

Document downloaded from:

<http://hdl.handle.net/10251/149966>

This paper must be cited as:

Atarés Huerta, LM.; Chiralt, A. (2016). Essential oils as additives in biodegradable films and coatings for active food packaging. *Trends in Food Science & Technology*. 48:51-62.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2015.12.001>



The final publication is available at

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2015.12.001>

Copyright Elsevier

Additional Information

Essential oils as additives in biodegradable films and coatings for active food packaging

Lorena Atarés^{*a} and Amparo Chiralt ^a

^a Institute of Food Engineering for Development, Universidad Politécnica de Valencia, Camino de Vera s/n, 46022 Valencia, Spain

Abstract

Background

Petroleum derivate plastics represent a serious environmental problem, which is why alternative sustainable solutions must be found. To this aim, recent research has focused on the development of edible/biodegradable packaging for food products. The implementation of this novel packaging requires analyzing thoroughly the effect of the ingredients used on the most relevant properties of the material.

Scope and approach

Essential oils represent an interesting ingredient for biodegradable food packaging, mainly due to their natural origin and their functional (antioxidant/antimicrobial) properties, allowing for obtaining active materials aiming to extend shelf-life and add value to the product. However, their inclusion in edible/biodegradable films for food packaging may imply some impact on several properties of the system (such as optical, tensile...), affecting in turn the consumer acceptability. Before the increasing research on biodegradable materials for food packaging, and the growing interest on natural food additives, this paper aims to review the latest findings on how essential oils impact the most relevant properties of edible films and coatings, namely microstructural, physical (tensile, barrier, optical), antioxidant and antimicrobial.

Key findings and conclusions

Essential oil incorporation affects the continuity of the polymer matrix, leading to physical changes depending on the specific polymer-oil components interactions. Generally, the film structure is weakened by the oil addition, whereas the water barrier properties are improved and the transparency is reduced. Essential oils may provide the films with antioxidant and/or antimicrobial properties. The oil composition and the specific interactions with the polymer determine its effectiveness as an active ingredient.

Keywords

Biodegradable films, edible films, edible coatings, food packaging, essential oils

1. Introduction

Conventional plastics are derived from petroleum, which entails serious environmental concerns. Biodegradable films and coatings represent an interesting alternative to conventional plastic materials, which is why several biopolymers have been exploited to develop materials for eco-friendly food packaging (Azeredo, 2009). Edible films are thin layers of edible materials, which once formed can be placed on - or between- food components, whereas an edible coating is formed as a coating on a food product. The most common materials for the formulation of edible/biodegradable films and coatings are polysaccharides, proteins and lipids, and the combination of these allows for producing blends of improved characteristics (Fabra et al. 2009).

Aiming to the reduction of the use of chemical additives in food industry, growing interest has risen recently on the use of natural food additives with antimicrobial and antioxidant properties that do not have any negative effects on the human health (Alves Silva et al., 2013). Essential oils (EOs) extracted from plants and spices exhibit antimicrobial and antioxidant properties (Viuda-Martos et al., 2010), which makes them interesting additives in food industry. In addition, most of them are classified as *Generally Recognized as Safe* (GRAS) (Ruiz-Navajas et al., 2013). However, their use as food preservatives is often limited due to their strong flavor. In

58 order to avoid this problem, EOs can be incorporated into edible films (Ruiz-Navajas et al.,
59 2013).

60
61 In the recent years, EOs have been extensively studied as additives in edible/biodegradable
62 emulsified films and coatings. Due to their lipidic nature, they are expected to help reduce the
63 water vapour permeability of hydrophilic films. Moreover, they have proved to have some impact
64 on other film properties (tensile, optical, structural...), as well as providing antioxidant and/or
65 antimicrobial effects. This paper reviews the role of EOs as additives in edible/biodegradable
66 films and coatings for food packaging, namely their effect on the (1) microstructural and physical
67 properties, (2) antioxidant power and (3) antimicrobial capacity of the films. Recent studies
68 dealing with the characterization and/or application of edible films and coatings incorporated
69 with EOs have been systematically classified, and their main conclusions summarized, in order
70 to give an overview on the state of the art.

71

72 **2. Effect of EO incorporation on the film microstructure**

73

74 Table 1 shows a representative selection of recent studies (2005-2015), giving an overview of
75 the tests usually performed when dealing with the effect of EOs addition on the structure and
76 physical properties of edible films.

77

78 The qualitative observation of the components arrangement into the film structure is often
79 accomplished using Scanning Electron Microscopy (SEM) or Transmission Electron
80 Microscopy. SEM has been repeatedly utilized to investigate the structure of edible films
81 incorporated with EOs, often in comparison to the film with no lipid.

82

83 Contrarily to food packaging materials based on non-polar conventional plastics, edible
84 biodegradable films are usually based on hydrophilic materials such as proteins or
85 polysaccharides, and films or coatings are mainly obtained by casting of the film forming
86 aqueous dispersions and subsequent drying. The incorporation of essential oils in the film
87 forming dispersion is carried out by applying emulsification or homogenization techniques,
88 where fine emulsions of essential oils are obtained containing polymer at the continuous
89 aqueous phase. In dried films, lipid droplets remain embedded into the polymer matrix, as can
90 be observed by microscopic techniques.

91

92 It is normally observed that the final microstructure of the films is influenced by the structural
93 arrangement of the components in the film forming dispersion. Moreover, their development
94 during the drying period plays an important role, given that destabilization phenomena such as
95 droplet flocculation, coalescence and creaming can occur. In line with water evaporation, the
96 concentration of the oil dispersed phase increases, thus promoting droplet flocculation rate.
97 Subsequently, coalescence and creaming lead the droplets to the forming film surface, where
98 compounds evaporation occurs together with water (steam distillation). In fact, losses of EOs
99 were reported depending on the polymer forming film (Sanchez et al. 2011a, b). Factors
100 promoting the emulsion stability, such as the polymer adsorption at the droplet surface and
101 viscosity increase of the continuous phase, contribute to limit the losses of EOs and affect the
102 final film microstructure. So, polymer-EOs interactions greatly affect the emulsion stability and
103 final microstructure of the film.

104

105 Nevertheless, not only the EO nature, but also the homogenization technique determine the
106 mechanisms affecting the microstructural changes in the film. In this sense, relevant structural
107 differences have been observed as the EO droplet size was reduced (Bonilla et al., 2012b).
108 Apparently, droplet reduction favoured the intimate EO incorporation into the polymer matrix,
109 giving rise to increased interactions between the polymer and the oils, a less cohesive polymer
110 matrix and scarcely identifiable oil droplets.

111

112 Sánchez-González et al. (2009) obtained hydroxypropylmethylcellulose (HPMC) films
113 incorporated with tea tree EO and observed discontinuities (lipid droplets) homogeneously
114 distributed across the film since little creaming took place due to the high viscosity of the
115 continuous phase. The droplets became more numerous with increased oil concentration.
116 Atarés et al. (2011) formulated HPMC films with different antioxidant agents, including ginger
117 EO. The EO caused discontinuities (EO droplets), giving rise to a more open structure and

118 thicker films, as compared to films with no EO. The ginger oil droplets could also be observed
119 by SEM on the surface of the films. SEM was also useful in the microstructural studies of edible
120 films based on EOs nanoemulsions, since it gave some insights on nanodroplets organization
121 along the biopolymer matrix (Acevedo-Fani et al, 2015). These authors generally found an
122 increase in the film surface coarseness when EOs (thyme, lemongrass and sage) were
123 incorporated into alginate films.

124
125 Not only the oil proportion, but also its composition may determine the final structure of the
126 films. Atarés et al. (2010b) elaborated sodium caseinate films incorporated with little amounts of
127 cinnamon or ginger EOs. It was found that cinnamon oil stayed homogeneously distributed in the
128 protein matrix, whereas ginger oil droplets were observed. These authors concluded that the
129 structural differences linked to the oil type are determined by the different behaviour of both EO
130 droplets during drying, and result from the complex interactions taking place between the lipid,
131 the protein and the solvent.

132
133 The structure of the films greatly influences the physical properties of these. Benavides et al.
134 (2012) formulated alginate films with oregano EO in variable proportions, and observed a loose
135 texture and a sponge-like structure in these films. This structure transformed into layered with
136 increasing EO content, accompanied by an improvement in the water barrier properties. Ojagh
137 et al. (2010) studied the incorporation of cinnamon EO into chitosan films, and observed sheet-
138 like structures stacked in compact layers when the oil was added. The films with this lipid
139 showed improved water barrier properties, higher tensile strength and lower stretchability.

140
141 Atomic Force Microscopy (AFM) allows quantifying the films roughness, hence characterizing
142 the films surface topography. Shojaee Aliabadi et al. (2013) used this technique to investigate
143 the surface morphology of κ -carrageenan films containing *Satureja hortensis* EO, and found that
144 this oil not only altered the internal structure but also increased the films surface roughness.

145 **3. Effect of EO incorporation on the physical properties of edible films**

146 **3.1. Tensile properties**

147
148 The tensile properties of films are normally studied through tensile tests (ASTM D882, 2001),
149 gradually extending the film at a given rate upon breakage, and registering the strength versus
150 time or distance. The most used tensile parameters are the elastic modulus (EM), directly linked
151 to the film rigidity, tensile strength (TS) as a measure of film strength, and percentage
152 elongation at break (%E) linked to the film stretchability upon breakage. These properties are
153 important characteristics for packaging material (Krochta & Johnston, 1997).

154
155 The tensile properties of films is determined by a wide array of factors, such as the
156 microstructural characteristics of the material (Krochta & Johnston, 1997). Cuq et al. (1995)
157 stated that the tensile properties of edible protein films are dependent on film constituents, their
158 relative proportions and preparation conditions. The effect of lipid addition on the tensile
159 properties of protein films depends on both the lipid characteristics and its capacity to interact
160 with the protein matrix (Pires et al., 2011).

161
162 The studies published on the effect of lipid addition in the tensile properties of edible films have
163 revealed diverse effects. Many works have reported a decrease of TS of protein films caused by
164 lipid addition, both with lipids other than EOs (Gontard et al., 1994; Chen, 1995; Shellhammer
165 and Krochta, 1997; Tanaka et al., 2001; Bertan et al., 2005) and with EOs (Tongnuanchan et
166 al., 2012; Ahmad et al., 2012; Altiok et al., 2010; Pires et al., 2011; Zinoviadou et al., 2009). As
167 regards to films based on polysaccharides, a decrease in TS caused by EO addition has been
168 observed repeatedly (Sánchez-González et al., 2009; Atarés et al., 2011; Sánchez-González et
169 al., 2011a; Moradi et al., 2012; Sánchez-González et al., 2010; Zivanovic et al., 2005; Pranoto
170 et al., 2005; Benavides et al., 2012; Norajit et al., 2010; Shojaee-Aliabadi et al., 2013). Lipid
171 incorporation into the film matrix induces a heterogeneous film structure featuring discontinuities
172 (Zinoviadou et al., 2009). This affects the tensile properties of the films, depending on the
173 characteristics of the lipid added. The strength reduction could be primarily explained by the
174 partial replacement of stronger polymer-polymer interactions by weaker polymer-oil interactions
175 in the film network (Shojaee-Aliabadi et al., 2013). Bonilla et al. (2012b) studied chitosan films

178 incorporated with basil or thyme EOs, and found that the induced close contact polymer-oil
179 caused by high pressure homogenization gave rise to more fragile films of increased
180 stretchability, due the weakening effect on the chitosan matrix where chain interaction forces
181 are reduced. Tongnuanchan et al. (2012) observed that citrus oil incorporation resulted in TS
182 reduction of fish skin gelatin edible films, which was attributed to the lowered interaction
183 between gelatin molecules. Additionally, an increased extensibility was observed. It was
184 concluded that the addition of lipid or oil in protein or polysaccharide-based films may hinder
185 polymer chain-to-chain interactions and provide flexible domains within the film (Limpisophon et
186 al., 2010). Hosseini et al. (2015) concluded that the destabilization phenomena taking place
187 during film drying could be related with the tensile strength reduction in fish gelatin-chitosan
188 films incorporated with *origanum vulgare* EO.

189
190 The TS decrease may be accompanied by either an increase or a decrease of %E. In some
191 studies, such as Pranoto et al. (2005) the EO proportion determines its effect on elongation at
192 break. Shojaee-Aliabadi et al. (2013) observed an increase of κ -carrageenan film stretchability
193 caused by *Satureja hortensis* EO addition, which has a plasticizing effect even at small
194 concentration. Zinoviadou et al. (2009) incorporated oregano EO into whey protein films, and
195 observed an increase in elongation properties at an oil concentration up to 1%. This was
196 explained by the development of a heterogeneous film structure featuring discontinuities,
197 caused by oil incorporation, thus affecting the film stretching ability. Contrarily, Moradi et al.
198 (2012) observed a reduction in chitosan film stretchability caused by the incorporation of *Zataria*
199 *multiflora* EO, which was attributed to an increase in pore sizes of the films creating possible
200 rupture points.

201
202 On the other hand, some works reported the increase of TS due to the incorporation of lipids in
203 the films. Atarés et al. (2010a) observed this behavior in soy protein isolate films with cinnamon
204 EO, and Ojagh et al (2010), who incorporated the same oil into chitosan films. This
205 strengthening effect may be caused by the induced rearrangement of the polymer network
206 caused by the EO. Apparently, some compounds in EO might be able to cross-link chain,
207 thereby improving the tensile properties (Tongnuanchan et al., 2012). EOs consist of numerous
208 chemical compounds with different properties, which could be able to interact with the polymer
209 matrix differently. Phenolic compounds, present in high concentrations in EOs (Burt, 2004) are
210 able to react with more than one protein site, leading to protein cross-links (Haslam, 1989).
211 Strong interaction between cinnamon EO and the polymer matrix has been observed in
212 chitosan films, where a cross linking effect caused a significant increase of tensile strength and
213 a decrease in the elongation at break (Ojagh et al., 2010). Pires et al. (2013) elaborated hake
214 protein films incorporated with several EOs, and explained their findings by the specific oil-
215 protein interactions. For instance, the higher resistance of films with citronella oil may result
216 from the protein crosslinking promoted by β -citronellal. On the other hand, the presence of Δ^3 -
217 carene in citronella oil (22.5%), an apolar monoterpene, may be responsible for the increase of
218 the elasticity of films with this oil added.

219
220 Some other studies report the non-significant effect of EO addition on the tensile properties of
221 the films. Atarés et al. (2010b) observed no significant effect of cinnamon EO incorporation on
222 the tensile properties of sodium caseinate films, although the same oil at the same proportions
223 had caused some TS increase in soy protein films (Atarés et al. 2010a). Pires et al. (2013)
224 found that TS of hake protein films was not significantly affected by the incorporation of a variety
225 of EOs.

226
227 In conclusion, the effect of EO addition on the tensile properties of edible films is rather variable
228 and depends on the specific interactions between the oil components and the polymer matrix.
229 Typically, some weakening effect is caused, mainly attributed to the heterogeneous biphasic
230 structure caused by lipid addition, although some studies have reported the opposite effect.
231 Unlike pure lipid components, EOs have a complex composition, which complicates to predict
232 their effect.

233 234 **3.2. Barrier properties**

235
236 The films ability to retard moisture loss from the product is an important characteristic that
237 affects product quality (Pranoto et al., 2005), and hence the water barrier properties of a film or

238 coating material should be taken into account when applying onto a moist product. The water
239 vapour permeability (WVP) of edible films is normally quantified through a gravimetric method
240 (ASTM E96-95), often modified for application of hydrophilic materials (McHugh et al., 1993;
241 Gennadios et al., 1994).

242
243 The water vapour transfer processes in films depend on the hydrophilic-hydrophobic ratio of the
244 film constituents (Hernandez, 1994). Hence, the incorporation of hydrophobic EO into
245 hydrophilic polymer matrices may result in the improvement of their water vapour barrier
246 properties. This trend was observed by Sánchez-González et al. (2009) in HPMC films with tea
247 tree EO, by Pires et al. (2013) in hake protein films with different EOs (thyme was the most
248 effective, coherently with Pires et al., (2011)) and also by Atarés et al (2010b), who incorporated
249 cinnamon and ginger EOs into sodium caseinate films. Other studies have reported the same
250 effect (Sánchez-González et al., 2009; Atarés et al., 2011; Ojagh et al., 2010; Moradi et al.,
251 2012; Tongnuanchan et al., 2012; Pires et al., 2011, 2013; Benavides et al., 2012; Shojaei-
252 Aliabadi et al., 2013; Zivanovic et al., 2005). However, being complex mixtures of numerous
253 chemical compounds, the hydrophobicity of EOs is a variable feature, thus affecting their
254 efficacy as water vapour permeability depressors. Ahmad et al. (2012) elaborated gelatin films
255 with bergamot or lemongrass EOs and noted that they affected the water permeability
256 differently, which was attributed to their differing properties.

257
258 Apart from WVP reduction, other effects of EO addition on the water barrier properties of edible
259 films have been found in literature. Oregano EO did not affect the WVP of whey protein films
260 (Zinoviadou et al., 2009). Teixeira et al. (2014) found that clove EO reduced the WVP of fish
261 protein films, whereas garlic and oreganum EOs did not induce significant changes. Pruneda et
262 al. (2008) observed the increase of soy based films WVP after oregano EO addition. Pranoto et
263 al. (2005) observed that garlic oil addition greatly increased the WVP of alginate edible films.
264 Probably garlic oil contributed to extend intermolecular interactions of the structural matrix in
265 alginate film, therefore enhancing moisture passing through the edible film. Atarés et al. (2010a)
266 found that the addition of small proportions of cinnamon and ginger EOs resulted in a reduction
267 in the water vapour barrier properties of soy protein films. This was attributed to the low oil
268 proportion and the lipid discontinuities not being relevant to increase the tortuosity factor for
269 transfer of water molecules, which is responsible for the reduction of WVP (Perez-Gago &
270 Krochta, 2001). Ahmad et al. (2012) studied gelatin films incorporated with bergamot or
271 lemongrass EOs, and found some slight WVP increase when bergamot oil was added. This was
272 attributed to the bergamot oil distributing irregularly in the film, leading to heterogeneous film
273 structure. These studies, among others, demonstrate that it cannot be assumed that WVP of
274 edible is reduced simply by adding a hydrophobic component in the formulation, since the
275 impact of the lipid addition on the microstructure of the emulsified film is a determining factor in
276 water barrier efficiency. In turn, the microstructure of the emulsified film is affected by other
277 factors, such as the physical state of the EO and its distribution into the polymer matrix.

278
279 The physical state of the lipid may have an important impact on WVP. Ginger EO incorporated
280 in HPMC films was most effective as WVP depressor at low temperature (Atarés et al., 2011).
281 The liquid state of ginger oil could favour molecular mobility at high temperature, thus promoting
282 the transport of water molecules through the emulsified films. Similar results were observed by
283 Atarés et al. (2010b) in sodium caseinate films.

284
285 Moreover, the lipid distribution into the polymer matrix may also determine its efficacy as WVP
286 depressor. The smaller the lipid droplets, the more homogeneously distributed it is in the film
287 matrix and the lower the WVP (Debeaufort & Voilley, 1995; Karbowiak et al., 2007; McHugh &
288 Krochta, 1994; Perez-Gago & Krochta, 2001). Atarés et al. (2010a) tested the efficacy of
289 cinnamon and ginger EOs as WVP depressors in soy protein films, and found that cinnamon
290 EO, being homogeneously integrated in the protein network, was more effective than ginger EO
291 at the same oil: protein ratio. In fact, the difficulties in integrating the lipid in the hydrophilic
292 network may cause matrix disruptions and create void spaces at the protein-lipid interface.

293
294 The oxygen permeability of edible films is measured much more rarely than WVP (table 1). This
295 property is greatly affected by relative humidity and temperature at which film equilibrates since
296 diffusion depending properties are dependent on molecular mobility, which increases when the
297 film moisture content or temperature increase (Miller & Krochta, 1997). OP is an important

298 feature to be taken into account when aiming to formulate edible films and coatings to reduce
299 lipid oxidation. In general, it is expected that EO addition helps increase oxygen permeability
300 due to its hydrophobic character. Atarés et al. (2011) formulated HPMC films with ginger EO
301 and found a significant oxygen permeability increase. In spite of this, HPMC-ginger EO coatings
302 exhibited some antioxidant activity, which suggests that oxygen permeability is not the only
303 factor determining the antioxidant capacity of edible films, as will be pointed out below.

304 **3.3. Optical properties**

305
306
307 Optical properties (colour, transparency and gloss) of films and coatings may have a great
308 impact on the food product appearance and hence on the consumer acceptability (Sivarooban
309 et al., 2008; Kunte et al., 1997).

310 **3.3.1. Colour**

311
312
313 The colour of edible films incorporated with EOs is directly influenced by the type and
314 concentration of the oil added (Du et al., 2009). Moradi et al. (2012) elaborated films with
315 chitosan, *Zataria multiflora* Boiss essential oil (ZEO) and/or grape seed extract (GSE). Whereas
316 the incorporation of ZEO did not affect the colour, the incorporated GSE films had a brownish
317 color. Pires et al. (2013) formulated hake protein films with a variety of EOs, and found that only
318 films with tarragon and coriander EOs were significantly more yellow than the control films.
319 The type of EO determined the colour changes in the studies performed by Ahmad et al. (2012)
320 and Tongnuanchan et al. (2012) on gelatin films. No significant effect on the films colour was
321 found by Pranoto et al. (2005), who incorporated garlic EO into alginate films. The same
322 happened in the studies of Pires et al. (2011) on thyme EO- hake protein films, and Atarés et
323 al., (2011) on ginger EO.

324
325 Other EOs tend to have a strong effect on colour, which is the case for cinnamon. Ojagh et al.
326 (2010) formulated chitosan films with cinnamon EO, and found that the slight yellowness of
327 chitosan was increased by this EO. Atarés et al. (2010 a,b) elaborated films with cinnamon or
328 ginger EOs and, even at low concentration, cinnamon EO affected the colour to a higher extent
329 than ginger, increasing the chroma and reducing the whiteness index as the oil proportion was
330 increased. Siripatrawan & Harte (2010) incorporated green tea extract into chitosan films, and
331 found that its incorporation led to significant colour changes as the extract concentrations
332 increased. Sánchez González et al. (2009) tested the incorporation of tea tree EO into HPMC
333 films and found a significant increase of the whiteness index when this oil was added. This
334 effect was attributed to the increase in diffuse reflectance provoked by light scattering in the lipid
335 droplets (the higher the intensity of light scattering, the higher the whiteness index).

336 **3.3.2. Transparency**

337
338
339 The film transparency has been measured using a variety of methods. Tongnuanchan et al.
340 (2012) measured the light transmittance of gelatin films at 200-800 nm, according to Shiku et al.
341 (2004). Additionally, the “transparency value” was calculated by dividing the absorbance at 600
342 nm by the film thickness, according to Han & Floros (1997). The greater “transparency value”
343 represents the lower transparency of film, which is why some other authors call this index
344 “opacity index” (Gómez Estaca et al., 2009b). It was found that EO incorporation caused a film
345 transparency reduction. The oils addition resulted in an important decrease of light
346 transmission, possibly due to the light scattering at the interface of EO droplets imbedded in the
347 film matrix. Consequently, an increase in opaqueness of films containing EOs was observed,
348 which was affected by the type of EO. The same trend was observed by other authors
349 (Siripatrawan & Harte, 2010; Pires et al., 2013; Norajit et al., 2010; Hosseini et al., 2009) using
350 the same measurement method.

351
352 Apart from the “transparency value”, Pires et al. (2011) calculated the opacity (%) of hake
353 protein-thyme EO films by obtaining the reflectance measurements of each sample with a black
354 backing and with a white backing. Percentage opacity was calculated as:

355
$$\text{opacity}(\%) = \frac{Y_{\text{black backing}}}{Y_{\text{whitebacking}}} 100 \quad \text{equation 1}$$

356 where Y is the tristimulus value Y. As the thyme oil proportion was increased in the films, the
357 “transparency value”, increased. However, the opacity (%) was not affected by the oil
358 proportion, hence the authors considered that the changes in the “transparency value” may be
359 related to the variable film thickness. All films obtained in this study were clear enough to be
360 used as see-through packaging or coating materials.

361 In other studies, the theory of Kubelka-Munk has been used to study the translucency of EO
362 incorporated edible films. This method consists of obtaining the surface reflectance spectra of
363 the films using a spectrophotometer, both on a white and a black background. The film
364 transparency is then evaluated through the internal transmittance (0-1, theoretical range) by
365 applying the Kubelka-Munk theory for multiple scattering to the reflection data (Hutchings,
366 1999). An increase in the internal transmittance (T_i) can be assumed as an increase in
367 transparency. Sánchez-González et al. (2011a) used this method to study the optical properties
368 of HPMC or chitosan films incorporated with diverse EOs. It was found that T_i values were
369 significantly lower in films incorporating the highest amounts of EO. The composite films were
370 more opaque than pure CH and HPMC films. This phenomenon is related with the light
371 scattering provoked by lipid droplets (with a different refractive index) distributed throughout the
372 film network. The transparency reduction caused by EO addition was also observed by
373 Sánchez-González et al. (2009) when working with tea tree incorporated HPMC films. Atarés et
374 al. (2011) also observed that HPMC films with a small proportion of ginger oil were more
375 opaque than pure HPMC films.

377 **3.3.3. Gloss**

378 According to norm ASTM D523 (1999), gloss can be defined as the ratio of the luminous flux
379 reflected from a specimen to the luminous flux reflected from a standard surface under the
380 same geometric conditions. The surface morphology reached during the film drying determines
381 the final gloss of the films (Sánchez-González et al., 2011a). EO incorporation in a polymer
382 matrix normally produces an increase in heterogeneity and a surface roughness increase, which
383 is normally linked to a gloss decrease (Ward & Nussinovitch, 1996). This effect is explained by
384 the migration of oil droplets or aggregates to the film surface during drying, decreasing the
385 specular reflectance in the air-film interface, and thus contributing to reduced gloss. This trend
386 has been repeatedly observed in studies such as Sánchez-González et al. (2009, 2011a) on
387 chitosan and HPMC films with bergamot, lemon or tea tree EOs, and Shojaee-Aliabadi et al.
388 (2013), who incorporated *Satureja hortensis* extract into carragenan films.

389 Probably, the amount of oil incorporated determines its effect on the films gloss. Atarés et al.
390 (2010a) measured the gloss of soy protein films incorporated with little amounts of cinnamon or
391 ginger EOs. All the films were described as only slightly glossy and no particular effect of the
392 presence, type or proportion of oil was observed.

393 **4. Effect of EO incorporation on the antioxidant properties of edible films and** 394 **coatings**

395 Oxidation is one of the most important ways of food degradation (Viuda-Martos et al., 2011). It
396 takes place during the processing and storage of food products, and affects both their sensory
397 and nutritional properties. Lipid oxidation is responsible for rancid odours and flavours, a
398 decrease in nutritional quality and the formation of potentially toxic compounds (Yanishlieva et
399 al., 2006). Due to the bad image of chemical additives, there has been growing interest and
400 research on natural antioxidants without negative effects on the human health (Alves Silva et
401 al., 2013).

402 Because of their chemical composition (rich in biologically active compounds such as
403 terpenoids and phenolic acids), it has been long recognized that EOs have antioxidant
404 properties (Ruiz Navajas et al., 2013; Alves Silva et al., 2013). The antioxidant action of EO
405 incorporated into edible films and coatings was reviewed by Bonilla et al. (2012a). Briefly, two
406 mechanisms take part in this action: promotion of the oxygen barrier capacity since antioxidants
407 can act as oxygen scavengers (Bonilla et al. 2013) and specific antioxidant action when
408 compounds diffuse to the coated product. Table 2 shows some recent studies dealing with the
409 effect of EO addition on the *in vitro* antioxidant properties of edible films, quantified using a

416 variety of methods. Previously, the film extract is obtained by merely dissolving it in an
417 appropriate solvent or through solidification, grinding and solution.

418
419 The antioxidant capacity of edible films is normally correlated with its available phenolic
420 compound, which can be quantified using the Folin-Ciocalteu method. This method is based
421 on the reaction between the film extract and Folin-Ciocalteu reagent, and the absorbance at
422 765 nm. A calibration curve is obtained using gallic acid, and the results are expressed as
423 milligrams of gallic acid equivalent (GAE) per milliliter of extract. Oussalah et al. (2004) used
424 this method to test the release of phenolic compounds over storage of milk protein-EOs films,
425 and the migration was found to be correlated with the EOs chemical composition. Shojaee-
426 Aliabadi et al. (2013) used this method and observed how the total phenolic content increased
427 as the EO proportion in the film became higher.

428
429 The 2,2-diphenyl-1-picrylhydrazyl (DPPH) radical was one of the earliest synthetic radicals used
430 to test the activity of phenolic antioxidants. The disappearance of the DPPH radical absorption
431 at 515nm by the action of antioxidants is measured spectrophotometrically until the absorbance
432 remains constant (10 min to 6 hours). The 'antiradical efficiency' is quantified with the amount of
433 antioxidant required for a 50% decrease in initial DPPH radical concentration and the time
434 required to reach the steady state DPPH radical concentration. This assay is limited because
435 DPPH radicals interact with other radicals (alkyl), and the time response curve to reach the
436 steady state is not linear with different ratios of antioxidant/DPPH (Frankel & Meyer, 2000).
437 Siripatrawan & Harte (2010) formulated chitosan films incorporated with green tea extract, and
438 used DPPH test. They found that pure chitosan films showed some antioxidant capacity, and
439 this increased with increasing green tea extract concentration. Dashipour et al. (2015) used the
440 same method and corroborated that the *in vitro* antioxidant activity of carboxymethylcellulose –
441 *Zataria multiflora* EO films increased proportionally with EO content. Norajit et al. (2010) used
442 this method to test the antioxidant capacity of alginate films incorporated with ginseng extract,
443 and found that all films containing the antioxidant had a significantly higher activity than those of
444 pure alginate.

445
446 The reducing power method has been described by several authors (Gulcin et al., 2003; Oyaizu
447 1988). The film powder is mixed with potassium ferric cyanide solution and trichloroacetic acid is
448 added. After centrifugation, the supernatant is mixed with ferric chloride solution and the
449 absorbance is measured at 700nm. The results are normally expressed as mmol ascorbic acid
450 per g of film, and high absorbance indicates high the reducing powder. Pires et al. (2011) used
451 this method and observed how the addition of thyme oil increased the reducing power of hake
452 protein films. Pires et al. (2013) used this test to compare the reducing power of hake protein
453 films incorporated with different EOs, and concluded that coriander was the most effective.
454 Moradi et al. (2012) used this method to conclude that the addition of *Zataria multiflora* EO to
455 chitosan films could yield higher antioxidant activity, which was significantly increased with
456 higher EO concentration.

457
458 The ferric-reducing antioxidant power (FRAP) assay measures directly the ability of antioxidants
459 to reduce a ferric tripyridyltriazine complex to the ferrous complex at low pH. The resulting blue
460 colour measured spectrophotometrically at 593nm is taken as linearly related to the total
461 reducing capacity of electron-donating antioxidants (Frankel & Meyer, 2000). This method was
462 used by Ruiz-Navajas et al. (2013) to test the antioxidant capacity of chitosan – thyme oil edible
463 films, revealing that the antioxidant capacity occurred in a concentration dependent manner.
464 Gómez-Estaca et al. (2009a) used FRAP assay to test the antioxidant capacity of gelatin films
465 with oregano or rosemary EOs, and found that, accordingly to the response of pure EOs, those
466 films including oregano were more active than those containing rosemary. This was also
467 coherent with the higher phenol content in oregano EO.

468
469 Ferrous ion chelating activity (FIC) assay measures how effectively the compounds in the
470 antioxidant sample can compete with ferrozine for ferrous ion (Ruiz-Navajas et al. 2013; Carter,
471 1971). The antioxidant causes the inhibition of the Fe²⁺-ferrozine complex, which is
472 spectrophotometrically quantified at 562nm. Ruiz-Navajas et al. (2013) used this method and
473 found that chitosan films showed great chelating activity, which was increased by thyme oil
474 addition in a concentration-dependent manner.

475

476 The original Trolox Equivalent Antioxidant Capacity (TEAC) method was modified by Re et al.
477 (1999), and this modification has been very frequently used to test the antioxidant capacity of a
478 wide variety of samples. In this method, Trolox (6-hydroxy-2,5,7,8-tetramethylchroman- 2-
479 carboxylic acid), a vitamin E analogue, is used as an antioxidant standard. The substrate is
480 ABTS (2,20-azinobis(3-ethylbenzothiazoline- 6-sulfonic acid) diammonium salt), a colourless
481 compound which is initially oxidized to ABTS radical cation, a blue chromophore. This solution
482 is then diluted with ethanol to an absorbance at 734 nm of 0.70 (\pm 0.02) and mixed with the
483 antioxidant sample. The absorbance reduction is then registered over a 6 minutes period and
484 compared to a calibration curve obtained with trolox solutions. Tongnuanchan et al. (2012) used
485 this test to evaluate the antioxidant capacity of gelatin films containing citrus EOs, and found
486 that lemon was significantly more effective than the rest, which was coherent with the FRAP
487 results. Gómez-Estaca et al. (2009a) tested the antioxidant capacity of gelatin films with
488 oregano or rosemary EOs using the TEAC method, and found that the films containing oregano
489 EO were more active than those containing rosemary. This was in agreement with the results of
490 TEAC performed on pure extracts.

491
492

493 **5. Effect of EO incorporation on the antibacterial properties of edible films and** 494 **coatings**

495

496 The growth of spoilage microorganisms and food-borne pathogens is one of the most important
497 causes for food degradation (Viuda-Martos et al., 2011). The presence of spoilage
498 microorganisms in food can accelerate the lipid oxidation and other oxidation processes, or can
499 produce changes in the organoleptic properties of the foods (Saggiorato et al., 2012). Food-
500 borne pathogens are directly responsible for certain illnesses in the human organism, or can be
501 indirectly responsible due to the production of toxins (Saggiorato et al., 2012).

502

503 Antimicrobial packaging could reduce food losses and increase the shelf-life of food products
504 (Zhang et al., 2015). EOs extracted from plants and spices are rich sources of bioactive
505 compounds (terpenoids, phenolic compounds...) which have been recognized as antimicrobial
506 agents (Ruiz Navajas et al., 2013; Burt, 2004). The EOs affect microbial cells by various
507 antimicrobial mechanisms, including attacking the phospholipid bilayer of the cell membrane,
508 disrupting enzyme systems, compromising the genetic material of bacteria, and forming fatty
509 acid hydroperoxidase caused by oxygenation of unsaturated fatty acids (Arques et al., 2008;
510 Burt et al., 2007).

511

512 Most of the reported studies deal with the antibacterial action of EOs. However, their antifungal
513 activity has also been reported (Saggiorato et al., 2012; Avila-Sosa et al., 2012, Perdones et al.,
514 2012 and 2014; Alves Silva et al., 2013; Roselló et al., 2015).

515

516 The antibacterial activity of EOs can be tested *in vitro* using a variety of methods, as reviewed
517 by Burt (2004). The most frequently used have been referred to as disk diffusion method, agar
518 wells method, agar dilution method and broth dilution method. Gómez Estaca et al. (2010)
519 utilized the agar wells method to qualitatively test the antibacterial activity of eight EOs on a
520 wide range of bacteria. In order to test the *in vitro* antimicrobial activity of garlic oil, Pranoto et
521 al. (2005) mixed dilute oil with nutrient broth and bacterial cultures of *E. coli*, *Salmonella*
522 *typhimurium*, *S. aureus* and *B. cereus*. After observing that garlic oil inhibited growth of all
523 bacteria tested, it was incorporated into edible films.

524

525 Since the use of EOs as food preservatives is limited by strong flavouring, inclusion into edible
526 films represents an interesting alternative. However, since the EO forms part of the chemical
527 structure of the film and interacts with the polymer and the plasticizer, the diffusion of the
528 antimicrobial compounds into the product may be reduced (Ruiz-Navajas et al., 2013). The
529 release of antimicrobial agents from the edible films depends on many factors, including
530 electrostatic interactions between the antimicrobial agent and the polymer chains, osmosis,
531 structural changes induced by the presence of the antimicrobial, and environmental conditions
532 (Avila-Sosa et al., 2012). In spite of this, it has been stated that, in comparison with direct
533 application, smaller amounts of antimicrobial agents would be needed when edible films are
534 used as carriers in order to achieve a specific food shelf life due to a gradual release on food
535 surfaces (Ponce et al. 2008).

536

537 Table 3 shows some recent studies dealing with the effect of EO addition on the antimicrobial
538 activity of edible films. Screening of antibacterial activity of edible films is often done by the disk
539 diffusion method, in which a film disk is laid on top of an inoculated agar plate. Ruiz-Navajas et
540 al. (2013) used it to test the antibacterial activity of chitosan-thyme EO edible films, to find that
541 they exhibited excellent *in vitro* antibacterial activity against a variety of Gram-positive and
542 Gram-negative bacteria. Benavides et al. (2012) used the same method and found that
543 alginate-oregano EO films were significantly more effective against Gram-positive than against
544 Gram-negative bacteria. Seydim & Sarikus (2006) incorporated oregano, rosemary and garlic
545 EOs into whey protein films, and found that the most effective antimicrobial films were those
546 incorporated with oregano, whereas the least effective were those including rosemary oil. The
547 same method has been used in other recent studies (Sánchez-Aldana et al., 2015; Jouki et al.,
548 2014; Aliheidari et al., 2013; Emiroğlu et al., 2010; Iturriaga et al., 2012; Pires et al., 2013).

549

550 Apart from the agar disk diffusion method, Shojaee-Aliabadi et al. (2013) used the disk
551 volatilization method in order to examine the antimicrobial activities in vapor phase of
552 carrageenan- *Satureja hortensis* EO films. Disks were cut and laid on the inside surface of the
553 upper lid, with no direct contact between it and the bacteria strains. All tested bacteria were
554 more inhibited by direct contact with the antimicrobial films than by the vapors, and a close
555 relationship was found between the results of the direct-contact and vapor-phase tests.

556

557

558 **6. Application of active food packaging**

559

560 In the last years, many research studies have focused on the application of active food
561 packaging on a broad array of real food systems to the aim of studying their antioxidant and
562 antibacterial effect.

563

564 The overall efficacy of edible films and coatings as oxidation protectors depends not only on
565 their chemical antioxidant ability but also on their oxygen barrier properties. As commented on
566 above, the incorporation of EOs into a polymer matrix may have important consequences on the
567 final structure of the emulsified film, thus affecting its barrier properties and its antioxidant
568 effectiveness (Bonilla et al. 2012a). In order to test the actual capability of edible films and
569 coatings to improve the shelf life of food products prone to oxidation, model and real food
570 systems have been used, as reported by the studies in table 4. These studies have dealt with
571 the application of potentially antioxidant films or coatings including EOs on a wide variety of
572 food systems, namely meat, fish, fruit, vegetables, oils and nuts.

573

574 Sánchez González et al. (2011c) incorporated bergamot EO into HPMC or chitosan edible
575 coatings and tested their efficacy on coated grapes, but no differences caused by coating
576 formulation were observed. Atarés et al. (2010b) used an accelerated rancidity test according to
577 Osés et al. (2008) to evaluate the antioxidant capacity of sodium caseinate films with cinnamon
578 or ginger EOs. Sunflower oil was used as model system, and its peroxide value was quantified
579 over storage time. It was found that all formulations effectively protected the oil against
580 oxidation. Atarés et al. (2011) performed the same test using almond oil protected with HPMC
581 films to test the effect of ginger oil addition. A trend towards a better protection was found in
582 films containing ginger oil, even though this oil caused a significant oxygen permeability
583 increase. The same formulations were applied on roasted almonds as coatings and it was found
584 that almonds stored at intermediate relative humidity were efficiently protected against lipid
585 oxidation due to ginger oil addition.

586

587 Oussalah et al. (2004) stored meat samples covered with milk protein films with oregano or
588 pimento EOs. In this case, the incorporation of EOs did not improve the protection against lipid
589 oxidation. This was inconsistent with previous studies, since phenolic compounds have
590 repeatedly proved their antioxidant power (Lee & Anh, 2003, Nam et al., 2003, Chen et al.
591 1999). However, the ability of oregano oil to inhibit lipid peroxidation was more important than
592 that of pimento oil, which is richest in phenolic content. Gómez-Estaca et al. (2007) elaborated
593 gelatin based edible films, with or without chitosan, and incorporated oregano or rosemary EOs
594 in order to test their effect when applied on cold-smoked sardine. The stability of the product
595 was improved by coating with gelatin based edible films, and films enriched with EOs were able

596 to slow lipid oxidation. Volpe et al. (2015) proved the efficacy of carrageenan edible films
597 incorporated with lemon EO to increase the shelf life of trout fillets, as compared to the films
598 without EO.

599

600 The antimicrobial activity of edible films and coatings incorporated with EOs have also been
601 tested in model and real food systems (Table 5). Sánchez-González et al. (2011c) analyzed the
602 antimicrobial properties of chitosan films with different concentrations of bergamot, lemon and
603 tea tree EOs. Inoculated agar plates were utilized as model food systems and the periodical
604 microbial counts revealed the antimicrobial activity of the films. Sánchez-González et al. (2011c)
605 proved the antimicrobial activity of HPMC or chitosan coatings incorporated with bergamot EO
606 applied on grapes. Similar studies performed on other fruits had similar results, such as
607 Raybaudi-Massilia et al. (2008) on melon and Salvia-Trujillo et al. (2015) on apples. Zinoviadou
608 et al. (2009) formulated whey protein-oregano EO edible films and proved their antimicrobial
609 activity on beef samples over refrigerated storage. Emiroğlu et al. (2010) tested the
610 antimicrobial activity of soy edible films incorporated with thyme and oregano EOs on fresh
611 ground beef patties and found microbial count reductions over refrigerated storage. Wu et al.
612 (2014) proved the antimicrobial activity of gelatin-chitosan films with oregano EO on the storage
613 of carp muscle.

614

615

616

617 **7. Conclusions and future trends**

618

619 Essential oils have been incorporated into edible/biodegradable films and coatings through
620 emulsification, having an impact on the film structural, physical and bioactive properties. EO
621 addition entails discontinuities in the polymer network, leading to changes in the physical
622 properties (typically some weakening, reduced water permeability and increased opaqueness).
623 Aiming to extend shelf-life and add value to the product, EOs can provide the films and coatings
624 with antioxidant and/or antimicrobial properties, depending both on their composition and the
625 interactions with the polymer matrix. The antioxidant activity depends not only on the specific
626 antioxidant activity of the oil compounds but also on the film's oxygen permeability. The
627 incorporation into edible films can promote the antimicrobial capacity of EOs, and the
628 effectiveness of the edible film against microbial growth will depend on the oil nature and the
629 type of microorganism. More work is necessary in this research area in order to optimize the
630 effectiveness of the bioactive incorporated agents.

631

632 In most research works in this area, the incorporation of EO into edible films and coatings has
633 been done through conventional emulsification. The contact between the EO components and
634 the polymer matrix could be improved with nano-emulsification, which would also reduce EO
635 volatilization losses. This technique is emerging as a potential tool in food technology, and it
636 would probably yield EO-polymer nano-emulsions presenting higher resistance to
637 destabilization phenomena than conventional emulsions. Therefore, the close components
638 contact in dry films would probably provide them with improved properties such as increased
639 transparency and reduced water permeability. Recent studies have also proven the improved
640 antimicrobial capacity of EO when encapsulated into nanometric surfactant micelles.

641 Apparently, being trapped into the vesicle of the nanoliposomes, EO can be released slowly,
642 hence improving the antimicrobial activity of the film. Wu et al. (2015) incorporated cinnamon
643 EO nanoliposomes into gelatin films, and found an improvement of the antimicrobial stability
644 along with a decrease in the release rate. Controlled/sustained release is a relevant treat to be
645 attained when incorporating active ingredients into food packaging. In this respect, release
646 studies are becoming more and more important in this area.

647

648 EO can easily be incorporated into polymer aqueous solutions to obtain cast films. However,
649 casting is not readily applicable in packaging industry, unlike compression molding or extrusion,
650 in which high temperature is applied to the material. In this sense, few studies are reported
651 (Pelissari et al., 2011; Valderrama & de Rojas, 2012) and the challenge is how to keep the
652 antimicrobial activity of essential oil in the films during the high temperature of the plastic
653 production processes.

654

655

656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719

8. Acknowledgements

The authors acknowledge the financial support from the Spanish Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia through Project AGL2010- 20694, from Universidad Politécnica de Valencia through Project PAID-06-11-2013 and from Conselleria de Empresa, Universidad y Ciencia (Project GV/2013/152).

9. References

- Acevedo-Fani, A., Salvia-Trujillo, L., Rojas-Graü, M.A., & Martín-Belloso, O. (2015). Edible films from essential-oil-loaded nanoemulsions: Physicochemical characterization and antimicrobial properties. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 47, 168-177.
- Ahmad, M., Benjakul, S., Prodpran, T., & Agustini, T.W. (2012). Physico-mechanical and antimicrobial properties of gelatin film from the skin of unicorn leatherjacket incorporated with essential oils. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 28 (1), 189-199.
- Aliheidari, N., Fazaeli, M., Ahmadi, R., Ghasemlou, M., & Emam-Djomeh, Z. (2013). Comparative evaluation on fatty acid and *Matricaria recutita* essential oil incorporated into casein-based film. *International Journal of Biological Macromolecules*, 56, 69– 75.
- Altioek, D., Altioek, E., & Tihminlioglu, F. (2010). Physical, antibacterial and antioxidant properties of chitosan films incorporated with thyme oil for potential wound healing applications. *Journal of Material Science: Materials in Medicine*, 21 (7), 2227–2236.
- Alves-Silva, J.M., Dias dos Santos, S.M., Pintado, M.E., Pérez-Álvarez J.A., Fernández-López, J., & Viuda-Martos, M. (2013). Chemical composition and in vitro antimicrobial, antifungal and antioxidant properties of essential oils obtained from some herbs widely used in Portugal. *Food Control*, 32 (2), 371–378.
- Arques, J. L., Rodriguez, E., Nunez, M., & Medina, M. (2008). Inactivation of Gramnegative pathogens in refrigerated milk by reuterin in combination with nisin or the lactoperoxidase system. *European Food Research and Technology*, 227(1), 77-82.
- ASTM. (2001). Standard test method for tensile properties of thin plastic sheeting. In standard D882. Annual book of American standard testing methods, (162-170). Philadelphia, PA: American Society for Testing and Materials.
- ASTM (1995) Standard test methods for water vapor transmission of materials. Standard Designations: E96-95. Annual books of ASTM, ASTM, Philadelphia, (406-413).
- ASTM (1999). Standard Test Method for Specular Gloss. Designation (D523). Annual Book of ASTM Standards, vol. 06.01. American Society for Testing and Materials, Philadelphia, PA.
- Atarés, L., De Jesús, C., Talens, P., & Chiralt, A. (2010a). Characterization of SPI-based edible films incorporated with cinnamon or ginger essential oils. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 99, 384-391.
- Atarés, L., Bonilla, J., & Chiralt, A. (2010b). Characterization of sodium caseinate-based edible films incorporated with cinnamon or ginger essential oils. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 100 (4), 678–687.
- Atarés, L., Pérez-Masiá, R., & Chiralt, A. (2011). The role of some antioxidants in the HPMC film properties and lipid protection in coated toasted almonds. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 104 (4), 649–656.
- Avila-Sosa, R., Palou, E., Jiménez-Munguía, M. T., Nevárez-Moorillón, G. V., Navarro-Cruz, A. R., & López-Malo, A. (2012). Antifungal activity by vapor contact of essential oils added to amaranth, chitosan, or starch edible films. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 153, 66-72.
- Azeredo, H. M. C. (2009). Nanocomposites for food packaging applications. *Food Research International*, 42, 1240–1253.
- Benavides, S., Villalobos-Carvajal, R., & Reyes, J.E. (2012). Physical, mechanical and antibacterial properties of alginate film: Effect of the crosslinking degree and oregano essential oil concentration. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 110 (2), 232–239.

720
721 Bertan, L.C., Tanada-Palmu, P.S., Siani, A.C., & Grosso, C.R.F., (2005). Effect of fatty acids and
722 "Brazilian elemi" on composite films based on gelatin. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 19, 73–82.
723
724 Bonilla, J., Atarés, L., Vargas, M., & Chiralt, A. (2012a). Edible films and coatings to prevent the
725 detrimental effect of oxygen on food quality: Possibilities and limitations. *Journal of Food*
726 *Engineering*, 110, 208–213.
727
728 Bonilla, J., Atarés, L., Vargas, M. & Chiralt, A. (2012b). Effect of essential oils and homogenization
729 conditions on properties of chitosan-based films. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 26, 9-16.
730
731 Bonilla, J., Talón, E., Atarés, L., Vargas, M., Chiralt, A (2013). Effect of the incorporation of antioxidants on
732 physicochemical and antioxidant properties of wheat starch–chitosan films. *Journal of Food*
733 *Engineering*, 118, 271–278.
734
735 Burt, S. (2004). Essential oils: their antibacterial properties and potential applications in foods- a review.
736 *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 94, 223-253.
737
738 Burt, S. A., Der Zee, R. V., Koets, A. P., De Graaff, A. M., Van Knapen, F., Gaastra, W., et al. (2007).
739 Carvacrol induces heat shock protein 60 and inhibits synthesis of flagellin in *Escherichia coli*
740 O157:H7. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*, 73, 4484-4490.
741
742 Carter, P. (1971). Spectrophotometric determination of serum iron at the submicrogram level with a new
743 reagent (ferrozine). *Analytical Biochemistry*, 40, 450-458.
744
745 Chen, H. (1995). Functional properties and applications of edible films made of milk proteins. *Journal of*
746 *Dairy Science*, 78, 2563–2583.
747
748 Chen, X., Jo, C., Lee, J. I., & Ahn, D. U. (1999). Lipid oxidation, volatiles, and color changes of irradiated
749 turkey patties as affected by antioxidants. *Journal of Food Science*, 64, 16-19.
750
751 Cuq, B., Aymard, C., Cuq, J.-L., & Guilbert, S., (1995). Edible packaging films based on fish myofibrillar
752 proteins: formulation and functional properties. *Journal of Food Science*, 60 (6), 1369–1374.
753
754 Dashipour, A. Razavilar, V., Hosseini, H., Shojaee-Alibadi, S., German, J.B., Ghanati, K., Khakpour, M., &
755 Khaksar, R. (2015). Antioxidant and antimicrobial carboxymethyl cellulose filmscontaining *Zataria*
756 *multiflora* essential oil. *International Journal of Biological Macromolecules*, 72, 606–613.
757
758 Debeaufort, F., & Voilley, A. (1995). Effects of surfactants and drying rate on barrier properties of
759 emulsified edible films. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 30, 183–190.
760
761 Du, W. X., Olsen, C. W., Avena- Bustillos, R. J., Mchugh, T. H., Levin, C. E., & Friedman, M. (2009).
762 Effects of allspice, cinnamon, and clove bud essential oilsin edible apple films on physical properties
763 and antimicrobial activities. *Journal of Food Science*, 74, 372-378.
764
765 Emiroğlu, Z.K., Yemiş, G.P., Coşkun, B.K., Candoğan, K. (2010). Antimicrobial activity of soy edible films
766 incorporated with thyme and oregano essential oils on fresh ground beef patties. *Meat Science*, 86
767 (2), 283-288.
768
769 Fabra, M.J., Jimenez, A., Atarés, L., Talens, P., & Chiralt, A., (2009). Effect of fatty acids and beeswax
770 addition on properties of sodium caseinate dispersions and films. *Biomacromolecules*, 10, 1500–
771 1507.
772
773 Frankel, E.N., & Meyer, A.S. (2000). The problems of using one- dimensional methods to evaluate
774 multifunctional food and biological antioxidants. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 80,
775 1925-1941.
776
777 Gennadios, A., Weller, C.L., & Gooding, C.H. (1994). Measurement errors in water vapor permeability of
778 highly permeable, hydrophilic edible films. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 21, 395-409.
779
780 Gómez-Estaca, J., Montero, P., Giménez, B., & Gómez-Guillén, M.C. (2007). Effect of functional edible
781 films and high pressure processing on microbial and oxidative spoilage in cold-smoked sardine
782 (*Sardina pilchardus*). *Food Chemistry*, 105, 511–520.
783

784 Gómez-Estaca, J., Bravo, L., Gómez-Guillén, M.C. Alemán, A, & Montero, P (2009a). Antioxidant
785 properties of tuna-skin and bovine-hide gelatin films induced by the addition of oregano and rosemary
786 extracts. *Food Chemistry*, 112, 18-25.

787

788 Gómez-Estaca, J., Giménez, B., Montero, P., & Gómez-Guillén, M.C. (2009b). Incorporation of antioxidant
789 borage extract into edible films based on sole skin gelatin or a commercial fish gelatin. *Journal of*
790 *Food Engineering*, 92, 78-85.

791

792 Gómez-Estaca, J., López de Lacey, A., López-Caballerol, M.E., Gómez-Guillén, M.C., & Montero, P.
793 (2010). Biodegradable gelatin–chitosan films incorporated with essential oils as antimicrobial agents
794 for fish preservation. *Food Microbiology*, 27 (7), 889-896.

795

796 Gontard, N., Duchez, C., Cuq, L.-L., & Guilbert, S. (1994). Edible composite films of wheat gluten and
797 lipids: water vapour permeability and other physical properties. *International Journal of Food Science*
798 *& Technology*, 29, 39–50.

799

800 Gulcin, I., Oktay, M., Kirecci, E., & Kufrevioglu, O.I. (2003). Screening of antioxidant and antimicrobial
801 activities of anise (*Pimpinella anisum* L.) seed extracts. *Food Chemistry*, 83 (3), 371–382.

802

803 Han, J. H., & Floros, J. D. (1997). Casting antimicrobial packaging films and measuring their physical
804 properties and antimicrobial activity. *Journal of Plastic Film and Sheeting*, 13(4), 287–298.

805

806 Haslam, E. (1989). Vegetable tannins revisited. In J. D. Phillipson, D. C. Ayres, & H. Baxter (Eds.), *Plant*
807 *polyphenols* (pp. 230). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

808

809 Hernandez, E. (1994). Edible coating from lipids and resins. In J. M. Krochta, E. A. Baldwin, & M. O.
810 Nisperos-Carriedo (Eds.), *Edible coatings and films to improve food quality* (pp. 279e303). Lancaster:
811 Technomic Publishing.

812

813 Hosseini, M.H., Razavi, S.H., & Mousavi, M.A. (2009). Antimicrobial, physical and mechanical properties of
814 chitosan-based films incorporated with thyme, clove and cinnamon essential oils. *Journal of Food*
815 *Processing and Preservation*, 33, 727–743.

816

817 Hosseini, S.F., Rezaei, M., Zandi, M., & Farahmandghavi, F. (2015). Bio-based composite edible films
818 containing *Origanum vulgare* L. essential oil. *Industrial Crops and Products*, 67, 403–413.

819

820 Hutchings, J. B. (1999). *Food colour and appearance*. Maryland: Aspen Publishers.

821

822 Iturriaga, L., Olabarrieta, I., & Martínez de Marañón, I. (2012). Antimicrobial assays of natural extracts and
823 their inhibitory effect against *Listeria innocua* and fish spoilage bacteria, after incorporation into
824 biopolymer edible films. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 158 (1), 58-64.

825

826 Jouki, M., Yazdi, F.T., Mortazavi, S.A., & Koocheki, A. (2014). Quince seed mucilage films incorporated
827 with oregano essential oil: Physical, thermal, barrier, antioxidant and antibacterial properties. *Food*
828 *Hydrocolloids*, 36, 9-19.

829

830 Karbowski, T., Debeaufort, F., & Voilley, A., (2007). Influence of thermal process on structure and
831 functional properties of emulsion-based edible films. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 21, 879–888.

832

833 Krochta, J.M., & Johnston C.D.M. (1997). Edible and biodegradable films: challenges and opportunities.
834 *Food Technology*, 51 (2), 61–74

835

836 Kunte, L. A., Gennadios, A., Cuppette, S. L., Hanna, M. A., & Weller, C. L. (1997). Cast films from soy
837 protein isolates and fractions. *Cereal Chemistry*, 74, 115-118.

838

839 Lee, E. J. & Ahn, D. U. (2003). Effect of antioxidants on the production of off-odor volatiles and lipid
840 oxidation in irradiated turkey breast meat and meat homogenates. *Journal of Food Science*, 68,
841 1631-1638.

842

843 Limpisophon, K., Tanaka, M., & Osako, K. (2010). Characterisation of gelatin–fatty acid emulsion films
844 based on blue shark (*Prionace glauca*) skin gelatin. *Food Chemistry*, 122(4), 1095–1101.

845

846 Martucci, J.F., Gende, L.B., Neira, L.M., & Ruseckaite, R.A. (2015). Oregano and lavender essential oils
847 as antioxidant and antimicrobial additives of biogenic gelatin films. *Industrial Crops and Products* 71,
848 205-213.

849
850 Miller, K.S. & Krochta, J.M. (1997). Oxygen and aroma barrier properties of edible films: a review. *Trends*
851 *in Food Science and Technology* 8, 228-237.
852
853 McHugh, T. H. (2000). Protein-lipid interactions in edible films and coatings. *Nahrung*, 44, 148-151.
854
855 Mc Hugh, T. H., Avena-Bustillos, R., & Krochta, J. M. (1993). Hydrophobic edible films: Modified procedure
856 for water vapor permeability and explanation of thickness effects. *Journal of Food Science*, 58(4),
857 899–903.
858
859 McHugh, T.H., & Krochta, J.M., (1994). Dispersed phase particle size effects on water vapor permeability
860 of whey protein–beeswax edible emulsion films. *Journal of Food Processing and Preservation*, 18,
861 173–188
862
863 Moradi, M., Tajikb, H., Rohanib, S.M.R., Oromiehiec, A.R., Malekinejadd, H., Aliakbarlub, J., & Hadiane,
864 M. (2012). Characterization of antioxidant chitosan film incorporated with Zataria multiflora Boiss
865 essential oil and grape seed extract. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 46 (2), 477–484.
866
867 Nam, K. C., Min, B. R., Park, K. S., Lee, S. C., & Ahn, D. U. (2003). Effects of ascorbic acid and
868 antioxidants on the lipid oxidation and volatiles of irradiated ground beef. *Journal of Food Science*,
869 68, 1680-1685.
870
871 Norajit, K., Kim, K. M., & Ryu, G. H. (2010). Comparative studies on the characterization and antioxidant
872 properties of biodegradable alginate films containing ginseng extract. *Journal of Food Engineering*,
873 98 (3), 377–384.
874
875 Ojagh, S.M., Rezaei, M., Razavi, S.H., & Hosseini, S.M.H. (2010). Development and evaluation of a novel
876 biodegradable film made from chitosan and cinnamon essential oil with low affinity toward water.
877 *Food Chemistry*, 122, 161–166.
878
879 Oussalah, M., Caillet, S., Salmiéri, S., Saucier, L., & Lacroix, M. (2004). Antimicrobial and antioxidant
880 effects of milk protein-based film containing essential oils for the preservation of whose beef
881 muscle. *Journal of Agriculture and Food Chemistry*, 52, 5598-5605.
882
883 Osés, J., Fernández-Pan, I., Ziani, K., & Maté, J.I. (2008). Use of edible films based on whey protein
884 isolate to protect foods rich in polyunsaturated fatty acids. *European Food Research and Technology*
885 227, 623-628.
886
887 Oyaizu, M. (1988). Antioxidative activity of browning products of glucosamine fractionated by organic
888 solvent and thin-layer chromatography. *Nippon Shokuhin Kogyo Gakkaishi*, 35, 771-775.
889
890 Pelissari, F.M., Yamashita, F., & Grossmann, M.V.E. (2011). Extrusion parameters related to
891 starch/chitosan active films properties. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 46,
892 702-710.
893
894 Perdones, A., Sánchez-González, L., Chiralt, A., & Vargas, M. (2012). Effect of chitosan lemon essential
895 oil coatings on storage-keeping quality of strawberry. *Postharvest Biology and Technology*, 70, 32-
896 41.
897
898 Perdones, A., Vargas, M., Atarés, L., Chiralt, A. (2014) Physical, antioxidant and antimicrobial properties of
899 chitosan-cinnamon leaf oil films as affected by oleic acid. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 36, 256-264.
900
901 Perez-Gago, M.B., & Krochta, J.M. (2001). Lipid particle size effect on water vapour permeability and
902 mechanical properties of whey protein/beeswax emulsion films. *Journal of Agricultural and Food*
903 *Chemistry*, 49, 996–1002.
904
905 Pires, C., Ramos, C., Teixeira, G., Batista, I., Mendes, R., Nunes, L., & Marques, A. (2011).
906 Characterization of biodegradable films prepared with hake proteins and thyme oil. *Journal of Food*
907 *Engineering*, 105, 422-428.
908
909 Pires, C., Ramos, C., Teixeira, B., Batista, I., Nunes, M. L., & Marques, A. (2013). Hake proteins edible
910 films incorporated with essential oils: Physical, mechanical, antioxidant and antibacterial properties.
911 *Food Hydrocolloids*, 30, 224-231.
912
913 Ponce, A. G., Roura, S. I., del Valle, C. E., & Moreira, M. R. (2008). Antimicrobial and antioxidant activities
914 of edible coatings enriched with natural plant extracts: in vitro and in vivo studies. *Postharvest*
915 *Biology and Technology*, 49, 294-300.

916
917 Pranoto, Y., Salokhe, V.M., & Rakshit, S.K. (2005). Physical and antibacterial properties of alginate-based
918 edible film incorporated with garlic oil. *Food Research International*, 38 (3), 267–272.
919
920 Pruneda, E., Peralta-Hernández, J. M., Esquivel, K., Lee, S. Y., Godínez, L. A., & Mendoza, S. (2008).
921 Water vapor permeability, mechanical properties and antioxidant effect of Mexican oregano-soy
922 based edible films. *Journal of Food Science*, 73(6), 488-493.
923
924 Raybaudi-Massilia, R., Mosqueda-Melgar, J., & Martín-Belloso, O. (2008). Edible alginate-based coating
925 as carrier of antimicrobials to improve shelf-life and safety of fresh-cut melon. *International Journal of*
926 *Food Microbiology*, 121, 313-327.
927
928 Re, R., Pellegrini, N., Proteggente, A., Pannala, A., Yang, M., & Rice-Evans, C. (1999). Antioxidant activity
929 applying an improved ABTS radical cation decoloration assay. *Free Radical Biology and Medicine*,
930 26, 1231–1237.
931
932 Roselló, J., Semperea, F., Sanz-Berzosa, I., Chiralt, A., Santamarina, P. (2015). Antifungal activity and
933 potential use of essential oils against *Fusarium culmorum* and *Fusarium verticillioides*. *Journal of*
934 *Essential Oil Bearing Plants*, 18(2), 359-367.
935
936 Ruiz-Navajas, Y., Viuda-Martos, M., Sendra, E., Perez-Alvarez, J.A., & Fernández-López, J. (2013). In
937 vitro antibacterial and antioxidant properties of chitosan edible films incorporated with *Thymus*
938 *moroderi* or *Thymus piperella* essential oils. *Food Control*, 30, 386-392.
939
940 Saggiorato, A.G., Gaio, I., Treichel, H., De Oliveira, D., Cichoski, A.J., & Cansian, R.L. (2012). Antifungal
941 activity of basil essential oil (*Ocimum basilicum* L.): evaluation in vitro and on an Italian-type sausage
942 surface. *Food and Bioprocess Technology*, 5, 378–384.
943
944 Salvia – Trujillo, L., Rojas-Graü, M.A., Soliva-Fortuny, R., & Martín-Belloso, O. (2015). Use of antimicrobial
945 nanoemulsions as edible coatings: Impact on safety and quality attributes of fresh-cut Fuji apples.
946 *Postharvest Biology and Technology*, 105, 8–16.
947
948 Sanchez – Aldana, D., Andrade-Ochoa, S., Aguilar, C.N., & Contreras-Esquivel, J.C., Nevárez-Moorillón
949 G.V. (2015). Antibacterial activity of pectic-based edible films incorporated with Mexican lime
950 essential oil. *Food Control*, 50, 907-912.
951
952 Sánchez-González, L., Vargas, M., González-Martínez, C., Chiralt, A., & Cháfer, M. (2009).
953 Characterization of edible films based on hydroxypropylmethylcellulose and tea tree essential oil.
954 *Food Hydrocolloids*, 23 (8), 2102–2109.
955
956 Sánchez González, L., Cháfer, M., Chiralt, A., & González-Martínez, C. (2010). Physical properties of
957 edible chitosan films containing bergamot essential oil and their inhibitory action on *Penicillium*
958 *italicum*. *Carbohydrate Polymers*, 82 (2) 277-283.
959
960 Sánchez-González, L., Chiralt, A., González-Martínez, C., & Cháfer, M. (2011a). Effect of essential oils on
961 properties of film forming emulsions and films based on hydroxypropylmethylcellulose and chitosan.
962 *Journal of Food Engineering*, 105 (2), 246–253.
963
964 Sánchez-González, L., Cháfer, M., González-Martínez, C. Chiralt, A., Desobry, S (2011b). Study of the
965 release of limonene present in chitosan films enriched with bergamot oil in food simulants. *Journal of*
966 *Food Engineering*, 105,138-143
967
968 Sánchez-González, L., Pastor, C., Vargas, M., Chiralt, A., González-Martínez, C., & Cháfer, M. (2011c).
969 Effect of hydroxypropylmethylcellulose and chitosan coatings with and without bergamot essential oil
970 on quality and safety of cold-stored grapes. *Postharvest Biology and Technology*, 60 (1), 57–63.
971
972 Sánchez-González, L., Cháfer, M., Hernández, M., Chiralt, A., & González-Martínez, C. (2011d)
973 Antimicrobial activity of polysaccharide films containing essential oils. *Food Control*, 22 (8), 1302–
974 1310.
975
976 Seydim A.C., & Sarikus, G. (2006). Antimicrobial activity of whey protein based edible films incorporated
977 with oregano, rosemary and garlic essential oils. *Food Research International*, 39, 639–644.
978
979 Shellhammer, T.H., & Krochta, J.M., (1997). Whey protein emulsion film performance as affected by lipid
980 type and amount. *J. Food Sci.*, 62 (2), 390–394.
981

- 982 Shen, Z., & Kamdem, D.P. (2015). Antimicrobial activity of sugar beet lignocellulose films containing tung
983 oil and cedarwood essential oil. *Cellulose* 22, 2703-2715.
- 984
985 Shiku, Y., Hamaguchi, P. Y., Benjakul, S., Visessanguan, W., & Tanaka, M. (2004). Effect of surimi quality
986 on properties of edible films based on Alaska pollack. *Food Chemistry*, 86(4), 493–499.
- 987
988 Shojaee-Aliabadi, S., Hosseini, H., Mohammadifar, M.A., Mohammadi, A., Ghasemlou, M., Ojagh, S.M.,
989 Hosseini, S.M., & Khaksar R. (2013). Characterization of antioxidant-antimicrobial κ-carrageenan
990 films containing *Satureja hortensis* essential oil. *International Journal of Biological Macromolecules*,
991 52, 116-124.
- 992
993 Siripatrawan, U., & Harte, B.R. (2010). Physical properties and antioxidant activity of an active film from
994 chitosan incorporated with green tea extract. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 24, 770-775.
- 995
996 Sivarooban, T., Hettiarachchy, N. S., & Johnson, M. G. (2008). Physical and antimicrobial properties of
997 grape seed extract, nisin, and EDTA incorporated soy protein edible films. *Food Research*
998 *International*, 41, 781–785.
- 999
1000 Tanaka, M., Ishizaki, S., Suzuki, T., & Takai, R., (2001). Water vapor permeability of edible films prepared
1001 from fish water soluble proteins as affected by lipid type. *J. Tokyo Univ. Fisheries*, 87, 31–37.
- 1002
1003 Teixeira, B., Marques, A., Pires, C., Ramos, C. Batista, I., Saraiva, J.A., & Nunes, M.L. (2014).
1004 Characterization of fish protein films incorporated with essential oils of clove, garlic and origanum:
1005 Physical, antioxidant and antibacterial properties. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 59, 533-539.
- 1006
1007 Tongnuanchan, P., Benjakul, S., & Prodpran, T. (2012). Properties and antioxidant activity of fish skin
1008 gelatin film incorporated with citrus essential oils. *Food Chemistry*, 134 (3), 1571–1579.
- 1009
1010 Valderrama, A.C., & de Rojas, C. (2012). Two different processes to obtain antimicrobial packaging
1011 containing natural oils. *Food Bioprocess Technology*, 5, 2522-2528.
- 1012
1013 Viuda-Martos, M., El Gendy, N. G. S., Sendra, E., Fernández-López, J., El-Razik, K. A. A., El-Sayed, A., et
1014 al. (2010). Chemical composition and antioxidant and anti-listeria activities of essential oils obtained
1015 from some Egyptian plants. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 58, 9063-9070.
- 1016
1017 Viuda-Martos, M., Mohamady, M.A., Fernández-López, J., Abd ElRazik, K.A., Omer, E.A., Pérez-Álvarez,
1018 J.A. et al. (2011). In vitro antioxidant and antibacterial activities of essential oils obtained from
1019 Egyptian aromatic plants. *Food Control*, 22, 1715–1722.
- 1020
1021 Volpe, M.G., Siano, F., Paolucci, M., Sacco, A., Sorrentino, A., Malinconico, M., & Varricchio, E. (2015).
1022 Active edible coating effectiveness in shelf-life enhancement of trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) fillets.
1023 *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 60, 615-622.
- 1024
1025 Ward, G., & Nussinovitch, A. (1996). Gloss properties and surface morphology relationships of fruits.
1026 *Journal of Food Science*, 61 (5), 973–977.
- 1027
1028 Wu, J., Ge, S., Liu, H., Wang, S., Chen, S., Wang, J., Li, J., & Zhang, Q. (2014). Properties and
1029 antimicrobial activity of silver carp (*Hypophthalmichthys molitrix*) skin gelatin-chitosan films
1030 incorporated with oregano essential oil for fish preservation. *Food Packaging and Shelf Life* 2, 7-16.
- 1031
1032 Wu, J. Liu, H., Ge, S., Wang, S., Qin, Z., Chen, L., Zheng, Q., Liu, Q., & Zhang, Q. (2015). The
1033 preparation, characterization, antimicrobial stability and in vitro release evaluation of fish gelatin films
1034 incorporated with cinnamon essential oil nanoliposomes. *Food Hydrocolloids* 43, 427-435.
- 1035
1036 Yanishlieva, N.V., Marinova, E., & Pokorný, J. (2006). Natural antioxidants from herbs and spices.
1037 *European Journal of Lipid Science and Technology*, 108, 776–793.
- 1038
1039 Zhang, H., Hortal, M., Dobon, A., Bermudez, J.M., & Lara-Lledo, M. (2015). The Effect of Active Packaging
1040 on Minimizing Food Losses: Life Cycle Assessment (LCA) of Essential Oil Component-enabled
1041 Packaging for Fresh Beef. *Packaging Technology and Science* 28: 761–774.
- 1042
1043 Zinoviadou, K. G., Koutsoumanis, K. P., & Biliaderis, C. G. (2009). Physico-chemical properties of whey
1044 protein isolate films containing oregano oil and their antimicrobial action against spoilage flora of fresh
1045 beef. *Meat Science*, 82, 338-345.
- 1046
1047 Zivanovic, S., Chi, S., & Draughon, A. F. (2005). Antimicrobial activity of chitosan films enriched with
1048 essential oils. *Journal of Food Science*, 70(1), 45-51.
- 1049

1050 Table 1: Recent papers studying the effect of essential oils on films properties. (HPMC: hydroxypropylmethylcellulose; RT: room temperature)

	Matrix	Essential oils	Matrix: oil proportion	T-%RH conditioning	Physical & microstructural tests								Reference
					SEM	AFM	Tensile	WVP	OP	Colour	Opacity	Gloss	
Polysaccharides	Lignocellulose	Cedarwood	1:0-0.2	23°C-50%	-	-	+	+	-	-	-	-	Shen & Kamdem (2015)
	HPMC	Tea tree	5%:0.5-2%	20°C-54.4%	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	+	Sánchez-González et al. (2009)
	HPMC	Ginger	1:0.1	25°C-33/53%	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	Atarés et al. (2011)
	HPMC, chitosan	Bergamot, lemon, tea tree	1:0.5-2	20°C-54.4%	-	-	+	+	-	-	+	+	Sánchez-González et al. (2011a)
	Chitosan	Cinnamon	2%(w/v):0.4-2% (v/v)	25°C-51%	+	-	+	+	-	+	-	-	Ojagh et al. (2010)
	Chitosan	<i>Zataria multiflora</i> Boiss, grape seed	20:0-20	25°C-52%	-	-	+	+	-	+	-	-	Moradi et al. (2012)
	Chitosan	Bergamot	1:0-3	20°C-54.4%	-	-	+	+	-	-	+	+	Sánchez-González et al. (2010)
	Chitosan	Green tea extract	2%: 0-20% (w/v)	25°C-50%	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	Siripatrawan & Harte (2010)
	Chitosan	Basil, thyme	1:0.5-1	5°C-58%	+	-	+	+	-	-	-	+	Bonilla et al. (2012b)
	Alginate	Garlic	1g:0-0.4ml	-	-	-	+	+	-	+	-	-	Pranoto et al. (2005)
	Alginate	Oregano	1:0-1	25°C-50%	+	-	+	+	-	+	-	-	Benavides et al. (2012)
	Alginate	Ginseng	2%:0.5g/ml	-	+	-	+	+	-	-	+	-	Norajit et al. (2010)
	Alginate	Thyme, lemongrass, sage	3%:1%	25°C-50%	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	Acevedo-Fani et al. (2015)
		κ -carrageenan	<i>Satureja hortensis</i>	1% (w/v): 1-3% (v/v)	25°C-53%	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+
	Fish gelatin and chitosan	<i>Origanum vulgare</i>	1.75%:0.4-1.2%	25°C-50%	+	+	+	+	-	-	+	-	Hosseini et al. (2015)
Proteins	Soy protein	Cinnamon, ginger	1:0.025-0.100	25°C-33%	-	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	Atarés et al. (2010a)
	Na caseinate	Cinnamon, ginger	1:0.025,0.075	25°C-33/53%	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	Atarés et al. (2010b)
	Fish protein	Clove, garlic, origanum	4mg:1 μ l	RT-57%	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	Teixeira et al. (2014)
	Fish skin gelatin	Bergamot, kaffir lime, lemon, lime	1:0.5	25°C-50%	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	Tongnuanchan et al. (2012)
	Gelatin	Bergamot, lemongrass	3:0-20	25°C-50%	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	Ahmad et al. (2012)
	Gelatin	Oregano, lavender	1:0.04-0.12	25°C-65%	+	-	+	+	-	+	-	-	Martucci et al. (2015)
	Hake protein	Thyme	1g: 0.025-0.25ml	RT-57%	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	Pires et al. (2011)
	Hake protein	Citronella, coriander, tarragon, thyme	1g: 0.25 ml	RT-57%	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	Pires et al. (2013)

*corresponding author: loathue@tal.upv.es

1051
1052
1053

Whey protein	Oregano	1:0.1-0.3	25°C-53%	-	-	+	+	-	-	-	-	Zinoviadou et al. (2009)
--------------	---------	-----------	----------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	--------------------------

Table 2: Recent studies dealing with the effect of essential oil addition on the *in vitro* antioxidant properties of films

Matrix	Essential oils	Matrix: oil proportion	Tests						Reference	
			Total phenolics	DPPH	Reducing power	FRAP	Ferrous ion chelating activity	TEAC		
Polysaccharides	Chitosan	<i>Zataria multiflora</i> Boiss, grape seed extract	1:0.25-0.5	+	+	+	-	-	-	Moradi et al. (2012)
	Alginate	Ginseng	2%:0.5g/ml	-	+	+	-	-	-	Norajit et al. (2010)
	Chitosan	Thyme	1:0.25-1	+	+	-	+	+	-	Ruiz-Navajas et al. (2013)
	κ-carrageenan	<i>Satureja hortensis</i>	1% (w/v): 1-3% (v/v)	+	+	-	-	-	-	Shojaee-Aliabadi et al. (2013)
	Carboxymethyl cellulose	<i>Zataria multiflora</i> Boiss	1% (w/v): 1-3% (v/v)	+	+	-	-	-	-	Dashipour et al. (2015)
	Mucilage	Oregano	1%:0-2%	+	+	-	-	-	-	Jouki et al. (2014)
	Chitosan	Green tea extract	2%: 0-20% (w/v)	+	+	-	-	-	-	Siripatrawan & Harte (2010)
	Hake protein	Thyme	1g:0.025-0.25ml	-	+	+	-	-	-	Pires et al. (2011)
	Hake protein	Citronella, coriander, tarragon, thyme	1g:0.25 ml	-	+	+	-	-	-	Pires et al (2013)
	Fish skin gelatin	Bergamot, kaffir lime, lemon, lime	1:0.5	+	+	-	+	-	+	Tongnuanchan et al. (2012)
Proteins	Tuna-skin and bovine-hide gelatin	Oregano, rosemary	1:0.1-5	+	-	-	+	-	+	Gómez-Estaca et al. (2009a)
	Milk protein	Oregano, pimento	5%(w/v):1%(w/v)	+	-	-	-	-	-	Oussalah et al. (2004)

1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1060

1061 Table 3: Recent studies dealing with the effect of essential oil addition on the antimicrobial activity of edible films (*in vitro* tests)

1062

Matrix	Essential oils	Matrix: oil proportion	Microorganisms tested	Reference		
Polysaccharides	Chitosan	Thyme	1:0.25-1	<i>S. marcescens</i> , <i>A. hydrophila</i> , <i>A. faecalis</i> , <i>A. denitrificans</i> , <i>L. innocua</i> .	Ruiz-Navajas et al. (2013)	
	Chitosan	Bergamot	1:0-3	<i>B. thermosphacta</i> , <i>E. coli</i> , <i>L. innocua</i> , <i>L. monocytogenes</i> , <i>P. putida</i> , <i>S. typhimurium</i> , <i>S. putrefaciens</i>	Sánchez González et al. (2010)	
	Chitosan	Clove bud, cinnamon, star anise	2%(w/w):2.5-10%	<i>E. coli</i> , <i>S. aureus</i> , <i>A. oryzae</i> , <i>P. digitatum</i>	Wang et al. (2011)	
	Alginate	Oregano	1:0-1	<i>E. coli</i> , <i>S. Enteritidis</i> , <i>S. aureus</i> , <i>L. monocytogenes</i>	Benavides et al. (2012)	
	Pectic extract	Lime	0.7-1%:0-1g/l	<i>Escherichia coli</i> O157:H7, <i>Salmonella</i> Typhimurium, <i>Staphylococcus aureus</i> , <i>Bacillus cereus</i> and <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i>	Sánchez-Aldana et al. (2015)	
	κ-carrageenan	Satureja hortensis	1% (w/v): 1-3% (v/v)	<i>S. aureus</i> , <i>B. cereus</i> , <i>E. coli</i> , <i>P. aeruginosa</i> , <i>S. typhimurium</i>	Shojaee-Aliabadi et al. (2013)	
	Alginate	Garlic	1g:0-0.4ml	<i>E. coli</i> , <i>S. typhimurium</i> , <i>S. aureus</i> , <i>B. cereus</i>	Pranoto et al. (2005)	
	Chitosan	Cinnamon	2%(w/v):0.4-2% (v/v)	<i>L. monocytogenes</i> , <i>E. coli</i> , <i>L. plantarum</i> , <i>L. sakei</i> , <i>P. fluorescens</i>	Ojagh et al. (2010)	
	Chitosan, CMC	Olive, rosemary, capsicum	2% or 0.75%:1%	<i>L. monocytogenes</i>	Ponce et al. (2008)	
	Mucilage	Oregano	1%:0-2%	<i>L. monocytogenes</i> , <i>Salmonella typhimurium</i> , <i>Bacillus cereus</i> , <i>Yersinia enterocolitica</i> , <i>Pseudomonas aeruginosa</i> , <i>S. aureus</i> , <i>E. coli</i> , <i>E. coli</i> O157:H7, <i>Shewanella putrefaciens</i> , and <i>Vibrio cholera</i>	Jouki et al. (2014)	
	Methylcellulose	Oregano, thyme	1:0.5	<i>P. fluorescens</i> , <i>A. hydrophila/caviae</i> , <i>L. innocua</i>	Iturriaga et al. (2012)	
	Proteins	Gelatin,				
		Whey protein	Oregano, Rosemary, garlic	1:0.2-0.8	<i>L. plantarum</i> , <i>S. enteritidis</i> , <i>E. coli</i> O157:H7, <i>L. monocytogenes</i> , <i>S. aureus</i>	Seydim & Sarikus (2006)
Soy protein		Oregano, thyme	1:0-1	<i>E. coli</i> , <i>S. aureus</i> , <i>E.coli</i> O157:H7, <i>P. aeruginosa</i> and <i>L. plantarum</i>	Emiroglu et al. (2010)	
Sodium caseinate		Matricaria recutita	5%(w/w):1%(v/v)	<i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> , <i>S. aureus</i> and <i>E. coli</i> O157:H7	Aliheari et al. (2013)	
Gelatin alone or with chitosan		Clove	1g/ 0.75 ml	<i>P. fluorescens</i> , <i>L. acidophilus</i> , <i>L. innocua</i> , <i>E. coli</i> .	Gomez-Estaca et al. (2010)	
Hake protein		Citronella, coriander, tarragon, thyme	1g/ 0.25 ml	<i>B. thermosphacta</i> , <i>E. coli</i> , <i>L. innocua</i> , <i>L. monocytogenes</i> , <i>P. putida</i> , <i>S. typhimurium</i> , <i>S. putrefaciens</i>	Pires et al. (2013)	
Gelatin	Bergamot, lemongrass	3:0-20	<i>E. coli</i> , <i>S. typhimurium</i> , <i>P. aeruginosa</i> , <i>L. monocytogenes</i> , <i>S. aureus</i>	Ahmad et al. (2012)		

1063

1064

1065

1066

1067
1068

Table 4: Recent studies dealing with the application of essential oil incorporated edible films/coatings on food systems prone to oxidation

Matrix	Essential oils	Matrix: oil proportion	Food system	tests	Reference	
Polysaccharides	HPMC or chitosan	Bergamot	1:2	Coated cv. Muscatel grapes	- total phenols of grapes - DPPH of grapes	Sánchez-González et al (2011c)
	HPMC	Ginger	1:0.1	Almond oil and coated almonds	-PV of almond oil -PV of coated almonds	Atarés et al. (2011)
	Carrageenan	Lemon	1:1	Trout fillets	Fatty acid profile and lipid quality	Volpe et al. (2015)
	Chitosan, carboxymethyl cellulose	olive, rosemary, onion, capsicum, cranberry, garlic, oreganum	2% or 0.75%:1% 5%:1%	butternut squash	Peroxidase and polyphenoloxidase activities	Ponce et al. (2008)
	Casein					
Proteins	Na caseinate	Cinnamon, Ginger	1: 0.075	Sunflower oil	-PV of sunflower oil	Atarés et al. (2010b)
	Milk protein	Oregano, pimento	5%(w/v):1%(w/v)	Beef muscle	TBA of beef	Oussalah et al.(2004)
	Gelatin (with or without chitosan)	Rosemary, oregano	4%w/v:1.25% or 20%	Smoked sardine	-PV and free fatty acids of muscle -TBA of muscle - total phenol content of muscle - FRAP of the muscle	Gómez- Estaca et al. (2007)

1069
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079

1080 Table 5: Recent studies dealing with the application of essential oil incorporated edible films on the microbial growth in model or real food systems (*in vivo*
 1081 tests)

1082
 1083

Matrix	Essential oils	Matrix: oil proportion	Food system	Tests	Reference	
Polysaccharides	Chitosan	Bergamot	1:0-3	Agar	Counts of <i>P. italicum</i> . on inoculated agar	Sánchez González et al. (2010)
	Chitosan, HPMC	Bergamot, lemon, tea tree	1:0.5-3	Agar	Counts of <i>E.coli</i> , <i>L.monocytogenes</i> and <i>S.aureus</i> on inoculated agar	Sánchez-González et al. (2011d)
	Chitosan	Lemon	1:3	Strawberry	Inoculated with <i>B.cinerea</i> . % fungal decay	Perdones et al. (2012)
	HPMC, Chitosan	Bergamot	1:2	Grape	Periodic microbial counts of total aerobic mesophilic microorganisms, yeast and mould over storage	Sánchez-González et al. (2011c)
	Alginate	Lemongrass	2% (w/v):0.1-1% (v/v)	Apple	Inoculated with <i>E.coli</i> , Counts of psychrophilic bacteria or molds and yeast	Salvia-Trujillo et al. (2015)
	Alginate	Cinnamon, palmarosa and lemongrass	1:0.15-0.35	Melon	Counts of mesophilic, psychrophilic and yeasts and moulds populations in non-inoculated samples. Counts of <i>S. Enteritidis</i> in coated inoculated fresh-cut melon	Raybaudi-Massilia et al. (2008)
	Silver carp skin gelatin-chitosan	oregano, cinnamon and anise	1:0.25-1	Carp	Total aerobic count,	Wu et al. (2014)
Protein	Whey protein	Oregano	1:0.1-0.3	Beef	Total viable count, lactic acid bacteria, pseudomonas	Zinoviadou et al. (2009)
	Soy protein	Oregano, thyme	1:0-1	Ground beef patties	Total viable counts, lactic acid bacterial counts, coliform, Staphylococcus counts, Pseudomonas counts	Emiroglu et al. (2010)
	Gelatin alone or in combination with chitosan	Oregano rosemary	4%w/v:1.25% or 20%	Sardine	Total bacteria counts, H ₂ S-reducing organisms counts, luminescent bacteria counts, Enterobacteriaceae counts	Gómez Estaca et al. (2007)
	Gelatin alone or in combination with chitosan	Clove	0.75 ml/g biopolymer	Cod	Total bacterial counts, H ₂ S producers organisms, luminescent bacteria, pseudomonas, enterobacteriaceae, lactic acid bacteria	Gómez-Estaca et al. (2010)

1084
 1085