

Document downloaded from:

<http://hdl.handle.net/10251/83362>

This paper must be cited as:

Fourquin ., C.; Ferrandiz Maestre, C. (2014). The essential role of NGATHA genes in style and stigma specification is widely conserved across eudicots. *New Phytologist*. 202(3):1001-1013. doi:10.1111/nph.12703.



The final publication is available at

<http://doi.org/10.1111/nph.12703>

Copyright Wiley

Additional Information

1 The essential role of NGATHA genes in style and stigma specification is widely
2 conserved across eudicots

3 Chloé Fourquin and Cristina Ferrándiz¹

4 *Instituto de Biología Molecular y Celular de Plantas, UPV-CSIC, 46022 Valencia, Spain*

5

6 ¹ For correspondence :

7 Cristina Ferrándiz

8 Instituto de Biología Molecular y Celular de Plantas, UPV-CSIC, 46022 Valencia, Spain

9 Tel. +34 963877892; Fax +34 963877859; e-mail: cferrandiz@ibmcp.upv.es

10

11 Total word count for the main body of the text: 5721

12

13 Word count for individual sections are as follows:

- 14 • Introduction, 947
- 15 • Materials and Methods, 765
- 16 • Results, 2035
- 17 • Discussion, 1868
- 18 • Acknowledgements, 106

19

20 The manuscript contains 6 figures (5 in color) and 1 table.

21 Supplementary material consists of 4 figures and 1 table.

22

23 SUMMARY

- 24 • Carpel development and evolution is a central issue for plant biology. The
25 conservation of genetic functions conferring carpel identity has been widely studied
26 in higher plants. However, although genetic networks directing the development of
27 characteristic features of angiosperm carpels such as stigma and style are
28 increasingly known in *Arabidopsis thaliana*, little information is available on the
29 conservation and diversification of these networks in other species. Here, we have
30 studied the functional conservation of NGATHA transcription factors in widely
31 divergent species within the eudicots.
- 32 • We determined by in situ hybridization the expression patterns of NGATHA orthologs
33 in *Eschscholzia californica* and *Nicotiana benthamiana*. VIGS-mediated inactivation
34 of NGATHA genes in both species was performed and different microscopy
35 techniques were used for phenotypic characterization.
- 36 • We found the expression patterns of *EcNGA* and *NbNGA* genes during flower
37 development to be highly similar to each other as well as to those reported for
38 *Arabidopsis* NGATHA genes. Inactivation of *EcNGA* and *NbNGA* also caused severe
39 defects in style and stigma development in both species.
- 40 • These results demonstrate the widely conserved essential role of NGATHA genes in
41 style and stigma specification and suggest that the angiosperm-specific NGATHA
42 genes were likely recruited to direct a carpel specific developmental program.

43

44 Key words: gynoecium, VIGS, *Eschscholzia californica*, *Nicotiana benthamiana*, NGATHA,
45 style and stigma, carpel evolution.

46

47 INTRODUCTION

48 The carpel is the female reproductive organ specific to the angiosperms, or flowering plants.
49 Carpels enclose the ovules, providing numerous benefits in reproductive efficiency over the
50 naked ovules typically present in the gymnosperms. These benefits include support for
51 pollination and incompatibility mechanisms, and, after fertilization, fruit development, which
52 in turn protects the developing seeds and ensures seed dispersal. For these reasons, the
53 carpel was probably of vital importance to the success of the angiosperms (Scutt *et al.*,
54 2006).

55 Carpels are complex structures comprising several specialized characteristic tissues. At
56 maturity, the carpel is basically divided into an apical stigma, a style and a basal ovary. The
57 stigma is composed of cells specialized in the reception and germination of the pollen
58 grains. The style is a highly vascularized tissue containing at its center a transmitting tract
59 through which the pollen tubes grow to reach the ovules. The basal ovary forms a chamber,
60 with single or multiple locules, that prolongs the transmitting tract towards the ovules that
61 develop from placental tissues. At the base of the ovary, the gynophore, a pedicel-like
62 structure, connects the gynoecium to the flower. Despite this basic plan of organization,
63 there is a great diversity in carpel morphology among the angiosperms. The term gynoecium
64 is most commonly used to name all carpels in a flower, that may occur as single carpels,
65 multiple unfused carpels or multiple fused syncarpic carpels (Ferrandiz *et al.*, 2010).

66 Regulatory networks underlying gynoecium patterning have been extensively studied in
67 *Arabidopsis*, and many genes required for the development of the different characteristic
68 tissues within the carpel have already been identified in the last few years. Carpel identity in
69 angiosperms is specified by C-function genes in a widely conserved manner, as defined by
70 the ABC model of floral organ identity (Coen & Meyerowitz, 1991), and in *Arabidopsis* this

71 function is provided by the MADS-box gene *AGAMOUS* (*AG*) (Yanofsky *et al.*, 1990). Once
72 carpel identity is established, the genetic pathways controlling gynoecium patterning and the
73 development of the carpel specific tissues are successively activated (reviewed in Balanzá
74 *et al.*, 2006; Ferrandiz *et al.*, 2010; Reyes-Olalde *et al.*, 2013). Two other transcription factor
75 genes, *CRABS CLAW* (*CRC*) and *SPATULA* (*SPT*) are required to bring about the full carpel
76 development program (Alvarez & Smyth, 1999). *CRC* function is required to ensure the
77 correct growth of the carpels, apical gynoecium closure and style development, while *SPT*
78 function is mainly needed for appropriate development of transmitting tissues. The plant
79 hormone auxin also plays a central role in the establishment of the apical-basal polarity.
80 Nemhauser *et al.* (2000) have proposed that an auxin gradient spans the gynoecium
81 primordium with a maximum at the apex inducing the differentiation of stigma and style, an
82 intermediate level at the central domain promoting the development of the ovary, and a
83 minimum at the bottom specifying gynophore formation. While the exact nature of this
84 gradient has not been experimentally validated yet, it is clear that an apical maximum of
85 auxin present during carpel primordia development is critical to ensure apical gynoecium
86 closure and the development of the style and the stigma (Sundberg & Østergaard, 2009;
87 Larsson *et al.*, 2013). Other transcription factors have also essential roles in the specification
88 of apical tissues. The *NGATHA* (*NGA*) factors are required to direct apical gynoecium
89 development in *Arabidopsis* (Alvarez *et al.*, 2009; Trigueros *et al.*, 2009). The *NGA* genes
90 from *Arabidopsis* (referred to as *AtNGA*) form a small subfamily of four members within the
91 *RAV* clade of the B3-domain transcription factor family and act redundantly to specify style
92 and stigma identity. *AtNGA* function is intimately linked to auxin as it has been shown that
93 auxin-biosynthetic enzymes of the *YUCCA* (*YUC*) family are specifically downregulated in
94 the apical gynoecium domain of *nga* loss-of-function mutants (Trigueros *et al.*, 2009). Also
95 *STYLISH1* (*STY1*) has been identified as a direct activator of *YUC4* in the apical region of
96 the *Arabidopsis* gynoecium (Sohlberg *et al.*, 2006). *STY1* belongs to the *SHI/STY* family of

97 zinc-finger transcription factors, and while single mutants only show subtle defects in style
98 development, this phenotype is gradually enhanced when combined with mutations in other
99 members of the SHI/STY family, leading to a complete absence of style and stigma in *shi/sty*
100 high-order mutant combinations (Kuusk *et al.*, 2002; Kuusk *et al.*, 2006).

101 There is a wealth of evo-devo studies across higher plants mainly focused on questions
102 related to the evolutionary origin of the carpel and in particular, the conservation of the major
103 elements of the ABCE model that specify carpel identity (Bowman *et al.*, 1989; Bradley *et*
104 *al.*, 1993; Pnueli *et al.*, 1994; Mena *et al.*, 1996; Davies *et al.*, 1999; Pan *et al.*, 2010; Yellina
105 *et al.*, 2010; Dreni *et al.*, 2011). However, very little information is available in other
106 angiosperm species about the role of the genetic functions in the lower regulatory
107 hierarchies directing carpel morphogenesis and development. Conducting comparative
108 studies on distant angiosperm species could lead to a better understanding of the different
109 molecular pathways involved in apical carpel development, moreover it could shed some
110 light on the morphological diversity and innovations of gynoecia.

111

112 In this work, we have studied the functional conservation of the small NGA gene family,
113 characterizing the expression patterns and the phenotypes caused by the downregulation of
114 the NGA genes in two distant species, the basal eudicot *Eschscholzia californica* and in the
115 core eudicot asterid lineage, *Nicotiana benthamiana*. This work represents the first study of
116 the role of the NGA genes outside the Brassicaceae and demonstrates a highly conserved
117 NGA function in apical gynoecium development across eudicots. In this context, we also
118 discuss the possible evolution of the different genetic networks known in *Arabidopsis* to take
119 part in the apical gynoecium morphogenesis.

120

121 MATERIAL AND METHODS

122 Plant material and growth conditions

123 *E. californica* and *N. benthamiana* plants were grown in the greenhouse, at 22°C (day) and
124 18°C (night) with a 16-h light/8-h dark photoperiod, in soil irrigated with Hoagland no. 1
125 solution supplemented with oligoelements (Hewitt, 1966). *E. californica* germplasm used in
126 this study (accession PI 599252) was obtained from the National Genetic Resources Program
127 (USA).

128 Cloning and sequence analysis

129 The partial coding sequence of *EcNGA* gene was isolated by RT-PCR on cDNA of young
130 flowers of *E. californica* using the degenerate primers *EcNGAdegFOR*/*EcNGAdegREV*
131 designed from the conserved motifs of *NGA* homologs from other species (B3 domain and
132 the *NGA-II* motif). The 3'end of *EcNGA* was then isolated by RT-PCR using the primers
133 *EcNGAFor2* and *RT* (sequence added to the oligodT primer used for retrotranscription).
134 Finally, the 5'end of *EcNGA* was amplified by TAIL PCR using the random nested oligos
135 *AD1*, *AD2* and *AD3* and the specific nested oligos *EcNGATAIL1*, *EcNGATAIL2*,
136 *EcNGATAIL3*. The full-length CDS sequence has been deposited in Genbank under the
137 accession number KF668646. A BLAST search against *N. benthamiana* draft genome
138 sequence v0.4.4 (solgenomics.net) identified two genomic sequences corresponding to *NGA*
139 homologues that we named *NbNGAa* and *NbNGAb*. The corresponding CDS were cloned,
140 and sequences were deposited in Genbank under the accession numbers KF668647
141 (*NbNGAa*) and KF668648 (*NbNGAb*). The deduced amino acid sequences alignments
142 were analyzed using the Macvector 12.6 software. See table S1 for primer sequences.

143 *In situ* hybridization.

144 RNA *in situ* hybridization with digoxigenin-labeled probes was performed on 8- μ m paraffin
145 sections of *E. californica* and *N. benthamiana* buds as described by (Ferrández *et al.*, 2000).

146 The RNA antisense and sense probes were generated from a 409 bp fragment of the
147 *EcNGA* cDNA (positions 549 to 957), from a 707 bp of the *NbNGAa* cDNA (positions 472 to
148 1178) and from a 698 bp fragment of the *NbNGAb* (positions 589 to 1286). *NbNGAa* and
149 *NbNGAb* probes had 58% identity, a low sequence similarity that likely precluded cross-
150 hybridization. Each fragment was cloned into the pGemT-Easy vector (Promega), and sense
151 and antisense probes were synthesized using the corresponding SP6 or T7 polymerases.

152 Virus-Induced Gene Silencing (VIGS)

153 The same regions of *EcNGA*, *NbNGAa* and *NbNGAb* coding sequence used for *in situ*
154 hybridization were used for the VIGS experiments. In the case of the single gene constructs,
155 a *Xba1* restriction site was added to the 5' end of the PCR fragment and a *BamH1* restriction
156 site was added to the 3' end. The amplicon was digested by *Xba1* and *BamH1* and cloned
157 into a similarly digested pTRV2 vector. For the double gene construction the fragment of
158 *NbNGAb* coding sequence was introduced into the pTRV2-NbNGAa vector using the *EcoRI*
159 restriction site. The four resulting plasmids, pTRV2-*EcNGA*, pTRV2-NbNGAa, pTRV2-
160 NbNGAb and pTRV2-NbNGAa-NbNGAb were confirmed by digestion and sequencing,
161 before being introduced into the *Agrobacterium tumefaciens* strain GV3101. The
162 agroinoculation of *E. californica* seedlings was performed as described (Pabon-Mora *et al.*,
163 2012). The Agroinoculation of *N. benthamiana* leaves was performed as described
164 (Dinesh-Kumar *et al.*, 2003).

165 Quantitative RT-PCR

166 Total RNA was extracted from flowers in anthesis with the RNeasy Plant Mini kit (Qiagen).
167 Four micrograms of total RNA were used for cDNA synthesis performed with the First-Strand
168 cDNA Synthesis kit (Invitrogen) and the qPCR master mix was prepared using the iQTM
169 SYBR Green Supermix (Bio-rad). The primers used to amplify *EcNGA* (qEcNGAFor and

170 qEcNGARev), *NbNGAa* (qNbNGAaFor and qNbNGAaRev), *NbNGAb* (qNbNGAbFor and
171 qNbNGAbRev) and *NbYUC6* (acc. number NbS00044296g0003.1, qNbYUC6For and
172 qNbYUC6Rev) generated products of 81 bp and did not show any cross-amplification.
173 Results were normalized to the expression of the *ACTIN* gene of *E. californica* (according to
174 Yellina et al, 2010) amplified by EcACTFor and EcCTRev, and to the *Elongation Factor 1*
175 (*EF1*) gene of *N. benthamiana* (accession number AY206004), amplified by qNbEF1For and
176 qNbEF1Rev. The efficiency in the amplification of the genes of interest and the
177 corresponding reference gene was similar. Three technical and two biological replicates
178 were performed for each sample. The PCR reactions were run and analyzed using the ABI
179 PRISM 7700 Sequence detection system (Applied Biosystems). See Table S1 for primer
180 sequences.

181 Scanning electron microscopy (SEM) and histology

182 VIGS-treated plants were analyzed by cryoSEM on fresh tissue under a JEOL JSM 5410
183 microscope equipped with a CRIOSEM instrument CT 15000-C (Oxford Instruments,
184 [http://www.oxford-in-
185 struments.com](http://www.oxford-instruments.com)). Young buds were collected for histological analyses,
186 fixed in FAA (3,7% formaldehyde, 5% acetic acid, 50% ethanol) under vacuum and
187 embedded into paraffin. Sections 10 µm thick were stained in 0.2% toluidine blue solution,
188 and observed under a Nikon Eclipse E-600 microscope (<http://www.nikoninstruments.com>).

188 For vascular clearing, anthesis gynoecia from wild-type and VIGS-treated lines were fixed,
189 cleared in chloralhydrate, mounted according to Colombo *et al.*, (2010), and viewed under
190 dark-field microscopy.

191

192 RESULTS

193 *Identification of NGA genes in E. californica and N. benthamiana*

194 The *NGA* genes of *Arabidopsis* belong to the RAV subfamily within the plant-specific
195 superfamily of B3-domain transcription factors (Swaminathan *et al.*, 2008). The RAV
196 subfamily contains two well-supported classes: Class I genes code for one B3 and one AP2
197 DNA-binding domains, while Class II genes do not possess the AP2 domain. *NGA* genes
198 form a separate clade within class II RAV genes, which also contains a sister clade of three
199 genes named *NGA-like* (Romanel *et al.*, 2009). In addition to the B3 domain, all RAV genes
200 share one conserved motif that has been shown to have repressor activity (Ikeda & Ohme-
201 Takagi, 2009). In addition, the four *NGA* genes are characterized by possessing intronless
202 ORFs that encode two additional conserved motifs flanking the RAV-repressor domain that
203 appear to be specific to the *NGA* clade and that we have named as *NGA-I* and *NGA-II* motifs
204 (Trigueros *et al.*, 2009).

205 To search for the homologues of *NGA* in *E. californica* we designed degenerate primers
206 based on the conserved motifs of *NGA* homologues from other species. One putative *NGA*
207 gene, named *EcNGA*, was amplified from cDNA of young buds of *E. californica*. The
208 complete coding sequence of *EcNGA* was subsequently amplified by TAIL PCR and by the
209 use of an adapted oligodT primer. The predicted *EcNGA* protein sequence possessed the
210 typical structure of the *NGA* clade, including a single B3 domain, the RAV-repressor domain
211 and *NGA-I* and *NGA-II* motifs (Fig. 1). Repeated attempts to identify additional *NGA* genes
212 from *E. californica* were unsuccessful. This fact, reinforced by the presence in the database of
213 a single *NGA* gene from *Aquilegia caerulea*, a phylogenetically related ranunculid species
214 for which extensive EST databases are available (Kramer & Hodges, 2010), strongly
215 suggested the existence of only one *NGA* gene in the *E. californica* genome.

216 To identify *NGA* homologues from *N. benthamiana* we performed a BLAST search against
217 the draft genome sequence that has been released recently (Bombarely *et al.*, 2012). This

218 search retrieved two genomic regions that encoded intronless ORFs with the predicted
219 structure of *NGA* genes, comprising the B3 domain, the RAV-repressor domain and the
220 *NGA*-I and *NGA*-II motifs. From genomic sequences, primers were designed to isolate the
221 corresponding ORFs from floral cDNA, which we named as *NbNGAa* and *NbNGAb*.

222

223 *NGA* gene expression patterns are highly similar in *Arabidopsis*, *E. californica* and *N.*
224 *benthamiana*

225 To characterize the expression pattern of the *NGA* genes identified in *E. californica* and *N.*
226 *benthamiana* we performed RNA *in situ* hybridization on young flower buds. *EcNGA*
227 transcripts could be detected in the developing flowers from very early stages of
228 development. In stage 3 *E. californica* buds (according to Becker *et al*, 2005), *EcNGA*
229 transcripts were detected in all flower organ primordia except the expanded sepals (Fig. 2a).
230 In stage 5 *EcNGA* accumulated in the apical part of the developing petals, stamens and
231 carpels (Fig.2b). A similar pattern was observed in stage 6 with an additional expression
232 domain in the placental region (Fig.2c). At later stages, *EcNGA* was mostly present in the
233 developing ovules and in the growing apical gynoecium, with a remaining expression at the
234 distal end of the petals (Fig. 2d-e). This expression pattern was very similar to those
235 described for the four *Arabidopsis* *NGA* genes throughout flower development (Alvarez *et al*,
236 2009; Trigueros *et al*, 2009).

237 In *N. benthamiana*, *NGA* genes showed highly similar expression patterns, which also
238 paralleled those described for *AtNGA* and *EcNGA* genes. In stage 2 buds (as defined in
239 Mandel *et at.*, 1992), the *NbNGA* genes were detected in the floral meristem and more
240 strongly in the distal end of the developing sepal primordium (Fig.2f). This distal expression
241 was observed at later stages in all floral organ primordia. (Fig.2g). At later stages, the

242 *NbNGA* expression was mainly detected in the apical gynoecium, the placentae and the
243 anthers (Fig. 2h-i). In the preanthesis mature flower, *NbNGAa* and *NbNGAb* were almost
244 exclusively expressed in the transmitting tract and in the developing ovules (Fig. 2j) (Fig.
245 S1).

246 Since *AtNGA* genes are also expressed in vegetative tissues, we compared by quantitative
247 PCR the expression levels of *EcNGA*, *NbNGAa* and *NbNGAb* in leaves, young floral buds
248 and anthesis flowers (Fig S2). We found *EcNGA* and *NbNGA* genes to be expressed in all
249 analyzed tissues, similarly to what had been described for *AtNGA* genes (Trigueros et al,
250 2009)

251 In summary, *EcNGA*, *NbNGA* and *AtNGA* genes showed remarkably similar expression
252 patterns during flower development, mostly confined to the distal end of developing floral
253 organs, placentae and ovule primordia, and in the apical gynoecium at stages where style
254 and stigma formation takes place.

255

256 *Silencing of EcNGA in E. californica using VIGS greatly alters style and stigma development*

257 Flower morphogenesis in *E. californica* has been previously described (Becker *et al.*, 2005).
258 The flower at anthesis (stage 11) comprises a first whorl of two sepals fused into a caplike
259 structure, four bright orange petals arranged in two whorls, and several whorls of stamens in
260 variable number (from 18 to 34). The central pistil consists of two fused carpels with
261 placentae developing internally to the carpel fused margins. The pistil comprises a cylindrical
262 ovary, a short style and four long stigmatic protrusions (Fig.3a and Fig. S4). These stigmatic
263 protrusions originate at stage 7, when two stylar lobes start to grow above the valves and
264 then two shorter ones develop above the placentae (Fig. S2). These protrusions elongate

265 rapidly until post-anthesis stages, and are covered by stigmatic papillae, which also line the
266 hollow internal style and the placentae (Fig 3i-j, Fig 4a-g, Fig. S4).

267 The expression pattern of *EcNGA* suggested that this gene could have similar roles in flower
268 development to those of *AtNGA* genes in *Arabidopsis*. To investigate the function of *EcNGA*
269 in *E. californica* we used Virus Induced Gene Silencing (VIGS) to reduce its transcript levels.
270 This method results in transitory downregulation of a specific gene via modified plant
271 viruses and it has been shown to efficiently direct the degradation of endogenous mRNAs in
272 *E. californica* and other species (Ratcliff *et al.*, 2001; Constantin *et al.*, 2004; Hileman *et al.*,
273 2005; Wege *et al.*, 2007).

274 For our analyses, a total of 120 *E. californica* seedlings were inoculated with the TRV2-
275 *EcNGA* construction (Table 1). To evaluate the efficiency of the VIGS treatment we
276 measured by quantitative RT-PCR the level of expression of *EcNGA* on flowers from 5
277 different treated plants showing altered phenotypes. In these plants expression of *EcNGA*
278 was reduced to 15-50% of wildtype level (Fig. 3o), indicating that the VIGS treatment was
279 highly effective. To detect morphological abnormalities associated with *EcNGA*
280 downregulation, we chose the three first flowers of each inoculated plant. No visible
281 phenotypes were observed in sepals, petals or stamens. However, 18% of the flowers
282 displayed pistils with defects in style and stigma development. The weakest phenotypes
283 corresponded to gynoecia with one or two small supplementary stigmatic protrusions (Fig.
284 3h). Intermediate phenotypes were characterized by the reduction and altered distribution of
285 the stigmatic papillae (Fig. 3c,l) and the frequent proliferation of misshapen styler protrusions
286 of irregular length that precluded styler closure (Fig.3d,e,f,k). The most severely affected
287 gynoecia completely lacked stigmatic tissue and most styler lobes, with ovaries terminating
288 apically in irregular indented structures (Fig.3g,h,m,n). Histological sections of *EcNGA*-VIGS
289 pistils showing intermediate to strong phenotypes revealed that the papillar cells lining the

290 internal style were severely reduced, leaving an open gap along the style, but were not
291 significantly affected in the placental domains (Fig 4h,n). Vascular strands, which in wildtype
292 pistils run as parallel veins along the stigmatic protrusions, were defective in the VIGS-
293 treated gynoecia, bifurcating abnormally at the distal end of the apical lobes (Fig 4o-q).

294

295 *NbNGAa and NbNGAb are both involved in carpel and perianth development*

296 We used again VIGS-mediated downregulation of gene expression to investigate the role of
297 the two *NGA* genes identified in *N. benthamiana*. We generated three different TRV
298 constructs designed to either specifically inactivate *NbNGAa*, *NbNGAb* or both genes
299 simultaneously. Twelve plants were inoculated with each construct (Table 1). To evaluate
300 the efficiency and the specificity of each treatment, we measured the level of expression of
301 *NbNGAa* and *NbNGAb* by quantitative RT-PCR on flowers from five different treated plants.
302 *NbNGAa* was strongly reduced in the NbNGAa-VIGS flowers whereas the expression of
303 *NbNGAb* was not significantly altered, indicating that the TRV2-NbNGAa construct was gene
304 specific (Fig 5o). Likewise, the expression of *NbNGAb* was significantly reduced in the
305 NbNGAb-VIGS flowers compared to the wild type, whereas the expression of *NbNGAa* was
306 practically unaffected. Quantitative RT-PCR in flowers of NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS plants
307 confirmed that both genes were strongly downregulated (Fig. 5o).

308 The wild type flower of *N. benthamiana* at anthesis is composed of a first whorl of five
309 sepals, a second whorl of five white petals fused in a long tubular corolla, a third whorl of five
310 stamens whose long filaments are adnatly fused to the petals, and finally a bicarpellate
311 gynoecium in the central fourth whorl. The *N. benthamiana* mature pistil comprises a short
312 bilocular ovary with central placentation and a very long and thin style of approx. 3 cm,
313 capped by a round wet stigma (Fig.5a,e,j).

314 In plants inoculated with the TRV2-NbNGAa vector, 63% of the flowers displayed an
315 abnormal phenotype in the apical part of the pistil (Fig. 5b,f,k; Table 1). Style length was
316 reduced (from a few mm to 1 cm shorter) and the stigma was not properly fused leaving a
317 small central hole. In some cases the top part of the style and the stigma were bent (Fig.
318 5f,k). In histological sections we could observe that the transmitting tissue of the internal
319 style was greatly reduced, leaving a hollow canal (Fig. 6c,d). Vascular development in the
320 affected styles was also perturbed, with stelar veins terminating below the stigma instead of
321 reaching the apical end as in the wildtype pistil (Fig. 6h,i). TRV2-NbNGAb treatment
322 produced similar effects in gynoecium development, only stronger and in a higher proportion
323 (Table 1). 74% of the NbNGAb-VIGS flowers showed affected pistils (Fig 5c,h). Style length
324 was greatly reduced, up to 30-50% of its wildtype length, strong style and stigma fusion
325 defects were frequent, and the transmitting tract at the internal style was severely reduced
326 (Fig.5h, Fig 6e). Stelar veins showed irregular patterning and terminated at varying lengths
327 within the style (Fig 6j) Finally, in plants where both *NbNGA* genes were downregulated, the
328 gynoecium phenotype was greatly enhanced. 83% of the NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS gynoecia
329 completely lacked style development and the ovary directly terminated in a distorted stigma
330 at the apical end (Fig. 5j,l. Fig. 6f,g; Table 1).

331 In addition to gynoecium phenotypes, the NbNGA-VIGS treatment also affected the
332 development of other floral organs. The three TRV2-NGA constructs produced similar defects
333 in sepal development, with around 60% of the flowers in the treated plants developing
334 serrated sepals (Fig. 5n). In the NbNGAb-VIGS plants an additional phenotype was
335 observed in 38% of the flowers: at anthesis, petal length was reduced and the corolla did not
336 fully expand (Fig. 5c). This phenotype was greatly enhanced by TRV2-NbNGAa-NbNGAb
337 treatment, as 53% of the flowers at anthesis displayed a closed corolla with short greenish
338 petals (Fig. 5d).

339 In summary, the phenotypes of NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS flowers strongly resembled those
340 of *nga* quadruple mutants in *Arabidopsis*, which also lack style and stigma development and
341 develop short green petals and short sepals (Alvarez *et al.*, 2009; Trigueros *et al.*, 2009).

342 To test whether *NbNGA* downregulation also produced similar effects on putative NGA
343 targets identified in *Arabidopsis*, we analyzed the expression of a *N. benthamiana* *YUC* gene
344 in the apical domain of NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS pistils. *YUC* genes encode flavin
345 monooxygenases involved in auxin synthesis and it has been previously reported that *nga*
346 mutants fail to activate the expression of several *YUC* genes in the apical gynoecium
347 (Trigueros *et al.*, 2009), which likely affects auxin synthesis and accumulation in *nga* pistils.
348 Through BLAST search in the *N.benthamiana* genome, we identified a sequence highly
349 related to *AtYUC2* and *AtYUC6*. Quantitative RT-PCR on cDNA extracted from excised
350 styles and stigmas of preanthesis *N. benthamiana* flowers showed a significant reduction of
351 the expression of this *YUC* gene in the NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS apical gynoecia (Fig. 6k),
352 strongly supporting the conserved role in style morphogenesis of *NGA* genes and their
353 downstream effectors involved in auxin synthesis.

354

355 DISCUSSION

356 In this work, we have studied the functional conservation of a small gene family which has
357 been shown to be essential for style and stigma development in *Arabidopsis*, characterizing
358 the expression patterns and the phenotypes caused by the downregulation of the *NGA*
359 genes in two distant species, the basal eudicot *E. californica* and the solanaceaeous core
360 eudicot *N. benthamiana*. This work represents the first study of the role of the *NGA* genes
361 outside the Brassicaceae and demonstrates a highly conserved NGA function in apical
362 gynoecium development.

363

364 *NGA function is conserved across eudicots.*

365 The four *NGA* genes of *Arabidopsis* act redundantly to direct the development of the apical
366 domain of the gynoecium, as *nga* quadruple mutants completely lack stigma and style and
367 have very reduced transmitting tissues in the apical regions. This redundancy is likely based
368 both in the similar activities of the *NGA* proteins, as revealed by the equivalent phenotypes
369 caused by the overexpression of any of them in *Arabidopsis*, and the similarity of their
370 spatio-temporal expression patterns throughout plant development (Alvarez *et al.*, 2009;
371 Trigueros *et al.*, 2009). In this study we have characterized a single *NGA* gene from the
372 basal eudicot *E. californica* and two *NGA* genes in the core eudicot *N. benthamiana*,
373 *NbNGAa* and *NbNGAb*. Our studies have shown a remarkable conservation of *NGA*
374 expression patterns in flowers of these two species and of *Arabidopsis*, each of them
375 belonging to a different clade within the eudicots, mainly associated with the distal domains
376 of growing floral organ primordia, the ovules and the apical domain of the gynoecium in the
377 preanthesis flower. These observations strongly indicate that the regulatory regions of these
378 genes, even across distant taxa and after several independent gene duplication events,
379 have not diverged significantly and probably contain multiple redundant elements that confer
380 robustness to the corresponding expression patterns.

381 Silencing of the *NGA* homologues by VIGS technology further demonstrates their conserved
382 key role in style and stigma development both in *E. californica* and *N. benthamiana*. The
383 pistils of *E. californica* VIGS-EcNGA plants displayed a range of phenotypic defects that
384 strongly affected the development of the apical domain and in extreme cases caused the
385 absence of stigma, style and apical transmitting tissues and produced altered vascular
386 development. Very similar phenotypes were observed in *N. benthamiana* plants when the
387 two *NbNGA* genes were downregulated. Thus, *NGA* loss-of-function in *Arabidopsis*, *E.*

388 *californica* and *N. benthamiana* precluded the development of the same set of tissues in the
389 gynoecium, despite the evolutionary distance of these three eudicot species.

390 In addition to their role in gynoecium development, the *NGA* genes in *Arabidopsis* have a
391 more general function in the regulation of lateral organ growth. In the *nga* quadruple
392 mutants, sepals and petals are shorter and wider than in wildtype flowers and rosette leaves
393 are also wider and more serrated, consistent with the reported expression of *AtNGA* genes
394 in the distal domain of growing leaves and floral organs (Alvarez *et al.*, 2009; Trigueros *et*
395 *al.*, 2009). In this work, we have shown that the expression of *NGA* genes in distal floral
396 organ primordia is conserved in *E. californica* and *N. benthamiana*. Moreover,
397 downregulation of *NbNGA* genes resulted in shorter serrated perianth organs, indicating that
398 the role of *NGA* genes in floral organ growth is also conserved. No phenotypic defects were
399 observed in the leaves of *N. benthamiana* VIGS-treated plants or in perianth or leaves of *E.*
400 *californica*, which may suggest that *NGA* genes do not share these roles with their
401 *Arabidopsis* homologues. However, it seems more likely that the residual activity of *NGA*
402 genes in the inoculated *E. californica* or *N. benthamiana* plants could be sufficient to
403 preclude leaf phenotypic defects. Actually, while double or triple mutant combination of *nga*
404 mutations in *Arabidopsis* already display conspicuous phenotypes in style and stigma
405 development, only quadruple mutants have obvious defects in perianth or leaf development,
406 supporting the **idea of the gynoecium functioning as the “canary in a coalmine”** whereby
407 carpel development could be especially sensitive to minor defects in patterning factors that
408 do not strongly affect the development of other organs (Dinneny & Yanofsky, 2005).

409 We have also shown that the specific inactivation of each of the *NbNGA* genes caused
410 much weaker but similar phenotypic defects, demonstrating the dosage-dependent
411 functional redundancy of *NbNGAa* and *NbNGAb* in *N. benthamiana*, another feature also
412 shared by the *AtNGA* genes. Thus, *NGA* genes in *Arabidopsis* and *N. benthamiana* appear

413 to have retained both regulatory regions and protein activities, undergoing little or no sub- or
414 neofunctionalization. Published phylogenies of the B3 transcription factor family, the likely
415 presence of a single gene in *E. californica* or *Aquilegia*, as well as the copy number and
416 position of the *NGA* genes in the *Arabidopsis* genome are consistent with the existence of a
417 single ancestor of *NGA* genes previous to monocot/dicot divergence. Interestingly, database
418 mining in species for which genome sequence is available indicate that *NGA* homologues
419 are frequently found in several copies (at least three in *Oryza sativa*, two in *Populus*
420 *thricocarpa* or two in *Vitis vinifera*; Alvarez *et al.*, 2009; Trigueros *et al.*, 2009). The retention
421 of multiple copies of *NGA* genes in different species from distant taxa, together with the high
422 degree of conservation of both regulatory sequences and function across and within species
423 that we have shown in this work, may suggest that maintaining multiple copies of mostly
424 equivalent *NGA* proteins could be beneficial for reproductive success, maybe buffering
425 against dominant-negative mutations and/or ensuring the availability of *NGA* factors for
426 participation in multimeric transcriptional complexes.

427

428 *The NGA genes and the evolution of carpel structures.*

429 Carpel identity in angiosperms is specified by C-function genes, as defined by the ABCE
430 model of floral organ identity. Members of the AGAMOUS (AG) lineage of the MADS box
431 gene family have been shown to carry out this function across angiosperms (Bowman *et al.*,
432 1989; Bradley *et al.*, 1993; Pnueli *et al.*, 1994; Mena *et al.*, 1996; Davies *et al.*, 1999; Pan *et*
433 *al.*, 2010; Yellina *et al.*, 2010; Dreni *et al.*, 2011), but putative AG orthologs have also been
434 found in gymnosperms, where they are expressed in reproductive organs like their
435 angiosperm counterparts (Rutledge *et al.*, 1998; Jager *et al.*, 2003; Zhang *et al.*, 2004; Groth
436 *et al.*, 2011). Thus, the C-function appears to be conserved since the common ancestor of
437 seed plants and predates the origin of the angiosperm carpel, suggesting that additional

438 gene functions must have evolved to specify the distinctive features of this organ.

439 In this work we have demonstrated the conserved essential role of *NGA* genes in the
440 specification of style and stigma, distinctive characters of angiosperm carpels. Phylogenies
441 of B3 domain transcription factors show that class I genes from the RAV subfamily (those
442 encoding both AP2 and B3 domains) are already present in bryophytes. In contrast, *NGA*
443 genes, which belong to class II and are defined by the single B3 domain and the three
444 characteristic C-t motifs, can only be found in angiosperms and likely originated by
445 duplication of AP2-B3 RAV genes and subsequent loss of the AP2 domain. Interestingly,
446 *NGA* genes in *Arabidopsis* have been listed as putative targets of AG (Gomez-Mena *et al.*,
447 2005). We can thus speculate that angiosperm specific RAV-derived *NGA* genes could have
448 been recruited downstream of the C-function and by neofunctionalization they could have
449 provided a new role in the specification of style, stigma and transmitting tissues.

450

451 *A conserved program for style and stigma development?*

452 Molecular studies in *Arabidopsis* have shown that apical gynoecium patterning is a complex
453 process where many genes with highly redundant functions are involved, and that at least
454 partially depends on YUC-mediated auxin biosynthesis at the distal end of the growing pistil
455 primordium (Cheng *et al.*, 2006; Sohlberg *et al.*, 2006; Trigueros *et al.*, 2009). Although
456 comparative studies in distant angiosperm species assessing conservation of these relevant
457 gene functions for style and stigma development are still scarce, the results presented here
458 as well as other published studies suggest that the genetic network operating in *Arabidopsis*
459 might be broadly conserved.

460 First, our work highlights the central role of the *NGA* genes in style and stigma development
461 across eudicots. Moreover, we have shown that in *N. benthamiana* *YUC* expression in the

462 apical gynoecium is also reduced by *NGA* downregulation, suggesting that the *NGA-YUC-*
463 auxin module could be part of a conserved network directing style and stigma
464 morphogenesis.

465 Likewise, in *Arabidopsis*, the *SHY/STY* genes have been shown to participate in these
466 functions and to be intimately related to the *NGA* factors (Alvarez *et al.*, 2009; Trigueros *et*
467 *al.*, 2009). In addition to displaying similar mutant phenotypes, *AtNGA* and *SHY/STY* genes
468 share similar expression patterns and, when simultaneously over-expressed, *NGA3* and
469 *STY1* are able to direct ectopic style development (Alvarez *et al.*, 2009; Trigueros *et al.*,
470 2009). Moreover, *STY1* is a direct activator of *YUC4* (Sohlberg *et al.*, 2006; Eklund *et al.*,
471 2010a), and this connection of *SHY/STY* genes with auxin biosynthesis pathways seems
472 largely conserved among land plants, as it has been demonstrated by the reduction in auxin
473 levels and the reproductive organ developmental phenotypes caused by *SHY/STY*
474 inactivation in the bryophyte *Physcomitrella patens* (Eklund *et al.*, 2010b; Landberg *et al.*,
475 2013). While the specific role of *SHY/STY* in carpel development has not been explored in
476 detail in species other than *Arabidopsis*, it has been described recently in the monocot
477 *Hordeum vulgare* that mutants in the *short awn2* gene, a member of the *SHY/STY* family,
478 show defects in style and stigma morphology (Yuo *et al.*, 2012). Thus, it would appear that
479 *SHY/STY* genes could also have a conserved function both in driving auxin synthesis as well
480 as style and stigma development.

481 Other factors with putatively conserved roles in apical gynoecium development have also
482 been described. *CRC* orthologs have been identified in a wide range of angiosperm species
483 (Yamaguchi *et al.*, 2004; Fourquin *et al.*, 2005; Lee *et al.*, 2005; Orashakova *et al.*, 2009).
484 *CRC* belongs to the *YABBY* family, specific to seed plants. Phylogenetic studies on the
485 family are still partial due to the scarcity of gymnosperm sequences, but they suggest that
486 *CRC* genes would be specific to angiosperms (Yamada *et al.*, 2011; Bartholmes *et al.*, 2012).

487 In general, the characterization of expression patterns and of phenotypic defects associated
488 with downregulation of *CRC* orthologs are consistent with an ancestral role in conferring the
489 identity to carpel specific tissues in angiosperms, including style and stigma, while other
490 roles such as nectary specification could have been derived in eudicots (Yamaguchi *et al.*,
491 2004; Lee *et al.*, 2005; Fourquin *et al.*, 2007; Ishikawa *et al.*, 2009; Yamada *et al.*, 2011).
492 Finally, in dicot species, some PLE-subclade MADS-box genes also have been recently
493 shown to have a conserved role in style and stigma development (Colombo *et al.*, 2010;
494 Fourquin & Ferrandiz, 2012; Heijmans *et al.*, 2012).

495 All this evidence suggests that the major factors involved in style and stigma differentiation
496 identified in *Arabidopsis* may form an ancient module with conserved functions, where some
497 ancestral genetic routes, like the SHY/STY-auxin pathway already present in bryophytes,
498 might have been coopted to direct style and stigma development by the acquisition of
499 angiosperm-specific functions like *CRC* or *NGA*, although much deeper comparative
500 analyses of these functions in evolutionary meaningful species will have to be undertaken to
501 confirm this hypothesis.

502

503 ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

504 This work was supported by the Spanish Ministerio de Ciencia e Innovación (grant nº.
505 BIO2009–09920 to C.Fe.), the Spanish Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad (grant nº
506 BIO2012-32902 to C.Fe) and the Generalitat Valenciana (grant nº ACOMP/2012/099 and
507 BEST/2009/054 to C.Fe.), We thank David Parejo and Victoria Palau (IBMCP) for
508 greenhouse support, Marisol Gascón (IBMCP) for technical advice in microscopy, Amy Litt
509 and Natalia Pabón-Mora (New York Botanical Gardens, Bronx, NY, USA) for providing VIGS
510 plasmids and technical advice, and Barbara Ambrose (NYBG) for critical reading of the

511 manuscript. *E. californica* germplasm used in this study was obtained from the National
512 Genetic Resources Program (USA).

REFERENCES

- Alvarez J, Smyth DR. 1999. CRABS CLAW and SPATULA, two Arabidopsis genes that control carpel development in parallel with AGAMOUS. *Development* 126(11): 2377-2386.
- Alvarez JP, Goldshmidt A, Efroni I, Bowman JL, Eshed Y. 2009. The NGATHA distal organ development genes are essential for style specification in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* 21(5): 1373-1393.
- Balanzá V, Navarrete M, Trigueros M, Ferrándiz C. 2006. Patterning the female side of Arabidopsis: the importance of hormones. *J Exp Bot* 57(13): 3457-3469.
- Bartholmes C, Hidalgo O, Gleissberg S. 2012. Evolution of the YABBY gene family with emphasis on the basal eudicot *Eschscholzia californica* (Papaveraceae). *Plant Biol* 14: 11-26.
- Becker A, Gleissberg S, Smyth D. 2005. Floral and Vegetative Morphogenesis in California Poppy (*Eschscholzia californica* Cham.). *Int J Plant Sci*. 166(4):537-555.
- Bombarely A, Rosli HG, Vrebalov J, Moffett P, Mueller LA, Martin GB. 2012. A draft genome sequence of *Nicotiana benthamiana* to enhance molecular plant-microbe biology research. *Mol Plant Microbe Interact* 25(12): 1523-1530.
- Bowman JL, Smyth DR, Meyerowitz EM. 1989. Genes directing flower development in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Cell* 1: 37-52.

- Bradley D, Carpenter R, Sommer H, Hartley N, Coen E. 1993. Complementary floral homeotic phenotypes result from opposite orientations of a transposon at the *plena* locus of *Antirrhinum*. *Cell* 72: 85-95.
- Cheng Y, Dai X, Zhao Y. 2006. Auxin biosynthesis by the YUCCA flavin monooxygenases controls the formation of floral organs and vascular tissues in *Arabidopsis*. *Genes Dev* 20(13): 1790-1799.
- Coen ES, Meyerowitz EM. 1991. The war of the whorls: genetic interactions controlling flower development. *Nature* 353(6339): 31-37.
- Colombo M, Brambilla V, Marcheselli R, Caporali E, Kater M, Colombo L. 2010. A new role for the SHATTERPROOF genes during *Arabidopsis* gynoecium development. *Dev Biol* 337(2): 294-302.
- Constantin GD, Krath BN, MacFarlane SA, Nicolaisen M, Johansen IE, Lund OS. 2004. Virus-induced gene silencing as a tool for functional genomics in a legume species. *Plant J* 40(4): 622-631.
- Davies B, Motte P, Keck E, Saedler H, Sommer H, Schwarz-Sommer Z. 1999. PLENA and FARINELLI: redundancy and regulatory interactions between two *Antirrhinum* MADS-box factors controlling flower development. *EMBO J* 18(14): 4023-4034.
- Dinesh-Kumar SP, Anandalakshmi R, Marathe R, Schiff M, Liu Y. 2003. Virus-induced gene silencing. *Methods in molecular biology (Clifton, NJ)* 236: 287-294.
- Dinneny JR, Yanofsky MF. 2005. Drawing lines and borders: how the dehiscent fruit of *Arabidopsis* is patterned. *Bioessays* 27(1): 42-49.
- Dreni L, Pilatone A, Yun D, Erreni S, Pajoro A, Caporali E, Zhang D, Kater MM. 2011. Functional Analysis of All AGAMOUS Subfamily Members in Rice Reveals Their Roles in Reproductive Organ Identity Determination and Meristem Determinacy. *Plant Cell* 23(8): 2850-2863.

- Eklund DM, Ståldal V, Valsecchi I, Cierlik I, Eriksson C, Hiratsu K, Ohme-Takagi M, Sundström JF, Thelander M, Ezcurra I, Sundberg E. 2010a. The *Arabidopsis thaliana* STYLISH1 Protein Acts as a Transcriptional Activator Regulating Auxin Biosynthesis. *Plant Cell* 22(2): 349-363.
- Eklund DM, Thelander M, Landberg K, Staldal V, Nilsson A, Johansson M, Valsecchi I, Pederson ER, Kowalczyk M, Ljung K, Ronne H, Sundberg E. 2010b. Homologues of the *Arabidopsis thaliana* SHI/STY/LRP1 genes control auxin biosynthesis and affect growth and development in the moss *Physcomitrella patens*. *Development* 137(8): 1275-1284.
- Ferrándiz C, Fourquin C, Prunet N, Scutt C, Sundberg E, Trehin C, Vialette-Guiraud A. 2010. Carpel Development. *Advances in Botanical Research* 55: 1-74.
- Ferrándiz C, Gu Q, Martienssen R, Yanofsky MF. 2000. Redundant regulation of meristem identity and plant architecture by FRUITFULL, APETALA1 and CAULIFLOWER. *Development* 127(4): 725-734.
- Fourquin C, Ferrandiz C. 2012. Functional analyses of AGAMOUS family members in *Nicotiana benthamiana* clarify the evolution of early and late roles of C-function genes in eudicots. *Plant J* 71(6): 990-1001.
- Fourquin C, Vinauger-Douard M, Chambrier P, Berne-Dedieu A, Scutt CP. 2007. Functional conservation between CRABS CLAW orthologues from widely diverged angiosperms. *Ann Bot (Lond)* 100(3): 651-657.
- Fourquin C, Vinauger-Douard M, Fogliani B, Dumas C, Scutt CP. 2005. Evidence that CRABS CLAW and TOUSLED have conserved their roles in carpel development since the ancestor of the extant angiosperms. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 102(12): 4649-4654.

- Gomez-Mena C, de Folter S, Costa MM, Angenent GC, Sablowski R. 2005. Transcriptional program controlled by the floral homeotic gene AGAMOUS during early organogenesis. *Development* 132(3): 429-438.
- Groth E, Tandre K, Engstrom P, Vergara-Silva F. 2011. AGAMOUS subfamily MADS-box genes and the evolution of seed cone morphology in Cupressaceae and Taxodiaceae. *Evol Dev* 13(2): 159-170.
- Heijmans K, Ament K, Rijpkema AS, Zethof J, Wolters-Arts M, Gerats T, Vandenbussche M. 2012. Redefining C and D in the petunia ABC. *Plant Cell* 24(6): 2305-2317.
- Hewitt Y. 1966. *Sand and Water Culture Methods used in the Study of Plant Nutrition*: Farnham: Commonwealth Agricultural Bureau.
- Hileman LC, Drea S, Martino G, Litt A, Irish VF. 2005. Virus-induced gene silencing is an effective tool for assaying gene function in the basal eudicot species *Papaver somniferum* (opium poppy). *Plant J* 44(2): 334-341.
- Ikeda M, Ohme-Takagi M. 2009. A novel group of transcriptional repressors in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell Physiol* 50(5): 970-975.
- Ishikawa M, Ohmori Y, Tanaka W, Hirabayashi C, Murai K, Ogihara Y, Yamaguchi T, Hirano HY. 2009. The spatial expression patterns of DROOPING LEAF orthologs suggest a conserved function in grasses. *Genes Genet Syst* 84(2): 137-146.
- Jager M, Hassanin A, Manuel M, Le Guyader H, Deutsch J. 2003. MADS-box genes in *Ginkgo biloba* and the evolution of the AGAMOUS family. *Mol Biol Evol* 20(5): 842-854.
- Kramer EM, Hodges SA. 2010. *Aquilegia* as a model system for the evolution and ecology of petals. *Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci* 365(1539): 477-490.

- Kuusk S, Sohlberg JJ, Long JA, Fridborg I, Sundberg E. 2002. STY1 and STY2 promote the formation of apical tissues during Arabidopsis gynoecium development. *Development* 129(20): 4707-4717.
- Kuusk S, Sohlberg JJ, Magnus Eklund D, Sundberg E. 2006. Functionally redundant SHI family genes regulate Arabidopsis gynoecium development in a dose-dependent manner. *Plant J* 47(1): 99-111.
- Landberg K, Pederson ER, Viaene T, Bozorg B, Friml J, Jonsson H, Thelander M, Sundberg E. 2013. The MOSS *Physcomitrella patens* reproductive organ development is highly organized, affected by the two SHI/STY genes and by the level of active auxin in the SHI/STY expression domain. *Plant Physiol* 162(3): 1406-1419.
- Larsson E, Franks RG, Sundberg E. 2013. Auxin and the Arabidopsis thaliana gynoecium. *J Exp Bot* 64(9): 2619-2627.
- Lee J-Y, Baum SF, Oh S-H, Jiang C-Z, Chen J-C, Bowman JL. 2005. Recruitment of CRABS CLAW to promote nectary development within the eudicot clade. *Development* 132(22): 5021-5032.
- Mandel, M.A., Bowman, J.L., Kempin, S.A., Ma, H., Meyerowitz, E.M. and Yanofsky, M.F. (1992) Manipulation of flower structure in transgenic tobacco. *Cell*, 71, 133-143.
- Mena M, Ambrose BA, Meeley RB, Briggs SP, Yanofsky MF, Schmidt RJ. 1996. Diversification of C-function activity in maize flower development. *Science* 274(5292): 1537-1540.
- Nemhauser J, Feldman L, Zambryski P. 2000. Auxin and ETTIN in Arabidopsis gynoecium morphogenesis. *Development* 127(18): 3877-3888.
- Orashakova S, Lange M, Lange S, Wege S, Becker A. 2009. The CRABS CLAW ortholog from California poppy (*Eschscholzia californica*, Papaveraceae), EcCRC, is involved

- in floral meristem termination, gynoecium differentiation and ovule initiation. *Plant J* 58(4): 682-693.
- Pabon-Mora N, Ambrose BA, Litt A. 2012. Poppy APETALA1/FRUITFULL orthologs control flowering time, branching, perianth identity, and fruit development. *Plant Physiol* 158(4): 1685-1704.
- Pan IL, McQuinn R, Giovannoni JJ, Irish VF. 2010. Functional diversification of AGAMOUS lineage genes in regulating tomato flower and fruit development. *J Exp Bot* 61(6): 1795-1806.
- Pnueli L, Hareven D, Rounsley SD, Yanofsky MF, Lifschitz E. 1994. Isolation of the tomato AGAMOUS gene TAG1 and analysis of its homeotic role in transgenic plants. *Plant Cell* 6(2): 163-173.
- Ratcliff F, Martin-Hernandez AM, Baulcombe DC. 2001. Technical Advance. Tobacco rattle virus as a vector for analysis of gene function by silencing. *Plant J* 25(2): 237-245.
- Reyes-Olalde JI, Zuniga-Mayo VM, Chavez Montes RA, Marsch-Martinez N, de Folter S. 2013. Inside the gynoecium: at the carpel margin. *Trends Plant Sci.* **18(11):644-55..**
- Romanel EAC, Schrago CG, Couñago RM, Russo CAM, Alves-Ferreira M. 2009. Evolution of the B3 DNA binding superfamily: new insights into REM family gene diversification. *PLoS One* 4(6): e5791.
- Rutledge R, Regan S, Nicolas O, Fobert P, Cote C, Bosnich W, Kauffeldt C, Sunohara G, Seguin A, Stewart D. 1998. Characterization of an AGAMOUS homologue from the conifer black spruce (*Picea mariana*) that produces floral homeotic conversions when expressed in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant J* 15(5): 625-634.
- Scutt CP, Vinauger-Douard M, Fourquin C, Finet C, Dumas C. 2006. An evolutionary perspective on the regulation of carpel development. *J Exp Bot* 57: 2143-2152.

- Sohlberg JJ, Myrenas M, Kuusk S, Lagercrantz U, Kowalczyk M, Sandberg G, Sundberg E. 2006. STY1 regulates auxin homeostasis and affects apical-basal patterning of the *Arabidopsis* gynoecium. *Plant J* 47(1): 112-123.
- Sundberg E, Østergaard L. 2009. Distinct and dynamic auxin activities during reproductive development. *Cold Spring Harb Perspect Biol* 1(6): a001628.
- Swaminathan K, Peterson K, Jack T. 2008. The plant B3 superfamily. *Trends Plant Sci* 13(12): 647-655.
- Trigueros M, Navarrete-Gómez M, Sato S, Christensen SK, Pelaz S, Weigel D, Yanofsky MF, Ferrándiz C. 2009. The NGATHA Genes Direct Style Development in the *Arabidopsis* Gynoecium. *Plant Cell* 21(5): 1394-1409.
- Wege S, Scholz A, Gleissberg S, Becker A. 2007. Highly Efficient Virus-induced Gene Silencing (VIGS) in California Poppy (*Eschscholzia californica*): An Evaluation of VIGS as a Strategy to Obtain Functional Data from Non-model Plants. *Ann Bot* 100(3): 641-649.
- Yamada T, Yokota Sy, Hirayama Y, Imaichi R, Kato M, Gasser CS. 2011. Ancestral expression patterns and evolutionary diversification of YABBY genes in angiosperms. *Plant J* 67(1): 26-36.
- Yamaguchi T, Nagasawa N, Kawasaki S, Matsuoka M, Nagato Y, Hirano HY. 2004. The YABBY gene DROOPING LEAF regulates carpel specification and midrib development in *Oryza sativa*. *Plant Cell* 16(2): 500-509.
- Yanofsky MF, Ma H, Bowman JL, Drews GN, Feldmann KA, Meyerowitz EM. 1990. The protein encoded by the *Arabidopsis* homeotic gene *agamous* resembles transcription factors. *Nature* 346(6279): 35-39.
- Yellina AL, Orashakova S, Lange S, Erdmann R, Leebens-Mack J, Becker A. 2010. Floral homeotic C function genes repress specific B function genes in the carpel whorl of the basal eudicot California poppy (*Eschscholzia californica*). *Evodevo* 1: 13.

- Yuo T, Yamashita Y, Kanamori H, Matsumoto T, Lundqvist U, Sato K, Ichii M, Jobling SA, Taketa S. 2012. A SHORT INTERNODES (SHI) family transcription factor gene regulates awn elongation and pistil morphology in barley. *J Exp Bot* 63(14): 5223-5232.
- Zhang P, Tan HT, Pwee KH, Kumar PP. 2004. Conservation of class C function of floral organ development during 300 million years of evolution from gymnosperms to angiosperms. *Plant J* 37(4): 566-577.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

Additional supporting information may be found in the online version of this article.

Fig. S1 *In situ* expression analyses of *NbNGAb* in *N. benthamiana*.

Fig. S2 Expression level by real-time PCR analysis of *EcNGA* and *NbNGAa* in different organs.

Fig. S3 Negative controls for *in situ* hybridizations (sense probes).

Fig. S4 Developmental series of *E. californica* pistils and flowers.

Table S1 Primers used in this work.

FIGURE LEGENDS

Figure 1: Amino acid alignment of the conserved domains in the NGA homologues from different species.

(a) B3 DNA binding domain, (b) NGA-I domain, (c) RAV repressive domain and (d) NGA-II domain. Amino acid sequences of *AqNGA* (*Aquilegia caerulea* NGA homologue) and *AmbNGA* (*Amborella trichopoda* NGA homologue) were deduced from the following EST sequences DR951353 and FD442133 respectively.

Figure 2 : *In situ* expression analyses of homologues of *NGA* in *Eschscholzia californica* and *Nicotiana benthamiana* flowers. Control hybridizations with sense probes are shown in Fig S3.

(a to e) Longitudinal sections of *E. californica* flowers probed with *EcNGA*. (a) At stage 3 *EcNGA* transcripts are detected in all flower organ primordia except in the developing sepals (S). (b) At stage 5, *EcNGA* accumulates in the apical part of developing organs in the three inner whorls (arrows) (c) At stage 6, *EcNGA* expression is still present at the top of the petals, stamens and carpels. In addition *EcNGA* transcripts begin to accumulate in the placental region of the carpel where the ovules will further develop (arrow). (d and e) At stage 7, *EcNGA* expression concentrates in the developing style (Sty) and in the ovules (Ov).

(f to j) Longitudinal sections of *N. benthamiana* flowers probed with *NbNGAa*. (f) At stage 2, *NbNGAa* is expressed in the floral meristem (FM) and more strongly at the tip of the developing sepals (S, arrows). (g) At stage 6, *NbNGAa* transcripts are detected at the apical region of each developing floral organ (arrows). (h) At the moment of style inception, *NbNGAa* expression accumulates in the apical gynoecium (arrow), in the placenta (P) and in the stamens (Stm). (i and j) In mature flowers, *NbNGAa* is strongly expressed in the inner part of the style (transmitting tract, TT) and in the developing ovules (Ov). Scale bar: 100 μm .

Figure 3. Phenotypes of *Eschscholzia californica* plants inoculated with pTRV2-*EcNGA*.

(a) Wild type pistil at anthesis, comprising a cylindrical ovary, a short style and four long yellow stigmatic protrusions. (b to h) *EcNGA*-VIGS pistils at anthesis displaying an alteration of their apical region development. (b) A weak phenotype characterized by the development

of a supplementary stigmatic protrusion (arrow). (c to f) Examples of intermediate phenotypes: (c) Modification of the distribution of the stigmatic tissue along the four protrusions, the green zones correspond to style tissue (arrows); (d and e) Presence of an increased number of stigmatic protrusions with irregular lengths; (f) EcNGA-VIGS pistil presenting an enlarged and opened style with a great reduction of stigmatic tissue (f). (g and h) Strong phenotypes: total lack of stigmatic tissue. (i to n) Scanning electron microscope pictures of apical regions of pistils at anthesis. (i) Wild-type stigmatic protrusions entirely covered by papillae cells. (j) Tip of a wildtype stigmatic protrusion fully covered by the typical globular stigmatic cells. (k) EcNGA-VIGS pistil displaying an intermediate phenotype with the presence of several stigmatic protrusions of different shape and size partially covered by the papillae cells. (l) Tip of a stigmatic protrusion from a EcNGA-VIGS pistil displaying an intermediate phenotype revealing the absence of stigmatic tissue. (m and n) Two examples of EcNGA-VIGS pistil with strong phenotypes, note the total lack of stigmatic protrusions and of papillae cells. (o) Expression level by real-time PCR analysis of *EcNGA* in TRV2-EcNGA flowers. The error bars depict the s.e. based on two biological replicates. (***) indicates significantly different ($P < 0.005$) from WT control according to a t-test . Scale bar: 500 μm ; except in (j) and (l) scale bar: 100 μm .

Figure 4: Phenotypic characterization of *Eschscholzia californica* pistils from plants inoculated with pTRV2-EcNGA.

(a to g) Consecutive sections of *E. californica* wild-type pistil at anthesis. (a to f) Transversal sections from the stigmatic protrusions to the ovary. (g) Longitudinal sections of the whole wild-type pistil. Note the presence of the four stigmatic protrusions with stigmatic papillae developing adaxially (arrow) (a and b), of a dense transmitting tract inside the style (c, d and g) which continues inside the ovary (e, f and g). (h to n) Consecutive sections of EcNGA-

VIGS pistils at anthesis. (h-m) Transversal sections of an EcNGA-VIGS pistil displaying an intermediate phenotype. Note the disorganization of the stigmatic tissue (arrow) (h and i) and the greatly reduced transmitting tract present inside the style and leaving an opened canal (j and k); the ovary shows a similar structure to the wild-type (l and m). (n) Longitudinal section of an EcNGA-VIGS with a weak phenotype and showing the limited amount of transmitting tract developing inside the style. (o to q) Observation of the vasculature in cleared whole mount pistils. (o and p) In the wild-type pistil the vasculature strands run as parallel veins along the stigmatic protrusions, (p) note the closer view of a protrusion final tip. (q) Three EcNGA-VIGS pistils with intermediate phenotypes displaying abnormal bifurcations of the veins at the distal end of the apical lobes (arrows). Scale bar: 500 μ m.

Figure 5 : Phenotypes of *Nicotiana benthamiana* plants inoculated with pTRV2-NbNGAa, pTRV2-NbNGAb, or pTRV2-NbNGAa-NbNGAb.

(a-d) Top view of *N. benthamiana* flowers. (a) Wild-type flower at anthesis, note the five expanded white petals and the central stigma (arrow) surrounded by the five stamens. (b) NbNGAa-VIGS flower. Note the absence of stigma in the centre. (c) NbNGAb-VIGS flower with reduced petals and no stigma visible. (d) NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS flower displaying abnormal sepals and greenish not fully developed petals. (e to i) Gynoecium of *N. benthamiana* flowers. (e) Wild-type gynoecium characterized by an ovoid ovary, a long style and a flat stigma. (f) NbNGAa-VIGS pistil presenting a reduced style and a bended stigma. (g) Close-up of the wild-type ovary and beginning of the style. (h) NbNGAb-VIGS gynoecia presenting a short style not fully fused and an abnormal opened stigma. (i) Examples of NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS gynoecia with extremely reduced styles and deformed stigmas. (j to l) *N. benthamiana* stigma. (j) Top view of a wild-type stigma: symmetrical, circular and flat. (k) Top view of an asymmetric and not fully fused NbNGAa-VIGS stigma. (l) Lateral view of a

NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS stigma showing an opened and highly deformed structure. (m and n) Top view of *N. benthamiana* sepals. (m) wild-type sepals. (n) NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS very serrated sepals. (o) Expression level by real-time PCR analysis of *NbNGAa* and *NbNGAb* in TRV2-NbNGAa, TRV2-NbNGAb or TRV2-NbNGAa-NbNGAb flowers. The error bars depict the s.e. based on two biological replicates. (*) indicates significantly different ($P < 0.05$) and (***) significantly different ($P < 0.005$) from WT control according to a t-test. Scale bar: 500 μm .

Figure 6: Phenotypic characterization of *Nicotiana benthamiana* pistils from NbNGA-VIGS inoculated plants.

(a and b) Apical part of the *N. benthamiana* wild-type pistil: (a) Stigma and style longitudinal section, (b) Style transversal section. Note the presence of a transmitting tract tissue filling the wild-type style and stigma (arrow). (c and d) Apical part of an NbNGAa-VIGS pistil: (c) Stigma and style longitudinal section, (d) Style transversal section. Note the presence of an opened canal in the NbNGAa-VIGS style and the greatly altered transmitting tract (arrow). (e) Longitudinal section of the apical part of an NbNGAb-VIGS gynoecium revealing the absence of transmitting tract in the unfused style (f-g) Transversal sections of the apical region of an NbNGAa-NbNGAb-VIGS gynoecium displaying highly modified style tissue with a total lack of transmitting tract development. (h-k) Vascular patterning in *N. benthamiana* style and stigma (h) In the wild-type pistil the stylar veins reach the apical stigma (arrow). (i and j) In NbNGAa-VIGS (i) or NbNGAb-VIGS pistil (j) the stylar veins terminate below the stigma (arrows). Scale bar: (e, h-k) 500 μm , (a-d, f and g) 100 μm . (k) Expression level of *NbYUC6* gene by quantitative PCR in wild-type and NbNGAa-NGAb-VIGS style tissue. For each biological replicate, style-stigma tissue was excised from more than 50 anthesis flowers from different wild-type or VIGS-treated plants. The error bars depict the s.e. based

on two biological replicates. Asterisk (*) indicates significantly different ($P < 0.05$) from WT control according to a t-test .

TABLES

Table 1. Summary of the VIGS experiments on *Nicotiana benthamiana* and *Eschscholzia californica* plants

VIGS construct	N° plants inoculated (dead)	N° plants with phenotype	N° flowers/ plant observed	N° flowers/ plant with phenotype	N° total flowers with phenotype	% flowers with phenotype
<i>N. benthamiana</i>						
TRV2-NbNGAa	12 (2)	10	20	9-14	126/200	63%
TRV2-NbNGAb	12 (1)	11	20	11-17	162/220	74%
TRV2-NbNGAab	12 (1)	11	20	14-19	182/220	83%
Empty vector	6 (1)	0	20	0	0/100	0%
<i>E. californica</i>						
TRV2-EcNGA	120 (34)	23	3	0-3	46/258	18%
TRV2-EcPDS	60 (18)	12	-	-	-	-
Empty vector	60 (16)	0	2	0	0/88	0%









