dissolved
201 using a mixture of 6 ml HF, 4 ml HNO₃ and 3 ml HClO₄, within TFM digestion vessels; all reagents were
202 Merck “suprapure” grade. The same procedure was used to prepare two standard reference materials
203 [Argillaceous Limestone (SRM1d) from NIST and Micaschist (SDC-1) from the US Geological Survey].
204 These were used as quality control standards as suggested by Eggins et al. (1997).

205 After the digestion process all samples were diluted to 100 ml with Millipore™ water and analysed by
206 ICP-MS. The external calibration curves were prepared using the Merck “ICP multielement standard
207 solution VI”. Internal standards (indium, germanium and rhenium) were added to standards and solutions.
208 The elements analysed were: vanadium (V), chromium (Cr), manganese (Mn), cobalt (Co), nickel (Ni),
209 copper (Cu), zinc (Zn), arsenic (As), rubidium (Rb), strontium (Sr), molybdenum (Mo), cadmium (Cd),
210 antimony (Sb), barium (Ba), lead (Pb), bismuth (Bi) and uranium (U).

211 During the analytical sequence, the eleven specimens have been analyzed plus six quality control
212 standards (three times Limestone and three times Micaschist) and five blank determinations, interspersed
213 during the analytical run. To evaluate accuracy, the mean values of measurements carried out on the
214 quality control standards were compared with those certified. Accuracies were better than 8%, with most
215 elements within ±5%. The instrument detection limit was evaluated by multiplying the standard deviation
216 of the blanks by 3.

217 218 2.6. Statistical analysis

219 ICP-MS data were submitted to analyses of variance (ANOVA) to evaluate statistical significant
220 differences between the rural site and the urban site. The results of are shown by P values < 0.05.

221 222 3 Results and Discussion:

223 224 3.1. Lichen species found and identified

225 According to literature, lichen identification has been done by observation of morphological
226 characteristics such as the growth form (biotype), the reproductive forms, the type and dimension of the
227 spores (Fig. 3), the lichen color; and the color variation with chemical tests (Fig. 4). According to these
228 lichen characteristics dichotomous keys have allowed us lichen identification (Lorente and Sanz 2000;
229 Miani et al. 2006). The most abundant live lichen species present on the church were three. They were
230 identified as: *Candelariella* sp., *Lecanora* sp. and *Caloplaca* sp. Ultraviolet light microscopy allow us to
231 identify the alive lichens (Fig. 5)

232
233 All lichens found on the church are epilithic-crustose, so the absence of foliose and fruticose lichens gives
234 us the first indications that the level of pollution of Valencia’s city centre is high (Quijada 2006).

235 Each lichen species have a particular pollutant concentration tolerance. If that tolerance is exceeded,
236 lichen may die, therefore when air pollution is very high only the most resistant species will survive. The
237 lichen growth form affects their tolerance and their airborne pollutants accumulation (Garty 2001).
238 Epiphytic foliose and fruticose lichens are less tolerant to air contamination and therefore live in pure air
239 areas; however epilithic-crustose lichens are more resistant to pollution, in fact they are able to live in

240 more contaminated areas (Hawksworth et al. 2005). Bajpai (2009) demonstrated that foliose forms
241 accumulate higher quantities of metals than crustose and squamulose lichens.
242
243

244 3.2. Substrate characterization

245 Petrographic observations revealed that the Godella limestone is a micritic limestone containing rare
246 inclusions of clay. Allochemical components consist of various small bioclasts
247 (algae and gastropods) of lake environment. Porosity is low (about 5%) and often the pores are filled
248 by secondary calcite. Few grains of quartz and manganese oxides are also recognized.

249 The SEM–EDS results from Godella limestone showed CaO (around 98 wt %) as the major component,
250 with very little amounts of SiO₂, Na₂O and MgO. Our analysis also showed that the physical and
251 chemical properties of the Godella limestone and the “Sierra de Albarracín” limestone are similar. The
252 second substrate was a brick characterized by a typical reddish color. The petrographic analysis allowed
253 us to determine the relative amount of the matrix and clasts, and to distinguish between minerals and rock
254 fragments. The matrix is well oxidized, brown-red in colour. The porosity is medium; often filled by
255 secondary calcite. The abundance and grain size of mineral and rock fragments is variable (up to 1.5 mm
256 of diameter). Spot analyses carried out by SEM-EDS on the matrix portion showed that it is characterized
257 by the presence of SiO₂ and Al₂O₃ and subordinately by CaO, K₂O, MgO and FeO.
258

259 3.3. Trace element concentrations of lichens and substrates

260 The results of ICP-MS analyses of lichen and substrate samples, in ppm, are listed in **Table 2**. To
261 evaluate the environmental pollution in the air of the Valencia city centre, the element increase has been
262 calculated comparing the trace element concentrations in the lichens of Valencia with the concentrations
263 in the lichens from the not polluted area (**Table 3**). The difference of element concentrations was
264 calculated considering the type of the substrate (limestone or brick) where the lichens were found. This
265 consideration was done because although the greater part of the heavy metals accumulated in lichen
266 thallus are of atmospheric origin, several works have demonstrate a potential contribution of the substrate
267 to the heavy metal content on the epilithic lichen thallus, even though it’s contribution has a minor role
268 (Garty et al. 1986).
269

270 From the study of trace elements content of limestone and brick present on the church facade (**Table 2**),
271 high levels of V, Mn, Zn, Rb, Sr Cr and Ba can be seen in limestone and high levels of V and Sr in brick
272 substrates (**Fig. 6**).
273

274 Using lichens as indicators, it is shown that there are higher levels of most of the measured heavy metals
275 in the air of Valencia than the levels found on the rural control area. Only four elements show an
276 important decrease compared with the control: Mn (-224.2 in *Candelariella* sp. on limestone; -144.7 in
277 *Candelariella* sp. on brick; and -49.0 in *Lecanora* sp. on limestone), Ni (-29.2 in *Caloplaca* sp. in
278 limestone), Zn (-24.4 in *Candelariella* sp. on limestone) and Ba (-16.2 in *Candelariella* sp. on limestone,
279 and -15.2 in *Lecanora* sp. in limestone). This element decrease can be explained by large accumulation of
280 divalent cation competitor (like Cu) abundant in the city of Valencia and not in the control area.
281

282 The most abundant elements found on all of the studied lichens with an increase of at least 20 ppm from
283 the control lichens were: Cu, Sr and Pb in *Candelariella* sp. on limestone; V, Cr, Cu, Zn, Ba and Pb in
284 *Candelariella* sp. on brick; Cu, Sr and Pb in *Lecanora* sp. on limestone; Cr, Cu, Zn, Ba, and Pb in
285 *Lecanora* sp. on brick; V, Mn, Cu, Zn, Sr, Ba and Pb in *Caloplaca* sp. on limestone; and V, Mn, Cu, Zn,
286 Rb, Sr, Ba and Pb in *Caloplaca* sp. on brick (**Fig. 7**). The differences found between element content on
287 the same lichen species on the urban area, can be attributed to the different growing substrate (limestone
288 or brick).
289

290 Statistical comparison of the element concentration (ppm) present in the lichens from the church site and
291 from the rural site have shown significant differences ($p < 0.05$) on Cu, Pb, Co, Mo, Sb, and Bi.
292

293 The common elements found highly increased in all studied lichen species and not on their growing
294 substrates were: Cu and Pb both of them showing statistically significant differences with the rural area
295 ($p < 0.05$). The high levels of this two metals and its absence in the substrates proves that the reason for
296 their accumulation is attributable to air pollution.
297

298 The research group of Neiboer described in 1978 that elemental uptake of lichens varied according to the
299 elemental characteristic of the substrate, and of course to the environmental element composition

(Neiboer et al. 1978). Therefore the abundance of Sr found on the three studied lichens can be directly related to the high abundance of Sr in the substrates: limestone (517 ppm) and brick (533 ppm). The high increase of Zn, V, Rb, Mn and Ba found in all the studied lichens found on brick can be also associated to the high levels found of these elements in the brick substrate (see **Table 3** and **Fig. 7**). These abundant elements can be components or impurities of the church limestone and brick, or part of the atmospheric pollutants deposited on the church facade as black crusts. Our results are in accord with a recent study of Barca et al. (2011). They observed high levels of Cu, As, Co, Cr, Fe, Mn, Ni, Pb, Sb, Sn, Ti, V and Zn on black crusts present on buildings of the Catania city centre in Italy. This study demonstrates that these elements have part of its origin on anthropogenic sources like vehicular traffic and domestic heating.

According to the lichen-air model of Kularatne and de Freitas (2013) we can say that the metal content of this “in-situ” lichens are in equilibrium with the mean level of pollution in the Valencia’s ambient air as they have been exposed to the environment for a considerable period of time. Following Rossbach et al. (1999) demonstrations about linear correlation between the element concentration in lichens and the distance from the emission sources. We can directly relate the high levels of Cu and Pb found on the church lichens with high city air pollution, and therefore assume that Valencia’s city air is polluted with Cu and Pb heavy metals. It is known that agricultural industries (fungicides and insecticides), pigments, construction, carbon and car combustion emit Cu and Pb into the atmosphere. Valencia is surrounded by important agricultural, ceramic and construction industries and the church has abundant traffic around it, therefore the air of Valencia has high levels of these heavy metals and for that reason the lichens accumulate them on their tissues. Our results agree with different studies carried out using epiphytic lichens as a biomonitors/bioindicators in Europe showing significant higher levels of Pb in urban areas compared to control areas even though the introduction of lead-free petrol, (Cardarelli et al. 1993; Deruelle et al. 1996; Monaci et al. 1997). In Italian cities high concentrations of Cu (Mangiafico and Pitruzzello 2002) and significant high levels of Cr, Cu and Pb (Loppi et al. 1998) were found. In Venezuela high concentrations of Pb were also found (Gordon et al. 1996); likewise, another study conducted on urban areas of Arizona, USA, found high concentrations of Zn, Cu, Pb, and Cd in lichens (Zschau et al. 2003). All these studies using lichens point to the vehicle traffic as the main source of atmospheric contaminants.

Our results are also in accord with studies performed using epilithic crustose lichen. A comparative study performed between urban, rural and suburban areas of Israel using *Caloplaca aurantia* showed generally higher amounts of Mn, Zn, Fe, Pb, Ni, Cu and Cr on lichen growing in ‘town’ than in ‘village’ areas (Garty et al. 1977). Our results also agree with another comparative study done in urban versus “health areas” in Germany using *Lecanora muralis* crustose lichen, where increased concentrations of Zn, Ag, Cd, Sn, Tl and Pb occur in large cities (Rossbach and Lambrecht 2006).

4 CONCLUSIONS

The study done on this work, using lichens as heavy metal content indicators shows that the city of Valencia has on its air high levels of Cu, Pb, showing significant differences ($p < 0.05$) when compared with the control site. Moreover, this study shows the suitability of *Candelariella* sp., *Lecanora* sp. and *Caloplaca* sp. epilithic-crustose lichens as bioindicators of air pollution.

The use of lichens as monitoring bioindicators gives important information because high concentrations of heavy metals in the air can be dangerous to human and Historic-artistic buildings health.

Moreover the two abundant heavy metals, Pb and Cu, found in this study in Valencia’s atmosphere can be toxic to human health. On the one hand, lead is very dangerous for the environment due to its high toxicity and because it cannot be naturally degraded chemically neither biologically. It’s accumulation on live organisms can severely affect them. Lead is a known neurotoxic and young children and fetus are at particular risk for exposure (ATSDR 2001). Lead poisoning in humans can produce health problems that go from headaches and insomnia, to coma and death. Lead atmospheric concentration is normally very low but lead mine extraction, refining, its industrial use, petrol combustion, smelters, batteries, pesticides and paints, may contributed to its high increment in urban areas (World Health Organization 2001). Due to the lead high damaging for human health, it remains one of the most epidemiological researched topics. From the other hand, high copper levels can damage the live organisms and producing kidneys problems and even cause cancer and death (Leone et al. 2006). Its air increment can be related to waste incineration, extraction, smelting, refining for its industrial use, and petrol combustion due to high traffic and heating plants.

360

361 This study provides baseline data on metal air concentration and its time accumulation at the city of
362 Valencia. This information could be helpful for carrying out future monitoring and epidemiological
363 studies in the area.

364

365 The exposed reasons on this study explain the importance of the study of air quality in urban areas both to
366 control the "health" of the buildings and the health of the people who inhabit the area. Our work goal is
367 that lichen can be valid, accurate, easy and economical environmental monitoring instruments, allowing
368 also the comprehension of the evolution of air quality over time.

369

370

371 **Indication of figures and tables**

372

373 **Fig. 1** Ancient map of Valencia's city centre. The Santos Juanes church of Valencia is marked with a
374 white circle. Map by Tosca 1704, obtained from the Historical Archive of the City of Valencia.

375 **Fig. 2** Sampling of *Candelariella* sp. from limestone substrate with scalpel.

376 **Fig. 3** Electron microscopy image of a lichen spore.

377 **Fig. 4** Light microscopy image of a positive, in red, chemical test lichen.

378 **Fig. 5** Ultraviolet light microscopy image of *Candelariella* sp. lichen.

379 **Fig. 6** Histogram showing the heavy metal content (ppm) on the two substrates of the church facade in
380 which lichens grow.

381 **Fig. 7** Histogram showing the element content increase on the three lichen species found on the church
382 facade compared with the control lichens.

383 **Table1** Sampling list describing: lichen species, substrate and sampling site.

384 **Table2** Samples concentration values expressed in ppm of the seventeen elements measured by ICP-MS.

385 **Table3** Element content increase of the sampled lichens in the church, regarding to the control lichen
386 sampled on a non-polluted area.

387

388 **Acknowledgements:**

389 This work has financial support of the Spanish *Ministerio de Ciencia e Innovación* with a Ph.D.
390 scholarship for Pilar Bosch Roig (BES-2006-12110) and with a three months stay scholarship to do this
391 research in the *Opificio delle Pietre Dure* in Florence, Italy with Doctor Carlo Lalli. The authors wish to
392 thank to the priest of the Santos Juanes Church of Valencia; the *Dirección General de Patrimonio*; to
393 Prof. Pilar Roig Picazo and Prof. Ignacio Bosch Reig; the *Instituto Universitario de Restauración del*
394 *Patrimonio* from the *Universitat Politècnica de València*; to the *Ministero per I Beni Culturali*; Italy.

395

396 **References**

397 Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR). Toxicological profile for lead. Atlanta,
398 GA.; 2007. <http://www.atsdr.cdc.gov/toxprofiles/tp.asp?id=96&tid=22> (Accessed August 2010)

399 Ausset, P., Crovisier, J.L., Del Monte, M., Furlan, V., Girardet, F., Hammecker, C., Jeannette, D. and
400 Lefevre, A.: Experimental study of limestone and sandstone sulphation in polluted realistic conditions:
401 the Lausanne Atmospheric Simulation Chamber (LASC). *Atmos. Environ.* 30, 3197-3207 (1996)

402 Arndt, U., Nobel, W., and Schweizer, B.: *Bioindikatoren. Möglichkeiten, Grenzen und Neue*
403 *Erkenntnisse*. Stuttgart, Eugen Ulmer (1987)

404 Bajpai, D., Upreti, K., Dwivedi, S. K.: Arsenic accumulation in lichens of Mandav monuments, Dhar
405 district, Madhya Pradesh, India. *Environ. Monit. Assess.* 159 (1-4), 437-442 (2009)

406 Bajpai · D. Upreti, K., Dwivedi, S. K.: Passive monitoring of atmospheric heavy metals in a historical city
407 of central India by *Lepraria lobificans* Nyl. *Environ. Monit. Assess.* 166:477–484 (2010)

408 Barca D., Belfiore, C.M., Crisci, G.M., La Russa, M.F., Pezzino, A. and Ruffolo, S.A.: Application of
409 laser ablation ICP-MS and traditional techniques to the study of black crusts on building stones:
410 a new methodological approach. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* 17 (8), 1433-1447 (2010)

411 Barca D., Belfiore, C.M., Crisci, G.M., La Russa, M.F., Pezzino, A. and Ruffolo, S.A.: A new
412 methodological approach for the chemical characterization of black crusts on building stones: a case
413 study from the Catania city centre (Sicily, Italy). *J. Anal. At. Spectrom.* 26, 1000-1011 (2011)

414 Bargagli-Pertrucci G.: Studi sulla flora microscopica della regione boracifera della Toscana. La
415 vegetazione cirittogamica nella regione boracifera. *Giorn. Bot. Ital.* 22 409–411 (1915)

416 Bates, J.W. and Farmer, A.M.: *Bryophytes and lichens in a changing environment*. Oxford, Oxford
417 Science Publications (1992)

418 Benco, C., Grillo., Rossi E. and Palmieri, F.: *Biomonitoraggio di metalli mediante licheni epifi ti nel*
419 *territorio della Spezia*. Arpal, La Spezia (1989)

420 Bretschneider, S. and Marcano, V. Utilización de líquenes como indicadores de contaminación por
421 metales pesados y otros agentes en el Valle de Mérida. *Revista Forestal Venezolana*, 1, 35-36 (1995)
422 Brown, D.H., Beckett, R.P.: Differential sensitivity of lichens to heavy metals. *Ann. Bot.* 52, 51–57
423 (1983)
424 Calatayud Lorente, V. and Sanz Sánchez, M.J.: Guía de líquenes epifitos. Ministerio de medio ambiente.
425 Organismo Autonomo parques nacionales. Spain (2000)
426 Cardarelli, E., Achilli, M., Campanella, C., Bartoli, A.: Monitoraggio dell'inquinamento da metalli
427 pesanti mediante l'uso di licheni nella città di Roma. *Inquinamento* 6, 56-63 (1993)
428 Cicek, A., Koparal, A.S., Catak, S., Ugur, S.: The level of some heavy metals and nutritional elements in
429 the samples from soils and trace levels growing in the vicinity of Sytomer Thermal Power Plant in
430 Kutahya (Turkey), in: S. Topcu, et al. (eds.) *Air Quality Management at Urban, Regional and Global*
431 *Scales*, pp. 157–162. Istanbul, Turkey (2001)
432 Cislaghi, C. and Nimis, P.L.: Lichens, air pollution and lung cancer. *Nature*, 387, 463 (1997)
433 Conti, M.E. and Cecchetti, G. Biological monitoring: Lichens as bioindicators of air pollution
434 assessment- a review. *Environ. Pollut.* 114, 471-492 (2001)
435 Dakal, T.C. and Cameotra, S.S.: Microbially induced deterioration of architectural heritages: routes and
436 mechanisms involved. *Environ Sci Europe*. 24, 36-49 (2012),
437 Déruelle, S.: La fiabilité des lichens comme bioindicateurs de la pollution plombique. *Écologie*
438 27, 285–290. (1996)
439 Deschamps, E. and Matschullat, J.: Arsenic: natural and anthropogenic. *Arsenic in the environment Vol*
440 *4*. CRC Press/Balkema, Netherlands (2011)
441 Eggins, S.M., Woodhead, J.D., Kinsley, L.P.J., Mortimer, G.E., Sylvester, P., McCulloch, M.T., Hergt
442 J.M., Handler, M.R.: A simple method for the precise determination of 40 trace elements in geological
443 samples by ICPMS using enriched isotope internal standardisation. *Chem Geol.* 134, 311-326 (1997)
444 Ferry, B.W., Baddeley, M.S. and Hawksworth, D.L.: *Air pollution and lichens*. Athlone Press of the
445 University of London, London (1973)
446 Gabriele, B. and Callegaretti, S.: Calidad del Aire. Bioacumulo de metales pesados en muestras líquénicas
447 (*Pseudevernia furfuracea*) trasplantadas. *The Patern* (2005)
448 Garty, J.: Biomonitoring atmospheric heavy metals with lichens: Theory and application. *Crit. Rev. Pl.*
449 *Sci.* 20 (4), 309–371 (2001)
450 Garty, J., Galun, M., and Hochberg, Y.: The accumulation of metals in *Caloplaca aurantia* growing on
451 concrete roof tiles. *Lichenologist* 18, 257–263. (1986)
452 Garty, J., Fuchs, C., Zisapel, N., and Galun, M.: Heavy metals in the lichen *Caloplaca aurantia* from
453 urban, suburban and rural regions in Israel (a comparative study). *Water Air Soil Pollut* 8,171–188.
454 (1977)
455 Ghirardi, R., Fosco, M.E., Gervasio, S.G., Imbert, D., Enrique, C., Pacheco, C.G.: Líquenes y claveles
456 del aire como bioindicadores de contaminación atmosférica por metales pesados en el microcentro
457 santafesino. *Fabibic*, 14, 165-173. (2010)
458 Gordon C.A., R. Herrera and T.C. Hutchinson.: The use of a common epiphytic lichen as a bioindicator
459 of atmospheric inputs to two Venezuelan cloud forests. *Jour. Trop. Ecol.* 11, 1-26 (1996)
460 Grossi, G. M., Esbert, R. M., Diaz-Pache, F. and Alonso, F. J.: Soiling of building stones in urban
461 environments. *Build. Environ.* 38, 147-159 (2003)
462 Hale, M.E.JR. and Lawrey, J. D.: Annual rate of lead accumulation in the lichen *Pseudoparmelia*
463 *baltimorensis*. *The Bryologist* 88, 5-7 (1985)
464 Hawksworth, D.L., F.L.S. and MCManus, P.M.: Lichen recolonization in London under conditions of
465 rapidly falling sulphur dioxide and the concept of zone skipping. *Linn. Soc. Bot.* 100, 99 (1989).
466 Hawksworth, D.L.: The earth in transition: patterns and processes of biotic impoverishment. In G.M.
467 Woodwell (eds). Cambridge University Press, Cambridge (1990)
468 Hawksworth, D.L.: Biodiversity: Implications for global food security. In Swaminathan MS, Jana WS
469 (eds). Madras, Macmillan India, (1992)
470 Hawksworth, D.L., Iturriaga, T. and Crespo, A.: Rev. Líquenes como bioindicadores inmediatos de
471 contaminación y cambios medio-ambientales en los trópicos. *Rev. Iberoam. Micol.* 22, 71-82 (2005).
472 ICOMOS-ISCS: Illustrated glossary on stone deterioration patterns. *Ateliers* 30, Champigny/Marne,
473 France V. Vergès-Belmin (eds). (2008)
474 Kircher, G., Daillant, Q.: The potential of lichens as long term bioindicators of natural and artificial
475 radionuclides, *Environ. Pollut.* 120, 145–150 (2002)
476 Kularatne, K. I. A., and de Freitas, C. R. Epiphytic lichens as biomonitors of airborne heavy metal
477 pollution. *Environ Exp Bot.* 88, 24-32 (2013). doi: 10.1016/j.envexpbot.2012.02.010
478 Lawrey J.D.: Lichens as monitors of pollutant elements at permanent sites in Maryland and Virginia.
479 *Bryologist.* 96, 339-341 (1993)

480 Leone, N, Courbon, D, Ducimetiere, P, Zureik, M.: Zinc, copper, and magnesium and risks for all-cause,
 481 cancer, and cardiovascular mortality. *Epidemiology*. 17(3), 308-314 (2006).
 482 Loppi, S. Pacioni, G., Olivieri, N., Digiacomio, F.: Accumulation of trace-metals in the lichen evernia-
 483 prunastri transplanted at biomonitoring sites in central Italy. *The Bryologist*, 101(3), 451-454 (1998)
 484 Mangiafico, R. and Pitruzzello, P.: Biomonitoraggio della qualità dell'aria nell'area comunale di augusta
 485 tramite licheni come bioaccumulatori. *Not. Soc. Lich. Ital.* 15, 49-50 (2002)
 486 Miani, N., Skert, N. and Grahonja, R.: Atlante dei licheni epifiti piu' comuni rinvenuti in studi di
 487 biomonitoraggio ambientale nella provincia di Trieste. ARPA FVG Dipartimento di Trieste (eds).
 488 Provincia di Trieste, Italy (2006)
 489 Monaci, F., Bargagli, R., Gasparo, D.: Air pollution monitoring by lichens in a small medieval town of
 490 central Italy. *Acta Bot. Neerl.* 46, 403-412. (1997)
 491 Nieboer, E., Richardson, D. H. S., and Tomassini, F. D.: Mineral uptake and release by lichens: an
 492 overview. *The Bryologist* 81(2), 226-246 (1978)
 493 Nimis, P.L., Scheidegger, C. and Wolseley, P.: Monitoring with lichens-Monitoring lichens. NATO
 494 Science Series IV, Earth and Environmental Science vol 7. Dordrecht, Kluwer Academic Publishers,
 495 (2002)
 496 Nimis, P.L., Castello, M. and Perotti, M.: Lichens as biomonitors of sulphur di oxide pollution in La
 497 Spezia (north Italy). *Licheno*. 22, 333-344 (1990)
 498 Nylander W.: Les lichens du Jardin du Luxembourg. *Bull. Soc. Bot.* 13, 364-372 (1866)
 499 Palmieri, F., Neri, R., Benco, C., and Serracca, L.: Lichens and moss as bioindicators and
 500 bioaccumulators in air pollution monitoring. *J. Environ. Pathol. Toxicol. Oncol.* 16, 175-190. (1997)
 501 Purvis O.W., Interactions of lichens with metals *Science Progress.* 79, 283-309 (1996)
 502 Quijada H., Ph.: Implementación de líquenes como biomonitores de contaminación por metales pesados
 503 (Pb, Cu, Zn, Cd, Ni), en la ciudad de Caracas, Venezuela. Caracas, Venezuela (2006)
 504 Riccardi, N., Leone, A., Barbati, S., Aprile, G.G., Menna, A.: Risultati preliminari di un programma di
 505 monitoraggio in un sito ad alto rischio (Comune di Acerra - Napoli). *Not. Soc. Lich. Ital. Poster.* (2001)
 506 Richardson D.H.S.: Pollution monitoring with lichens. Richmond Publishing, Slough (1992)
 507 Rodríguez-Navarro, C. and Sebastian, E.: *Sci. Total Environ.* 187, 79 (1996)
 508 Roszbach, M., Jayasekera, R., Kniewald, G. and Huu Thang-Nguyen.: Large scale air monitoring: Lichen
 509 vs. air particulate matter analysis. *Sci. Total Environ.* 15, 232 (1-2), 59-66. (1999)
 510 Roszbach, M. and Lambrecht, S.: Lichens as Biomonitors: Global, Regional and Local Aspects Croatica
 511 *Chemica Acta.* 79 (1) 119-124. (2006)
 512 Seaward, M. R. D.: Performance of *Lecanora muralis* in an urban environment. In *Lichenology: progress
 513 and problems.* Brown, D.H., Hawksworth, D.L. and Bailey, R.H. (eds). Academic Press, London (1976)
 514 Showman, R. E.: Lichen recolonization in the Upper Ohio River Valley. *The Bryologist* 93(4), 427-428.
 515 (1990)
 516 Steubing, L., and Jagger, H.J.: Monitoring air pollutants by plants. Methods and problems. The Hague,
 517 W. Junk (eds) (1982)
 518 Stork N.E. and Sanways, M.J.: Inventing and monitoring of biodiversity, In Heywood, V.H. (ed),
 519 Global biodiversity assessment, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, pp. 453-543 (1995)
 520 Temina, M.: Growth of lichens on limestone outcrops in northern Estonia. *IAL 3 – Proceedings.* Sauteria,
 521 173-180 (1998)
 522 Tingey, D.T.: Bioindicators in air pollution research – applications and constraints. In: *Biological markers
 523 of air pollution stress and damage in forests.* National Research Council, National Academy Press,
 524 Washington, D.C. (1989)
 525 Vacuvia Passatore M.G. and Malavasi, C.: Relazioni simbiote: dai licheni all'Agenda 21 locale. CREA
 526 (eds). Regione Lombardia, Italy (2002)
 527 Valencia's city council traffic information, "Plano de Intensidades de trafico días laborables 2012"
 528 Ayuntamiento de Valencia. Servei de transports i curculació, Valencia, Spain (2012)
 529 <http://www.valencia.es/ayuntamiento/trafico.nsf/> (Accessed August 2013)
 530 Warscheid, T.h., Braams, J.: Biodeterioration of stone: a review. *Int. Biodeter. Biodegr.* 46, 343-368
 531 (2000)
 532 Winkler, M.E.: *Stone in Architecture. Properties, Durability.* Springer-Verlag (3rd revised ed) Berlin
 533 (1997)
 534 World Health Organization. *Air quality guidelines (2nd Ed).* Denmark (2001)
 535 Zschau, T., Getty, S., Gries, C., Ameron, Y., Zambrano, A. and Nash, T.H.: Historical and current
 536 atmospheric deposition to the epilithic lichen *Xanthoparmelia* in Maricopa County, Arizona. *Environ.
 537 Pollut.* 125, 21-30 (2003)
 538

colour figure1
[Click here to download high resolution image](#)





