

Document downloaded from:

<https://riunet.upv.es/handle/10251/221133>

This paper must be cited as:

Molés-Cases, T. (2024). Thinking-for-audio-describing: motion events in the film *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey*. *Acta Linguistica Hafniensia: international journal of linguistics*. 56 (2):280-297. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03740463.2024.2413789>



The final publication is available at

<https://doi.org/10.1080/03740463.2024.2413789>

Copyright
Routledge

Additional Information

Thinking-for-audio-describing: motion events in the film *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey*

Teresa Molés-Cases

*Department of Applied Linguistics, Universitat Politècnica de València, Valencia,
Spain*

CONTACT: Teresa Molés-Cases ✉ temoca1@upv.es 📄 Universitat Politècnica de València, Department of Applied Linguistics, Camí de Vera s/n, 46022, Valencia, Spain

Thinking-for-audio-describing: motion events in the film *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey*

This study examines motion events in the English and Spanish audio-described versions of the film *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey*, pursuing two main research questions. First, to determine the ways in which linguistic typology and factors inherent to audio description (AD) have a combined impact on the lexicalization of motion events in the product of AD. Second, to identify the distinct features of the Thinking-for-audio-describing phenomenon. The preliminary results confirm the hypothesized impact mainly in terms of the expression of manner in the Spanish AD, and identify a series of compensations for Thinking-for-audio-describing through acoustic elements.

Keywords: motion events; audio description; audiovisual translation; Thinking-for-speaking; Thinking-for-translating

1. Introduction

In the last two decades, the translation of motion events has been broadly examined under the umbrella of the Thinking-for-translating hypothesis (Slobin 1997, 2005), according to which translators codify different pieces of information depending on the mechanisms and constraints of the target language. The impact of these divergences on translation has been confirmed by a variety of studies dealing mainly with narrative texts (e.g. Ibarretxe-Antuñano 2003; Filipović 2008; Cifuentes-Férez 2013; Lewandowski and Mateu 2016), although other text types have also been explored, including multimodal texts like comics (e.g. Molés-Cases 2020a, 2020b; Alonso 2022).

This research study examines audiovisual productions, a multimodal genre not yet featured in the literature on Thinking-for-translating. More specifically, it focuses on audio description (AD) for the blind and visually impaired. Drawing on previous research, the study analyzes motion events in the English and Spanish audio-described versions of the film *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey* (Peter Jackson 2012). It compares the number and type of motion events in both versions (regarding verbal lexicon, the inclusion or not of manner, and the presence or not of boundary-crossing) with the aim of discovering the ways in which linguistic typology and factors inherent to AD have an impact on the product of AD. More specifically, we aim to explore how the describer's mother tongue, on the one hand, and the constraints (timing) and guidelines (i.e. efficiency and objectivity, among others) of AD, on the other, affect the product of AD. The distinct features of the Thinking-for-audio-describing phenomenon are also defined. The paper has the following structure: Section 2 presents some theoretical underpinnings of motion events and AD; Section 3 outlines the materials and methods and defines the research questions; and Section 4 presents the analysis and discusses the results. This is followed by a brief conclusion.

2. Theoretical background

2.1 Thinking-for-speaking and Thinking-for-translating in the case of motion events

The expression of motion in different languages is influenced by their respective lexicalization patterns and the way their users organize thinking (for speaking). In the extensive literature on motion events, this is first referred to as Talmy's theory of lexicalization patterns (1985, 1991) (i.e. while Germanic languages have been identified as satellite-framed languages because their native speakers usually encode Path in a satellite, Romance languages belong to the group of verb-framed languages since their users frequently encode Path in the verb). Inspired by Talmy's theory, Slobin proposes the Thinking-for-speaking hypothesis (1987, 1997), according to which speakers of different languages conceptualize reality differently, since they pay different degrees of attention to the characteristics of objects and events (i.e. while native speakers of a satellite-framed language focus mainly on the semantic component of Manner, native speakers of verb-framed languages usually devote more attention to Path).

One of the first research studies to apply these theories to the study of the narrative styles of languages belonging to different typological groups is the volume edited by Berman and Slobin (1994). In the study, a series of authors explore how groups of children and adults speaking languages of different types (German, Spanish, Hebrew, English and Turkish) describe orally motion events included in the picture book *Frog, where are you?* (Mercer Mayer 1969).¹ The main results indicate that languages differ systematically in terms of rhetorical style: while users of satellite-framed languages tend to devote greater attention to the dynamics of motion, users of verb-framed languages typically pay more attention to the static description of the scene. In addition, satellite-framed languages are found to exhibit a more varied and expressive motion verb lexicon, above all regarding Manner (cf. Özçalışkan and Slobin 1999). This is related to the tendency observed among speakers of satellite-framed languages to devote greater attention to Manner, whereas speakers of verb-framed languages typically express this semantic component only when it is considered relevant to the discourse. These considerations are further explored and confirmed in a volume edited by Strömquist and Verhoeven (2004), which expands the study to 14 languages (American sign language, Arrernte, Basque, English, Hebrew, Icelandic, Japanese, Spanish, Swedish, Thai, Turkish, Tzeltal, Warlpiri and West Greenlandic).

In the literature we also find works focusing on the study of motion events in written novels (e.g. Slobin 1996b; Özçalışkan and Slobin 2003). Slobin (1996b) studies 100 motion events in five English and five Spanish novels.² Similarly, Özçalışkan and Slobin (2003) analyze 180 motion events chosen arbitrarily from ten novels in English and ten novels in Turkish.³ Both studies reveal a major influence of language type on

¹ For further analysis on the frog stories see Hijazo-Gascón (2021).

² The English novels are *Rebecca*, *The French Lieutenant's Woman*, *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, *A Proper Marriage* and *Chesapeake*; the Spanish novels are *La casa de los espíritus*, *Coronación*, *Cien años de soledad*, *El túnel*, *La tía Julia y el escribidor*.

³ The English novels are *Bless me*, *Ultima*, *Possession: A Romance*, *Seeing Calvin Coolidge in a Dream*, *Rebecca*, *The French Lieutenant's Woman*, *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, *A Proper Marriage*, *The Member of the Wedding* and *The Pearl*; the Turkish novels are *Tutanamayanlar*, *Sen olsaydın yapmazdın biliyorum*, *Parasız yatılı*, *47'liler*, *Gece*, *El kızı*, *Ağrıdaki efsanesi*, *Kara kitap*, *Berci Kristin çöp masalları*, *Mazi kalbimde bir yaradır*.

the encoding of Manner, as well as a greater variety, richness and frequency of Manner verb lexicon in satellite-framed languages than verb-framed languages.

Despite the suitability of Talmy's theory to systematically classify languages depending on how they express motion and to analyze its lexicalization in narrative texts (Slobin 2004), some problems have been noted in the literature (see Filipović and Ibarretxe-Antuñano 2015): Talmy's (1991, 2000) dichotomy is too limited to cover all the existing languages, the definition of satellite is problematic, and intratypological as well as diatopic, dialectal or diachronic variation has been identified. A cline of manner (Slobin 2004, 2006) and a cline of path salience (Ibarretxe-Antuñano 2004, 2009) are thus proposed.

The literature on motion events has shown that the divergences between different types of languages also have implications for translation practice, which has been termed Slobin's Thinking-for-translating hypothesis (1997, 2005). Slobin explained that these differences can have important discursive consequences, since the translator is responsible for adapting the "mental image produced by reading the source language to an appropriate rendering of that mental image in the target language" (Slobin 2000: 123). Some of these implications are well illustrated in the translation example in Table 1, taken from an analysis of Chapter 6 of Tolkien's *The Hobbit* by Ibarretxe-Antuñano (2003: 170).

INSERT TABLE 1

Table 1 first includes a motion event in English expressing Manner (dash), and more specifically a nuance of speed. In the Spanish translation, however, the information on Manner is missing and only the information on Path is included. The fact that the rendering in the English version is more precise allows the reader to generate a more precise representation of the activity. This exemplifies the inherent problem in translating Manner-of-motion events between typologically different languages. As stated above, satellite-framed languages have a more diverse and richer manner-of-motion lexicon than verb-framed languages (Slobin 1997: 459). In addition, the translator is responsible for deciding whether to translate all the original information (at the possible risk of producing an excessively long or unnatural expression in the target text) or whether to omit some information (to produce a more natural-sounding expression in the target language). These difficult decisions are taken by the translator in the context of a specific text type, whose conventions also play a role.

The impact of these divergences on translation has been confirmed in a wide range of studies, mainly with regard to rhetorical or narrative style. The literature identifies a series of translation strategies and techniques for the specific translation problems of Manner and Path (e.g. addition of Manner, omission of Manner, omission of some Path element).⁴ The contributions can be classified according to criteria such as linguistic typology, search method, text type and data analyzed (cf. Molés-Cases 2022). Under the umbrella of typological studies, a distinction can be made between intertypological studies (e.g. Ibarretxe-Antuñano 2003, including an English>Basque/Spanish analysis; Cifuentes-Férez 2006, 2013, where an English>Spanish corpus is examined; Alonso 2018, where an English>Galician corpus is analyzed) and intratypological studies (e.g. Filipović 1999, 2008, including a bidirectional English<>Serbo-Croatian corpus; Lewandowski and Mateu 2016, which examines an English>German/Polish corpus).

⁴ A detailed review can be found in Ibarretxe-Antuñano and Filipović (2013), Molés-Cases (2016) and Cifuentes-Férez (2018).

In terms of methodology, two broad approaches can be distinguished. The first uses random manual searches for motion events in source and target texts, as pioneered by Slobin (1996b: 207) (e.g. Oh 2009 and Vergaro 2012). The second uses corpus-based tools to examine large electronic corpora and studies texts written by a greater diversity of authors and translators (e.g. Cappelle 2012; Iacobini and Vergaro 2012). The main difference between these approaches lies in the fact that the corpus-based approach allows for generalization, while the random manual search technique provides detailed knowledge, thus different types of conclusions can be reached.

Regarding the text types examined, most of the studies deal with narrative texts. Two texts are prominent: studies examining Chapter 6 of *The Hobbit* (e.g. Ibarretxe-Antuñano 2003; Slobin 2005; Sugiyama 2005; Lewandowski and Mateu 2016) and analyses of J.K. Rowling's *Harry Potter* series, such as Cifuentes-Férez (2006, 2013). But we also find studies of other text types, including biology texts (e.g. Pavesi 2003), poetry (e.g. Jaka Irizar 2009), witness interviews (e.g. Filipović 2011), videogame instructions (e.g. Cifuentes-Férez and Rojo López 2015), crime descriptions (e.g. Rojo López and Cifuentes-Férez 2017) and comics (e.g. Molés-Cases 2020a, 2020b; Alonso 2022).⁵

Since this study focuses on a type of multimodal text, a brief outline is sketched of previous research devoted to the study of motion events in multimodal texts. At the time of writing, the literature contains three papers on the translation of motion events in comics and graphic novels. Molés-Cases (2020a) studies the French>Catalan/English/German/Spanish translations of five volumes of *Les aventures de Tintin* (Hergé).⁶ Similarly, Molés-Cases (2020b) examines the German>English/French/Spanish translations of two graphic novels by Ulli Lust.⁷ The main conclusions of these two studies can be summarized in the identification of visual compensation, a new technique for the translation of Manner indicating that images can compensate for possible alterations in the translation and thus minimize the impact of Thinking-for-translating (e.g. *grimper* 'to climb' > *go up* + picture of a ladder, Molés-Cases 2020a: 154). The phenomenon is further examined by Alonso (2022) in a research paper on the French>English/Galician translation of five albums of *Astérix le Gaulois* (Goscinnny & Uderzo).⁸ Alonso develops the analysis further, focusing not only on the translation of Manner but also on how translators deal with Path.

This prior research is the foundation for the present study, which examines motion events in audiovisual productions⁹ within the context of AD for the blind and visually impaired, a mode of audiovisual translation that has not yet been examined through the lens of the Thinking-for-speaking and Thinking-for-translating research. Since AD presents highly specific features (e.g. intersemiotic transfer, time constraints, verbal and

⁵ Comics have also been explored within the parameters of the Thinking-for-speaking hypothesis. For instance, Tversky and Chow (2017) examine a corpus of comics in English, Chinese, Italian and Japanese and ratings of frames on an "action (motion) – scene setting" scale. Cohn et al. (2017) explore a corpus of comics drawn by English, Mandarin, German, Japanese, Korean and French speakers. Similarly, Hacimusaoğlu and Cohn (2022) study a corpus of comics originally created by speakers of USA, China, Germany, France, Japan and Korea. Overall, the results indicate that linguistic conceptualization could influence depictions.

⁶ Here, *Tintin au pays des soviets*, *Le secret de la Licorne*, *Tintin au pays de l'or noir*, *Tintin au Tibet*, *Vol 714 pour Sydney* and their corresponding translations are studied.

⁷ The graphic novels examined are *Heute ist der letzte Tag vom Rest deines Lebens* and *Wie ich versuchte, ein guter Mensch zu sein* and their corresponding translations.

⁸ The albums examined are *Astérix et les goths*, *Astérix gladiateur*, *Le combat des chefs*, *La zizanie* and *Astérix chez les belges*, together with the corresponding translations.

⁹ Motion events in video clips, cartoons and animated events have frequently been used as stimuli in the field of language acquisition (e.g. Hohenstein, Eisenberg and Naigles 2006; Berthele and Stocker 2017; Muñoz and Cadierno 2019).

acoustic information) and because action is frequent in audiovisual productions, the study of motion events in audio descriptions is an interesting research area to explore. This study is therefore intended to generate new knowledge and thus pave the way for further research into the rendering of motion events in multimodal texts.

2.2 Audio description for the blind and visually impaired

Audio descriptions are oral texts that describe the visual component of an audiovisual product:

Audio description is the technique used for making theatre, movies and TV programmes accessible to blind and visually impaired people [...] [it] describes the action, body language, facial expressions, scenery and costumes. The description fits in between the dialogue and does not interfere with important sound and music effects (Benecke 2004: 78).

When examining AD we are in fact dealing with an intersemiotic transfer (cf. Jakobson 1959), since the describer transfers images into words. In terms of translation, the target AD is not a translation of the original AD; rather, they are two independent versions. Despite this, AD is considered a mode of audiovisual translation (Gottlieb 2005; Díaz-Cintas and Remael 2007; Gottlieb, Gata González and Kužník 2022).

Audio description [...] translates two channels – non-verbal image (pictorial content) and verbal image (existing captions and displays) – into one: a verbal depiction, presented (optionally) as an integral part of the film soundtrack, whether original or dubbed. Audio description is thus a modern-day version of the classic tradition of *ekphrasis*, in which “a verbal text describes a work of visual art” (Eco 2004: 110). The reason for placing what might be seen as an additive type of translation in the ‘reductive’ category is that although some of the visual information of a film is represented through audio description, the fact remains that the entire film is now communicated through two channels only: the verbal oral and the nonverbal oral channels. The verbal visual and non-verbal visual channels remain inaccessible to blind audiences, who are the very *raison d’être* of this type of translation (Gottlieb 2005: 40).

Unlike in novels, where rhetorical style allows the reader to create their own image of what they are reading, in audiovisual productions, visually impaired people need extra information to be able to connect with the atmosphere of the film/series and thus create a mental image broadly consistent with what is communicated by the visual component. Importantly, AD is also constrained by the time available between dialogues and narration. This study focuses on a phenomenon which is key for film action, namely motion (e.g. Thorin rushes to the battlements, *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey*). Indeed, as indicated by Bittner (2014), although there are different guidelines for AD, most are consistent in identifying motion as one of the factors to be accounted for in this mode of audiovisual translation.

As indicated above, there is no universal guide for AD, but rather several guidelines or standards on what, how and when to audio describe (e.g. in Spain, regulation UNE 153020, AENOR 2005; the British initiative *ITC Guidance on Standards for Audio Description*, ITC 2000; *Audio Description Standards*, from the American Council of the Blind 2003; the international guidelines derived from the ADLAB project, Remael, Reviere and Vercauteren 2015). In general terms, the conventions of AD recommend making “effective use of the space available, but at the same time leav[ing] enough room for the film’s atmosphere to shine through” (Bittner 2014: 3), since “too much detail can become fragmented in the listener’s mind rather than giving a strong overall impression” (ITC 2000: 14). According to Díaz-Cintas (2010: 174), AD should strive to avoid listener fatigue (through saturation of information) and anxiety (through lack of information). For this reason, the most widely accepted general recommendation is that the description should be as objective as possible (e.g. with simple sentences, direct style and the avoidance of descriptions of what can be easily inferred, cf. Bittner 2014), for the listener to be able to create their own interpretation of what they are listening to.

3. Present study

3.1 Materials and method

This study was conceived to emulate previous studies that used the Thinking-for-translating hypothesis (e.g. Ibarretxe-Antuñano 2003; Slobin 2005; Sugiyama 2005; Lewandowski and Mateu 2016) but in this case considering multimodal texts. The analysis focuses on motion events in the English and Spanish audio-described versions of the film *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey*, produced by Sam Clark and James O’Hara and by ONCE and Aristia Producciones, respectively. At the time the research was carried out, the English version of the film was available on Netflix (Spain) and Amazon Prime (Spain), and the Spanish version on ivoox.¹⁰

With regard to method, I listened to audio descriptions in both languages, noting down in Excel motion events together with their corresponding time code reader (TCR) and sorting them according to the following criteria: type of verb, inclusion (or not) of Manner, and presence (or not) of boundary crossing. In terms of type of motion events considered, this study focuses on self-agentive motion events, and more specifically, on translational motion (Talmy 2000: 35) (e.g. He strolls into the next room) and a type of self-contained motion, specifically local wander (Talmy 1991: 489) (e.g. Gandalf and the dwarves whip through a forest).

3.2 Research questions

The study aims to answer the following research questions:

- Research question 1: In what ways do linguistic typology and factors inherent to AD have an impact on the lexicalization of motion events in the product of AD?
- Research question 2: What are the main features of the Thinking-for-audio-describing phenomenon?

¹⁰ Available at: https://www.ivoox.com/hobbit-un-viaje-inesperado-fantastica-2012-audios-mp3_rf_3964936_1.html

4. Analysis and discussion of results

In this section the analysis will first be presented and the results will then be discussed. Table 2 shows the number of motion events in each version of the film *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey*, indicating how many of these events include the expression of Manner. As can be observed in Table 2, the description of motion is very similar in the two versions. We find 275 motion events in English and 284 in Spanish. In line with previous results in the literature, Manner-of-motion events are more prevalent in the English version than in the Spanish version (182 and 116 events, respectively). In other words, Manner-of-motion events represent 66.18% of total motion events in the English version and 40.84% in Spanish.

INSERT TABLE 2

Regarding the verb lexicon, as expected and shown in Table 3, the English version includes many more Manner verbs and multiword expressions than the Spanish one: 84 versus 23, respectively (see examples 1 and 2). Correspondingly, the Spanish version includes more Path verbs and multiword expressions than the English one: 34 versus 27, respectively (see examples 3 and 4). However, in this case the difference is less pronounced than expected: the divergences observed in the case of Path are not as conclusive as those in the case of Manner. The analysis also identified both verbs and expressions including information on Manner and Path (see examples 5 and 6), and general motion verbs (see examples 7 and 8).

INSERT TABLE 3

Table 4 contains further important results. Complex path expressions or journeys were found in the English version (see example 9), and boundary-crossing events were identified in both versions: 64 cases in English, 41 in Spanish (see examples 10 and 11). However, Manner-of-motion events were the most prevalent type in English (as in example 12) and the least prevalent in Spanish, where they were simply represented by verbs like *saltar* ‘to jump’, which indicate great speed and sudden vertical motion (see example 13), and expressions combining a Path verb with a gerund expressing Manner (see example 14).

INSERT TABLE 4

One of the aims of this study was to examine the ways in which factors inherent to AD have an impact on the product of AD. I examine specifically whether time constraints could have an impact on the lexicalization of motion events. Here, the focus is placed on the expression of Manner, a semantic component which, as explained above, is encoded differently by users of satellite-framed languages and users of verb-framed languages (i.e. as indicated above, satellite-framed languages have a more diverse and richer Manner-of-motion lexicon than verb-framed languages; further, due to divergences between the lexicalization patterns of each typological group, the expression of Manner is typically less frequent in the second group of languages and also more cognitively demanding for its users, hence in that typological group Path is usually expressed at the expense of Manner). For this purpose, I re-examined those motion events in Spanish not including information of Manner, taking the time available after each event as a starting point. An availability of less than two seconds after a

motion event was considered a time constraint. Table 5 shows the number of cases with and without time constraints.

INSERT TABLE 5

As can be seen, time constraints were found in 35.71% of the cases. However, the question that remains is whether the Spanish AD of these 60 motion events is conditioned only by time constraints or if Thinking-for-speaking and AD guidelines also play a role. Indeed, independently of time, the proportion of motion events not including Manner found in the Spanish version would suggest that both factors are also part of the equation of “combined impact” hypothesized in this paper. On the one hand, the generally lower degree of Manner in the Spanish AD (compared to that of the English version) makes us think of the effect of the lexicalization pattern typical of Spanish in the product of AD. On the other hand, not describing subtypes of Manner in Spanish would be a way of using the available space efficiently, avoiding too much detail and being objective, as recommended by general standards and guidelines of AD.

The example in Table 6 illustrates a pair of motion events with time constraint. As can be seen, with the same time availability, the English describer can express Manner more easily because their language allows them to conflate both Manner and Path in a phrasal verb within a boundary-crossing motion event (cf. Aske 1989). In the case of Spanish, on the other hand, the equivalent *Dwalin entra dando zancadas* ‘Dwalin enters by giving strides’ would be a much longer (and possibly unnatural) description.

INSERT TABLE 6

A similar example, but without the time constraint, is shown in Table 7, where information on the eagles’ flight is expressed explicitly in the English fragment but has to be inferred from the fragment in Spanish.¹¹

INSERT TABLE 7

The example in Table 8 is also worth highlighting. Here, the English listener will clearly register a nuance of speed (*scuttle*) that the Spanish listener cannot register lexically but can infer from the subtle and hurried sound of Bilbo’s steps, which is also part of the audiovisual product. Unlike narrative texts, then, in this case the acoustic elements of the audiovisual product can minimize some consequences of Thinking-for-speaking and, more specifically, Thinking-for-audio-describing. It is important to note that time is available after this sentence in the Spanish AD; that is, the Spanish describer had enough time to be as specific as the English describer, but their final decision was, for one reason or another, not to include it.

INSERT TABLE 8

Table 9 shows another example of compensation for Thinking-for-audio-describing. Whereas the English version expresses information on Manner (*stride*), this is not verbally manifested in the Spanish version, which only gives information on Path. However, the sound of Thorin’s heavy and resolute strides can be clearly identified by the listener. Also, in this case the differences between the English and Spanish versions

¹¹ Here it could also be argued that, for economy of language, the Spanish describer used the Path verb *descender* ‘to descend,’ since flying is the prototypical motion for eagles (cf. Table 9) and would be easily inferred.

seem not to be the result of time constraints but rather the consequence of Thinking-for-speaking, and, perhaps, AD guidelines (e.g. efficiency in the use of space available, avoidance of detail, objectivity in description, among other, cf. section 2.2).

INSERT TABLE 9

Having considered the possible impact of time constraints, it can be argued that the difference in Manner between the two versions may be partly related to availability of time, in addition to the influence of Thinking-for-speaking (i.e. typological differences between English and Spanish) and AD guidelines (e.g. to be objective, clear, efficient). Indeed, on the one hand, the resulting data are consistent with previous data on Thinking-for-speaking, since users of satellite-framed languages place a greater focus on Manner, while users of verb-framed languages tend to focus more on Path. On the other hand, they are also consistent with AD standards, which prioritize the use of simple sentences, direct style, and the avoidance of descriptions of what can be easily inferred (Bittner 2014).

Taking the previous data into account, the main results of this study can be summarized as follows. First, the two AD versions contain a similar proportion of motion events. Second, as suggested by the Thinking-for-speaking hypothesis, Manner-of-motion events are more frequent in the English AD than in the Spanish version. The Manner verb lexicon is more diverse in the English AD than in the Spanish version, whereas the Path verb lexicon is more diverse in Spanish. However, the fact that audio-described versions in different languages are independent versions created directly from the image of the audiovisual product makes comparisons of this phenomenon between languages difficult.¹²

At this point, we must return to the two research questions. The first inquires as to how linguistic typology and factors inherent to AD have an impact on the AD product. Our resulting data confirm, on the one hand, the influence of the lexicalization pattern typical of verb-framed languages in the case of the Spanish AD (i.e. lower degree and lexical diversity of Manner-of-motion in Spanish than in English); on the other hand, time constraints were responsible for around one third of the motion events in Spanish not expressing Manner. In addition, although a high degree of Path-of-motion events was observed in the Spanish AD, with the data available we cannot confirm which degree is due to Thinking-for-speaking, to time constraints and to AD guidelines, respectively. Here, only one audiovisual product has been examined, and a more diverse array of data is needed to empirically validate the combined impact of the three factors. In addition, although at first sight linguistic typology, time constraints and AD guidelines are logical determinants of the examined phenomenon, it would be interesting to investigate further whether the typology of the describer's mother tongue has a greater impact on the description of motion scenes than the other two factors, which are specific to AD.

The second research question sought to establish whether there are distinct features of the Thinking-for-audio-describing phenomenon. A preliminary definition is given, according to which it is half-way between Thinking-for-speaking (i.e. the end product of AD is affected by language type) and Thinking-for-translating (i.e. audio descriptions are not spontaneous texts and are influenced by constraints derived from the transfer process, for example timing). In other words, the study of Thinking-for-audio-

¹² Throughout the paper I have endeavored to include paired examples (simulating source and target fragments, as is common in Translation Studies), but this does not mean that each motion event in the English version has a direct correspondence in the Spanish version or vice versa.

describing necessarily entails consideration of the problems inherent in Thinking-for-translating (images into words) and Thinking-for-speaking. The describer has to transfer the image of the audiovisual product into words in their mother tongue while also taking into account AD constraints (time availability) and guidelines (cf. Slobin 2000: 123). Furthermore, just as visual language can minimize the impact of Thinking-for-translating in the case of comics (cf. Molés-Cases 2020a, 2020b), here it has been shown that the acoustic elements of an audiovisual production can compensate for the effects of Thinking-for-audio-describing.

5. Concluding remarks

This study has examined motion events in the English and Spanish audio-described versions of the film *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey*. While the translation of motion events has often been examined through the lens of the Thinking-for-translating hypothesis in narrative texts and other text types, fewer studies have dealt with multimodal texts and, more specifically, with AD of audiovisual productions. In audiovisual texts, information is conveyed through verbal, visual and acoustic elements and some constraints exist that condition the translation process (in the specific case of AD, timing). Two main findings have been made. On the one hand, linguistic typology, time and AD guidelines have a combined impact on the end product of AD (specifically, in terms of a lower degree of expression of Manner in Spanish); the question that remains is whether the specific impact of Thinking-for-speaking is more pronounced in this context than that of the other two factors. On the other hand, it has also been shown that the specific phenomenon of Thinking-for-audio-describing has a number of distinct features.

Interestingly, the research has shown that the impact of Thinking-for-speaking on the AD process can be minimized by the film's acoustic information. However, this study focused on a single audiovisual product, so more studies on audiovisual translation and Thinking-for-translating/speaking in other languages and a more diverse array of data are needed to further develop the theory.

Acknowledgements

This study has been supported by the research project CIGE/2022/153, funded by Conselleria d'Innovació, Universitats, Ciència i Societat Digital, Generalitat Valenciana (Subvencions del Programa per a la promoció de la investigació científica, el desenvolupament tecnològic i la innovació en la Comunitat Valenciana).

References

- AENOR. 2005. UNE 153020, *Audiodescripción para personas con discapacidad visual. Requisitos para la audiodescripción y elaboración de audioguías* [Audio description for visually impaired people. Guidelines for audio description procedures and for the preparation of audio guides]. Available at: <https://tienda.aenor.com/norma-une-153020-2005-n0032787>.
- Alonso Alonso, Rosa. 2018. "Translating motion events into typologically distinct language." *Perspectives* 26(3): 357–376.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2017.1387578>
- Alonso Alonso, Rosa. 2022. "Thinking-for-translating in comics: a case-study of Asterix." *Perspectives* 32(1): 100-118.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2022.2063062>
- American Council of the Blind. 2003. *Audio Description Standards*. Available at: <https://adp.acb.org/guidelines.html>
- Aske, Jon. 1989. "Path predicates in English and Spanish: A closer look." The Fifteenth Annual Meeting of the Berkeley Linguistics Society, Berkeley.
<https://doi.org/10.3765/bls.v15i0.1753>
- Benecke, Bernd. 2004. "Audio description." *Meta* 49(1): 78–80.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/009022ar>
- Berman, Ruth A. and Dan Isaac Slobin. 1994. *Relating events in narrative: A crosslinguistic developmental study*. Hillsdale: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Berthele, Raphael and L. Stocker. 2017. "The effect of language mode on motion event descriptions in German-French bilinguals." *Language and Cognition* 9(4): 648–676.
<https://doi.org/10.1017/langcog.2016.34>
- Bittner, Hansjörg. 2014. *Audio description guidelines – A comparison*. Unpublished manuscript.
- Cappelle, Bert. 2012. "English is less rich in manner-of-motion verbs when translated from French." *Across Languages and Cultures*, 13: 173–195.
- Cifuentes-Férez, Paula. 2006. *La expresión de los dominios de movimiento y visión en inglés y en español desde la perspectiva de la lingüística cognitiva* [The expression of motion and vision in English and Spanish from a Cognitive Linguistics perspective]. Unpublished M.A. Thesis. Murcia: Universidad de Murcia.

- Cifuentes-Férez, Paula. 2013. "El tratamiento de los verbos de manera de movimiento y de los caminos en la traducción inglés-español de textos narrativos" [How Manner-of-motion and Path verbs are treated in English-Spanish translation of narrative texts]. *Miscelánea: A Journal of English and American Studies* 47: 53–80.
https://doi.org/10.26754/ojs_misc/mj.20139226
- Cifuentes-Férez, Paula. 2018. "Metodologías de investigación en movimiento y traducción" [Research methodologies in motion and translation]. In *La investigación en traducción: Aspectos metodológicos y aplicaciones didácticas*, edited by Ana María Rojo López, 31–67. Madrid: Anthropos.
- Cifuentes-Férez, Paula and Ana María Rojo López. 2015. "Thinking for Translating: A think-aloud protocol on the translation of manner-of-motion verbs." *Target* 27(2): 273–300. <https://doi.org/10.1075/target.27.2.05cif>
- Cohn, Neil, Vivian Wong, Kaitlin Pederson and Ryan Taylor. 2017. "Path salience in motion events from verbal and visual languages." *Proceedings of the Thirty Ninth Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society CogSci 2017*, 1794–1799. London, England, 26–29 July.
- Díaz-Cintas, Jorge. 2010. "La accesibilidad a los medios de comunicación audiovisual a través del subtítulo y de la audiodescripción" [Accessibility to audiovisual media through subtitling and audio description]. *ESLEtRA*, 157–180.
- Díaz-Cintas, Jorge and Aline Remael. 2007. *Audiovisual translation. Subtitling*. Manchester: St. Jerome.
- Filipović, Luna. 1999. *Language-specific expression of motion and its use in narrative texts*. University of Cambridge: Doctoral thesis.
- Filipović, Luna. 2008. "Typology in action: Applying typological insights in the study of translation." *International Journal of Applied Linguistics* 18(1): 23–40.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1473-4192.2008.00189.x>
- Filipović, Luna. 2011. "Speaking and remembering in one or two languages: bilingual vs. monolingual lexicalization and memory for motion events." *International Journal of Bilingualism* 15(4): 466–485. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1367006911403062>
- Filipović, Luna, and Iraide Ibarretxe-Antuñano. 2015. "Motion." In *Handbook of cognitive linguistics*, edited by Ewa Dąbrowska and Dagmar Divjak. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter, 526–545. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110292022-026>

- Gottlieb, Henrik. 2005. "Multidimensional Translation: Semantics turned Semiotics." In *Proceedings of Challenges of Multidimensional Translation*, edited by Heidrun Gerzymisch-Arbogast and Sandra Nauert, 33–61. Saarbrücken.
- Gottlieb, Henrik, Laura Gata González and Anna Kuźnik. 2022. "La semiótica y la traducción" [Semiotics and translation]. *Hermēneus. Revista de Traducción e Interpretación* 24: 643–675. <https://doi.org/10.24197/her.24.2022.643-675>
- Hacimusaoğlu, Irmak and Neil Cohn. 2022. "Linguistic typology of motion events in visual narratives." *Cognitive Semiotics* 15(2): 197–222. <https://doi.org/10.1515/cogsem-2022-2013>
- Hijazo-Gascón, Alberto. 2021. *Moving Across Languages: Motion Events in Spanish as a Second Language* (Vol. 47). Berlin/Boston: De Gruyter Mouton. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110721072>
- Hohenstein, Jill, Ann Eisenberg and Letitia Naigles. 2006. "Is he floating across or crossing afloat? Cross-influence of L1 and L2 in Spanish–English bilingual adults." *Bilingualism: Language and Cognition* 9(3): 249–261. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1366728906002616>
- Iacobini, Claudio and Carla Vergaro. 2012. "Manner of motion verbs in Italian: semantic distinctions and interlingual comparisons." In *Lessico e lessicologia. Proceedings of XLII Congresso internazionale di Studi della Società di Linguistica Italiana*, edited by Silvana Ferreri, 71–87. Viterbo: Bulzoni.
- Ibarretxe-Antuñano, Iraide. 2003. "What translation tells us about motion: A contrastive study of typologically different languages." *IJES, International Journal of English Studies* 3(2): 151–175.
- Ibarretxe-Antuñano, Iraide. 2004. "Dicotomías frente a continuos en la lexicalización de los eventos del movimiento" [Dichotomies vs. continua in the lexicalization of motion events]. *Revista española de lingüística* 34: 481–510.
- Ibarretxe-Antuñano, Iraide. 2009. "Path salience in motion events." In *Crosslinguistic approaches to the psychology of language. Research in the tradition of Dan I. Slobin*, edited by Jiansheng Guo, Elena Lieven, Nancy Budwig, Susan Ervin-Tripp, Keiko Nakamura and Seyda Özçalışkan, 403–414. New York: Taylor & Francis.
- Ibarretxe-Antuñano, Iraide and Luna Filipović. 2013. "Lexicalisation patterns and translation." In *Cognitive Linguistics and Translation: Advances in Some Theoretical Models and Applications*, edited by Ana María Rojo López and Iraide Ibarretxe-

Antuñano. Berlin and New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 251–281.

<https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110302943.251>

ITC (2000): *ITC Guidance on Standards for Audio Description*. Available at:

<https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=&ved=2ahUK-EwjW3pqV-tv9AhXkJMUKHWD4BtYQFnoECBAQAQ&url=http%3A%2F%2Fmsradio.huji.ac.il%2F narration.doc&usg=AOvVaw3J-rrv65KmBjGmAg6r5duf>.

Jaka Irizar, Aiora. 2009. Mugimenduzko ekintzak ingelesez eta euskaraz,

Sarrionandien itzulpen baten azterketatik abiatuta [Actions in motion in English and Basque, the study of a translation of Sarrionandia]. *Uztaro* 69: 53–76.

Jakobson, Roman. 1959. “On linguistic aspects of translation.” In *On translation*, edited by Reuben Arthur Brower, 232–239. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

<https://doi.org/10.4159/harvard.9780674731615.c18>

Lewandowski, Wojciech and Jaume Mateu. 2016. “Thinking for translating and intratypological variation in satellite-framed languages.” *Review of Cognitive Linguistics* 14(1): 185–208. <https://doi.org/10.1075/rcl.14.1.08lew>

Mayer, Mercer. 1969. *Frog, Where Are You?* New York: Dial Press.

Molés-Cases, Teresa. 2016. *La traducción de los eventos de movimiento en un corpus paralelo alemán-español de literatura infantil y juvenil* [Motion events translation in a German-Spanish parallel corpus on children’s and young adult literature]. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang. <https://doi.org/10.3726/978-3-653-06745-3>

Molés-Cases, Teresa. 2020a. “On the translation of Manner-of-motion in comics: Evidence from an inter- and intratypological corpus-based study.” *Languages in Contrast* 20(1): 141–165. <https://doi.org/10.1075/lic.19007.mol>

Molés-Cases, Teresa. 2020b. “Manner salience and translation: A case study based on a multilingual corpus of graphic novels.” *Lebende Sprachen* 65(2): 346–368. <https://doi.org/10.1515/les-2020-0020>

Molés-Cases, Teresa. 2022. “Manner-of-speaking in a corpus-based translation study of narrative texts.” *Meta* 67(2): 431–460. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1096263ar>

Muñoz, Meritxell and Teresa Cadierno. 2019. “Mr Bean exits the garage driving or does he drive out of the garage? Bidirectional transfer in the expression of Path.” *IRAL - International Review of Applied Linguistics in Language Teaching* 57(1): 45–69. <https://doi.org/10.1515/iral-2018-2006>

- Oh, Kyung-Ju. 2009. "Motion events in English and Korean. Fictional Writings and Translations". In *Crosslinguistic Approaches to the Psychology of Language: Research in the Tradition of Dan Isaac Slobin*, edited by Jiansheng Guo, Elena Lieven, Nancy Budwig, Susan Ervin-Tripp, Keiko Nakamura, y Seyda Ozcaliskan, 253–262. New York: Psychology Press Festschrift Series.
- Özçalışkan, Şeyda and Dan Isaac Slobin. 1999. "Learning how to search for the frog: expression of manner of motion in English, Spanish and Turkish." In *Proceedings of the Annual Boston University Conference on Language Development*, 541–552. Sommerville: Cascadilla Press.
- Özçalışkan, Şeyda and Dan Isaac Slobin. 2003. "Codability Effects on the Expression of Manner of Motion in Turkish and English." In *Studies in Turkish linguistics*, edited by A. Sumru Özsoy, Didar Akar, Mine Nakipoğlu-Demiralp, Eser Erguvanlı-Taylan and Ayhan Aksu-Koç, 259–270. Istanbul: Boğaziçi University Press.
- Pavesi, Maria Gabriella. 2003. "A look "into" simplification and the translation of motion events in science." In *Complexity in Language and Text*, edited by Lavinia Merlini Barbaresi, 147–168. Edizione Plus: Università di Pisa.
- Remael, Aline, Nina Reviers and Gert Vercauteren (eds.). 2015. *Pictures Painted in Words: ADLAB Audio Description Guidelines*. Edizioni Università di Trieste.
- Rojó López, Ana María and Paula Cifuentes-Férez. 2017. "On the reception of translations: Exploring the impact of typological differences on legal contexts." In *Motion and Space Across Languages: Theory and Applications*, edited by Iraide Ibarretxe-Antuñano, 267–398. Amsterdam, Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
<https://doi.org/10.1075/hcp.59.15roj>
- Slobin, Dan Isaac. 1987. "Thinking for Speaking." In *Proceedings of the Thirteenth Meeting of the Berkeley Linguistics Society*, 335–345.
- Slobin, Dan Isaac. 1996a. "From "thought and language" to "thinking for speaking"." In *Rethinking linguistic relativity*, edited by John J. Gumperz and Stephen C. Levinson, 70–96. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Slobin, Dan Isaac. 1996b. "Two ways to travel: Verbs of motion in English and Spanish." In *Grammatical Constructions: Their form and meaning*, edited by Masayoshi Shibatani and Sandra A. Thompson, 195–220. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Slobin, Dan Isaac. 1997. "Mind, code and text." In *Essays on language function and language type. Dedicated to T. Givón*, edited by Joan L. Bybee, John Haiman and

Sandra A. Thompson, 436–467. Amsterdam, Philadelphia: John Benjamins.

<https://doi.org/10.1075/z.82.24slo>

Slobin, Dan Isaac. 2000. “Verbalized events: A dynamic approach to linguistic relativity and determinism.” In *Evidence for linguistic relativity*, edited by Susanne Niemeier and René Dirven, 107–138. Berlin, Boston: Mouton de Gruyter.

<https://doi.org/10.1075/cilt.198.10slo>

Slobin, Dan Isaac. 2004. “The many ways to search for a frog: Linguistic typology and the expression of motion events.” In *Relating events in narrative: Typological and contextual perspectives*, edited by Sven Strömquist and Ludo Verhoeven, 219–257. Mahwah: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Slobin, Dan Isaac. 2005. “Relating narrative events in translation.” In *Perspectives on language and language development: Essays in honor of Ruth A. Berman*, edited by Dorit Diskin Ravid and Hava Bat-Zeev Shyldkrot, 115–129. Dordrecht: Kluwer.

https://doi.org/10.1007/1-4020-7911-7_10

Slobin, Dan Isaac. 2006. “What makes manner of motion salient? Explorations in linguistic typology, discourse, and cognition.” In *Space in Languages: Linguistic Systems and Cognitive Categories*, edited by Maya Hickmann and Stéphane Robert, 59–81. Amsterdam: John Benjamins. <https://doi.org/10.1075/tsl.66.05slo>

Strömquist, Sven and Ludo Verhoeven. 2004. *Relating events in narrative: Typological and contextual perspectives*, vol. 2. Mahwah: Erlbaum.

<https://doi.org/10.4324/9781410609694>

Sugiyama, Yukiko. 2005. “Not all verb-framed languages are created equal: the case of Japanese.” In *Proceedings of the 31st Annual Meeting of the Berkeley Linguistics Society*, 299–310. <https://doi.org/10.3765/bls.v31i1.877>

Talmy, Leonard. 1985. “Lexicalization patterns: Semantic structure in lexical forms.” In *Language typology and syntactic description, Vol. III. Grammatical categories and the lexicon*, edited by Timothy Shopen, 57–149. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Talmy, Leonard. 1991. “Path to realization: a typology of event integration.” In *Papers of the Seventeenth Annual Meeting of the Berkeley Linguistics Society*, edited by Laurel A. Sutton, Christopher Johnson and Ruth Shields, 480–520. Berkeley: Berkeley Linguistics Society. <https://doi.org/10.3765/bls.v17i0.1620>

Talmy, Leonard. 2000. *Toward a cognitive semantics*. MIT Press.

<https://doi.org/10.7551/mitpress/6847.001.0001>

- Tversky, Barbara and Tracy Chow. 2017. "Language and culture in visual narratives." *Cognitive Semiotics* 10(2): 77–89. <https://doi.org/10.1515/cogsem-2017-0008>
- Vergaro, Carla. 2012. "On rhetorical typology: evidence from the translation of *path*". In *A lifetime of English Studies. Essays in honour of Carol Taylor Torsello*, edited by Fiona Dalziel, Sara Gesuato, y María Teresa Musacchio, 83–93. Padova: Il Poligrafo.

Table 1. Motion event in English and its corresponding translation into Spanish (Ibarretxe-Antuñano 2003: 170).

EN	[...] we	had dashed	through	the gate-guards.
	Figure	Motion + Manner	Path	Ground
ES	[...] (nosotros)	nos abrimos paso	entre	los centinelas.
	‘[...] (we)	made our way	through	the gate-guards’
	Figure	Motion + Path	Path	Ground

Table 2. Motion events in the corpus examined.

Language	Motion events	Manner-of-motion events
EN	275	182 [275] (66.18%)
ES	284	116 [284] (40.84 %)

Table 3. Verb lexicon in the corpus examined.

Language	Manner verbs and multiword expressions	Path verbs and multiword expressions	Manner and path verbs and multiword expressions	Motion verbs and multiword expressions
EN	84	27	6	5
	(1) Thorin <u>rushes</u> to the battlements.	(3) Bilbo <u>approaches</u> them.	(5) Gollum has <u>vanished</u> from his rocky patch.	(7) They <u>move</u> across the skies.
ES	23	34	3	1
	(2) La gente <u>deambula</u> sonriente por las calles de la ciudad.	(4) Las tropas élficas <u>se alejan</u> .	(6) La gente <u>huye</u> horrorizada.	(8) Radagast <u>se mueve</u> entre la vegetación.
	‘People <u>wander</u> smiling through the streets of the city’	‘The elvish troops <u>get away</u> ’	‘People <u>flee</u> in horror’	‘Radagast <u>moves</u> among the undergrowth’

Table 3. Further types of motion events identified in the corpus.

Language	Journeys (Slobin 1996a)	Boundary-crossing events (Slobin & Hoiting 1994)	Boundary-crossing events (manner)
	3	64	40 [64] (62.55%)

EN	(9) They fly <u>over a waterfall</u> and <u>down into a valley</u> .	(10) Bilbo <u>enters</u> the kitchen.	(12) He slunk back <u>into the hole</u> .
ES	-	41	7 [41] (17.07%)
		(11) Bilbo <u>sale</u> de la casa.	(13) Algunos <u>saltan</u> a otro puente. ‘Some <u>jump</u> to another bridge’ (cf. Slobin 2005). (14) Los enanos <u>salen corriendo</u> de la montaña. ‘The dwarves <u>leave</u> the mountain <u>running</u> ’

Table 4. Motion events (not including manner) and time constraints.

Motion events (not including manner)	
Motion events constrained by time (less than 2 seconds available after motion event)	60 (35.71%)
Motion events not constrained by time (2 seconds or more available after motion event)	108 (64.28%)
TOTAL	168

Table 6. Example of motion event with time constraint.

	TCR (AD motion event)				TCR (dialogue)
EN	00:17:15	Dwalin	strides	in.	00:17:16
ES	00:17:25 ¹³	Dwalin	entra.		00:17:26
		‘Dwalin	enters’		

¹³ The difference in TCR between the two ADs is partly due to the fact that the beginning of the Spanish AD includes a brief statement on copyright and authorship. It is also influenced by factors such as the speed of narration, quantity and type of information described, etc.

Table 7. Example of motion event without time constraint.

	TCR (AD motion event)				TCR (narration)
EN	02:34:34	Eagles	fly	over a waterfall and down into a valley.	02:34:46
ES	02:29:07	Las Águilas	descienden	hacia una zona boscosa.	02:29:15
		‘The eagles	descend	to a wooded area’	

Table 8. Example 1 of motion event (compensation in Spanish through acoustic elements).

	TCR (AD motion event)				TCR (narration)
EN	00:15:37	Bilbo	scuttles off	indoors.	00:15:40
ES	00:15:51	Bilbo	entra	en su casa.	00:15:54
		‘Bilbo	enters	in his house’	

Table 9. Example 2 of motion event (compensation in Spanish through acoustic elements).

	TCR (AD motion event)				TCR (AD motion event)
EN	02:37:25	(The company follows Thorin as) he	strides	to the very tip of the pinnacle.	02:37:28
ES	02:32:49	Se acercan	a	la punta del risco.	02:32:54
		‘They approach	to	the tip of the pinnacle’	